



TOWN OF PARADISE

5555 SKYWAY • PARADISE, CALIFORNIA 95969-4931

TELEPHONE (530) 872-6291 FAX (530) 877-5059

www.townofparadise.com

P L A N N I N G C O M M I S S I O N A G E N D A

May 15, 2012

6:00 PM

CALL TO ORDER

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

ROLL CALL

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1a. Approve minutes from the Regular Planning Commission meeting of April 17, 2012.

2. COMMUNICATION

3. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION

Comments are limited to a maximum of five minutes duration. If more time is needed, please request staff to place the subject on an agenda for a future Commission meeting.

***** PUBLIC HEARING PROCEDURE *****

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| A. Staff comments | C. Close hearing to the public |
| B. Open the hearing to the public | D. Commission discussion |
| 1. Project applicant | E. Motion |
| 2. Parties for the project | F. Vote |
| 3. Parties against the project | |
| 4. Rebuttals | |

NOTE: Pursuant to Planning Commission Resolution No. 96-001, any person may speak before the Commission regarding the matter under consideration for **a maximum of five minutes** unless granted additional time by the Chair. "In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need a special accommodation to participate, please contact the Community Development Dept., at 872-6291 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting."

4. CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING - None

5. PUBLIC HEARING – None

6. OTHER BUSINESS

6a. Acceptance and referral of the Planning Commission Annual Report for calendar year 2011 to the Town Council regarding the present implementation status of the 1994 Paradise General Plan.

6b. Acceptance and referral of the 1994 General Plan Housing Element Annual Progress Report for calendar year 2011 to the Town Council.

7. COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES

8. COMMISSION MEMBERS

9. ADJOURNMENT

PARADISE PLANNING COMMISSION

April 17, 2012 - 6:00 p.m.

**Paradise Town Council Chambers
5555 Skyway, Paradise, CA**

M I N U T E S

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chair Grossberger at 6:03 p.m.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

ROLL CALL

Present at roll call were Commissioners Bolin, Jones, Zuccolillo and Chair Grossberger. Commissioner Woodhouse was not present. Community Development Director Craig Baker and Assistant Planner Susan Hartman were also present.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a. Regular Meeting of February 21, 2012.

It was moved by Commissioner Zuccolillo, seconded by Commissioner Bolin to approve the minutes of the February 21, 2012 Planning Commission meeting as submitted by staff.

VOTE: AYES: Commissioners Bolin, Jones, Zuccolillo and Chair Grossberger.
NOES: None. ABSTAIN: None. ABSENT: Woodhouse.

MOTION CARRIES.

2. COMMUNICATION

a. Recent Council Actions

Mr. Baker reported on Town Council actions of the March 6th where Town Council approved the updated Master Bicycle and Pedestrian Plan and on April 3rd Town Council adopted a resolution approving submission of a Caltrans Bicycle Transportation Account (BTA) Grant Application and approved advertising for recruitment of two upcoming Planning Commissioners vacancies with terms expiring June 30, 2012. Council Member

b. Staff Comments

None.

3. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION

1. Jon Remalia stated that he thinks the Paradise Irrigation District (PID) capacity fees are too high, that it directly impacts development in the community. He stated that PID charges large fees and has not spent the money collected for the hook-up fees, and suggested that a representative from the Planning Commission be assigned to attend PID meetings. Mr. Remalia also stated that he was inadvertently given the incorrect application for the Planning Commission vacancies, but it has since been resolved and also suggested that there should be continuity in the roadways and that bike paths will reduce the overall width of the roadways.

Mr. Baker stated that any appointment to another entity/board should be directed from the Town Council and that studies show that narrowing roadways creates a calming effect on traffic.

4. **CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING – None.**
5. **PUBLIC HEARING – None.**
6. **OTHER BUSINESS**

6a. Discussion regarding the content of the current Procedural Rules of Conduct of Planning Commission Meetings; and, (1) Consider rescinding Planning Commission Resolution No. 96-001; and, (2) Adopting Planning Commission Resolution No. 12-01, resulting in change(s) to the current Procedural Rules; or, (3) adopt an alternative motion.

Chair Grossberger requested the item be removed from the agenda and postponed to the next meeting so that Commissioner Woodhouse could be in attendance. There was no concurrence on this request.

Mr. Baker explained that the Procedural Rules of Conduct for the Planning Commission had not been reviewed since 1996 and that at the February 21, 2012 Planning Commission meeting Planning Commissioners voted 3 to 2 to review the Procedural Rules of Conduct and considered reducing the presentation time for speakers from five minutes to three minutes. Mr. Baker also stated that there was an error found on the document after it had been distributed, which is now corrected. Mr. Baker stated that Resolution No. 12-01 has been prepared for Planning Commissioner's consideration and if the proposed resolution is not adopted that Resolution No. 96-001 will remain in effect.

Mr. Baker stated that the Town Council could give direction for the Planning Commissioners to reverse a resolution/decision and that the 3 minute time limit is already in the Town Councils Conduct of Council.

1. Loren Harvey stated that it took Mr. Baker 4 ½ minutes to explain one word being wrong and that he did not think it was appropriate to limit public comment to 3 minutes, that he thinks the Planning Commission should allow everyone the opportunity to speak.
2. Jon Remalia stated that the previous discussion took 9 minutes and that the Commissioners should take the time to listen and if they are not able to then maybe they are too busy for the position.

Commissioner Grossberger shared that in his research, many, if not most other Agencies' Planning Commissions only allow for 3 min 4 of discussion and that even if the rules were

changed to three (3) minutes the Planning Commission has the ability to allow for longer discussion. She also stated that the email she sent to staff was intentionally not cc'd or sent to any other Commissioners so as not to violate the Brown Act.

Commissioner Jones stated that the email that was circulated had some very good points and that she did vote for this issue last time but would not be voting for this resolution because she didn't think it was necessary and it was sending the wrong message.

Motion by Zuccolillo, seconded by Bolin to approve rescinding Planning Commission Resolution No. 96-001 and adopt Planning Commission Resolution No. 12-01 resulting in changes to the current Procedural Rules specifically changing "Item J. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION – from five (5) minutes to three (3) minutes."

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES:	Chair Grossberger
NOES:	Commissioners Bolin, Jones and Zuccolillo
ABSTAIN:	None
ABSENT:	Commissioner Woodhouse

MOTION FAILED

- 6b.** Discussion regarding the upcoming 2012 Business Conference and the possible future roll of the Planning Commission with regard to land use decisions and promoting economic development in Paradise. (Zuccolillo).

Mr. Baker stated that the agenda item was suggested by Commissioner Zuccolillo, that he developed the wording for the agenda and that the flyer for the May 10th Business conference was attached.

Commissioner Zuccolillo posed the question about what could be done, as Planning Commissioners, to make Paradise more business friendly, understanding that the economy is currently challenging, but that there has been very little development. After discussion with businesses some of the obstacles that have been raised are: sign issues/ordinances, faster response to questions, septic issues and equal enforcement. He wanted to bring to the attention of the Commissioners ways to ask the business community how they, as Planning Commissioners, could assist with their business and development, by possibly holding a roundtable discussion.

Chair Grossberger asked for direction from staff as far as the legal/ethical limits within the powers of the Planning Commission.

Mr. Baker stated that the Planning Commission is responsible for Zoning Code and the Subdivision Ordinances and that any other significant direction should come from the Town Council, but that there is a component in the 1994 General Plan that deals with Economic Development. Planning Commissioners should be familiar with the policies within that component.

Mr. Baker stated that the Town Manager will make a presentation at the Business Conference and will propose a business roundtable that, once established, the Planning Commission may be

able to participate in. There is currently a business survey on the Town of Paradise website, the results of which will be discussed at the Business Conference.

1. Jon Remalia stated that in his opinion one of the biggest impairments to development is the time it takes and the money involved in the development process, speeding up the process would be helpful. He stated that regarding the Website survey there was no construction trade listed on it. He also thought that it might be beneficial for Planning Commissioners to have office hours prior to the Planning Commission meeting so citizens do not have to speak at an official meeting, but could have individual interaction; He thinks that people are leaving town, we need to bring them here and keep the ones we already have. He also thinks there needs to be a smaller meeting of 4-6 people, then the larger group at the business forum, for individuals to brainstorm and get things done.
2. Loren Harvey thinks that the community needs to be business friendly, that the lack of parking has and continues to be an issue for businesses and that the Town makes it difficult to have a sign put up and should think about parking grants to eliminate old buildings and use that area for parking. He does not think that a bike path that reduces the street size is business friendly and does not communicate a business friendly attitude.

Mr. Baker stated that grant funding for parking areas are pursued whenever available, but that grant funding is for specific types of projects and most often cannot be used for other types of projects.

3. Fred Aldred stated that the Planning Commission is restricted by the Brown Act, but that they could act individually by visiting businesses in Paradise and asking for input about what could make it more business friendly and then take the information to the business forum in May.

Mr. Baker agreed and suggested visiting new businesses in town, making introductions and if questions, solutions or problems arise, then taking the opportunity to make notes and bring them back to Town staff for possible resolution.

Chair Grossberger stated that after taking ethics training every two years that she finds it difficult to frequent stores, dialogue and inform them of her position on the Planning Commission, which could then make them feel like they are being watched; and, that it's a fine line if they welcome the discussion or if they appreciate that someone is looking in on them. That they, as Planning Commissioners, are given specific tasks but should be careful to not appear to be giving support, or not, to specific individual/business.

Commissioner Bolin stated that it is difficult for citizens to speak at the podium and that coming early, being accessible is a good idea and changes the culture of the Town, business/people need to feel welcome, suggested assigning a Planning Commissioner or Town Council Member to a new business in town; he also stated that the counter is still intimidating and challenging to individuals who are unfamiliar with the process and discussed how it can be made easier.

Mr. Baker stated that the Town has a Business Assistance Team (BAT) that will meet, for no charge, with anyone who is considering opening a business. Mr. Baker shared that the staff considers themselves are stewards, are here to help and are disappointed when someone walks away unhappy or frustrated.

Commissioner Zuccolillo shared some ideas that included talking with businesses, making themselves available to find out what the business needs are, discovering weaknesses within the Town and working with Town Council to keep them informed about what the Planning Commissioners are doing. He also suggested that if there are rules that cannot be uniformly enforced, then they should potentially be removed and/or changed and wants to try to help keep the businesses and revenue in Paradise.

Chair Grossberger suggested, since there will be a change in the Planning Commission, that after the new commission is seated, there be a half day training either by staff or a volunteer planner on the role and expectations of the Planning Commission and that this meeting could potentially be open to the public as a way of information/education.

There was consensus with the Planning Commissioners to continue with outreach to the public and after the business conference and the beginning of the fiscal year to look into having a business round table discussion.

7. COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES - None

8. COMMISSION MEMBERS

a. Identification of future agenda items (All Commissioners/Staff)

Mr. Baker stated that in May he would be bringing the General Plan Implementation Status Report and Housing Element Implementation Status Report to the Planning Commission for review prior to forwarding to the Town Council.

Mr. Baker stated that Walmart has been sent the wastewater report and that they are still working on the wastewater issue for the project

9. ADJOURNMENT

The Planning Commission meeting was adjourned at 7:47 p.m.

Date Approved:

April Grossberger, Chair

Attest:

Dina Volenski, Assistant Town Clerk

MEMORANDUM

TO: Paradise Planning Commission **AGENDA NO. 6 (a)**

FROM: Craig Baker, Community Development Director

SUBJECT: Preparation of an Annual Report to the Town Council Regarding Present Status of the 1994 Paradise General Plan and Progress Toward its Implementation (2011 Calendar Year).

DATE: May 9, 2012

BACKGROUND: California Government Code Section 65400 requires a local planning agency (i.e. Paradise Planning Commission and staff) to annually review and provide a report to the local legislative body (Paradise Town Council) regarding progress toward the implementation of its general plan. The wording of Government Code Section 65400 is as follows:

Provide an annual report to the legislative body on the status of the plan and progress in its implementation, including the progress in meeting its share of regional housing needs determined pursuant to Section 65584 and local efforts to remove governmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement and development of housing...

Since the 1994 Paradise General Plan was adopted, staff has developed and the Planning Commission has forwarded to the Town Council eight annual reports detailing our progress toward implementation of the plan. These previously-generated reports were the result of substantial work effort on the part of staff and Planning Commission members and have served as the format foundation for the proposed 2010 **Implementation Status Report of the 1994 Paradise General Plan** attached to this memorandum for your consideration.

The format of the attached report is based upon and linked to the contents of the previous annual reports. Planning Commissioners should focus their attention on the implementation status of all policies and implementation measures currently established within the 1994 Paradise General Plan and its subsequently-adopted amendments. In addition, the report is formatted in a manner that is directly linked with the **Volume I - Policy Document of the 1994 Paradise General Plan** by specific listing of individual general plan policies, implementation measures and their respective Volume I - Policy Document page number. Updated comments regarding the past year's progress toward implementation of individual policy statements and implementation measures are shaded and bolded **thus**.

In order for the proposed report to be meaningful, you will need to refer to your personal copy of the 1994 Paradise General Plan (Volume I - Policy Document) for the actual text of individual general plan policies and implementation measures. Alternatively, you may you may access the policy document via the Town's website (townofparadise.com).

Each Planning Commissioner should study this material and be prepared to publicly dialogue with staff and the attending public regarding the present status of these items and any progress (or lack thereof) in their implementation.

It should be noted that, over the course of the past several years, staff has accumulated a short list of various inaccuracies, outdated references and awkward policy wording contained within the 1994 Paradise General Plan that, while relatively minor, probably warrant our attention and consideration for correction in the future.

COMMISSION ACTION REQUESTED: Be prepared to publicly discuss this matter and to provide direction via an adopted motion to staff regarding any specific recommendations to be forwarded to the Town Council to facilitate additional and/or further implementation of the 1994 Paradise General Plan.

Attachment

j:\cdd\planning\...GP-imp-11.rpt

CALENDAR YEAR 2011
1994 PARADISE GENERAL PLAN
IMPLEMENTATION STATUS REPORT

Presented by
Paradise Planning Commission

June, 2012

REPORT OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

1994 PARADISE GENERAL PLAN IMPLEMENTATION STATUS REPORT

FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2011

LAND USE ELEMENT:

GROWTH AND LAND USE DEVELOPMENT:

Policy/ Implementation Measure	Text Page	Implementation Status
LUP-1	(6-3)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-2	(6-3)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-3 (6-3)		Implementation ongoing as opportunity so afforded.
LUP-4	(6-3)	Not yet implemented. Private work effort was initiated in 2006 for a portion of the secondary planning area south of town limits, but has slowed due to funding and staffing shortages. New Butte County General Plan adopted October 2010 includes directive to develop a specific plan for a portion of this area, for which the Town will provide input.
LUP-5	(6-3)	Implemented.
LUP-6	(6-3)	Ongoing directive that will be implemented as opportunities arise. (Note: Reference to Lime Saddle Community Services District is outdated.)
LUP-7	(6-3)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-8	(6-3)	Required by law; implemented and ongoing.
LUP-9	(6-3)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-10	(6-3)	Ongoing directive; implemented as opportunities arise.
LUP-11	(6-3)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUI-1	(6-4)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUI-2	(6-4)	Not implemented. See LUP-4, above.
LUI-3	(6-4)	Largely implemented via Town adoption of the 2010 California Green Building Standards Code.
LUI-4	(6-4)	Fully implemented (1997).

PUBLIC SERVICES AND INFRASTRUCTURE:

LUP-12; 13; 14	(6-4)	Implemented via planning process reforms; an ongoing directive.
LUP-15	(6-5)	Implemented and an ongoing directive.
LUP-16	(6-5)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-17	(6-5)	Partially implemented and ongoing as opportunities arise.
LUP-18	(6-5)	The last joint Town Council/P.I.D. meeting was held on May 30, 2006.
LUP-19	(6-5)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-20	(6-5)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-21	(6-5)	Partially implemented, ongoing as needed.
LUP-22	(6-5)	Partially implemented via the Town's development impact fee program.
LUP-23	(6-5)	Implemented and an ongoing directive.
LUP-24	(6-5)	The development of feasibility studies has been tabled by the Town Council pending adequate funding and other factors.
LUP-25	(6-5)	Fully implemented.
LUP-26	(6-6)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUI-5	(6-6)	Implemented. The Town successfully developed and adopted a 5 year capital improvements program in the summer of 2011.
LUI-6 thru 13	(6-6)	Partially implemented and ongoing.

LAND USE DISTRIBUTION AND LOCATION

LUP-27; LUP-28	(6-7)	Implemented via Town Council adoption of Town Resolution No. 01-37 in November, 2001.
LUP-29	(6-7)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-30	(6-7)	Ongoing Directive. A number of pedestrian, park, signal and other infrastructure improvement projects completed within downtown and former RDA areas in recent years. Construction of an additional Park & Ride facility was completed in 2011.
LUP-31	(6-7)	Partially implemented and ongoing as opportunities arise.
LUP-32	(6-7)	Ongoing directive.
LUP-33; 34; 35	(6-8)	Ongoing directive.
LUP-36	(6-8)	Town efforts to acquire/develop additional business or industrial park property continue as opportunities arise.
LUP-37; 38	(6-8)	Implemented.
LUP-39	(6-8)	Ongoing directive and implemented.
LUP-40; 41	(6-8)	Ongoing directive.
LUP-42; 43; 44	(6-8)	Implemented.

LUI-14; 15; 16	(6-8)	Implemented.
LUI-17	(6-8)	Implemented. See comment for LUI-5.
LUI-18	(6-8)	Largely implemented via adoption of town-wide design standards in March, 2010.

LAND USE DENSITIES

LUP-45	(6-9)	Ongoing directive.
LUP-46	(6-9)	Partially implemented and ongoing.
LUP-47	(6-9)	Ongoing implementation.
LUP-48	(6-9)	Partially implemented and ongoing.
LUP-49	(6-9)	Ongoing directive, implemented as opportunities are afforded.
LUP-50	(6-9)	Ongoing directive and partially implemented.
LUI-19	(6-9)	Implemented and ongoing directive.
LUI-20	(6-9)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUI-21	(6-9)	Implemented.
LUI-22	(6-9)	Implemented and ongoing.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT/REDEVELOPMENT

LUP-51	(6-10)	Partially implemented; target industry study completed. Additional implementation as new opportunities arise.
LUP-52	(6-10)	Ongoing directive, however, dissolution of RDAs has eliminated a primary funding source for the façade renovation program, which targets reuse of existing buildings.
LUP-53, 54	(6-11)	Implemented. Town-wide Design Standards are adopted. Various PMC sign regulation changes adopted in 2010 have assisted as well.
LUP-55	(6-11)	Implemented and ongoing.
LUP-56	(6-11)	Ongoing directive; implemented.
LUP-57	(6-11)	Chamber of Commerce and the Paradise Art Association continue to sponsor cultural events.
LUP-58	(6-11)	Ongoing directive; partially implemented.
LUP-59	(6-11)	Ongoing directive.
LUP-60	(6-11)	Implemented via PMC zoning code text amendments and adoption of design standards in 2010.
LUP-61	(6-11)	Ongoing directive.
LUP-62; 63	(6-11)	Ongoing and partially implemented.

LUP-64	(6-11) This directive is implemented via Town's zoning regulations.
LUP-65	(6-11) Ongoing directive.
LUP-66	(6-11) Plan is adopted and implementation is promoted via 2010 adoption of Design Standards.
LUP-67	(6-12) Partially implemented. See LUP-51.
LUI-23	(6-12) Functionally Implemented. "Main Street" concepts/components are incorporated within the adopted Downtown Revitalization Plan and the 2010 Design Standards.
LUI-24; 25	(6-12) Ongoing implementation.
LUI-26	(6-12) Implemented.
LUI-27	(6-12) Implemented.
LUI-28;29	(6-12) Same comment as LUI-26.
LUI-30	(6-12) Implemented via adoption of scenic highway corridor zoning regulations and 2010 adoption of Design Standards specific to gateway areas.
LUI-31	(6-12) Partially implemented as opportunities arise.
LUI-32	(6-12) Partially implemented; private efforts have assisted.
LUI-33	(6-12) Ongoing directive and implemented.
LUI-34	(6-12) Implemented.
LUI-35	(6-12) Implementation ongoing.
LUI-36	(6-12) Ongoing directive as part of the Downtown Revitalization Master Plan.
LUI-37	(6-12) Implemented and ongoing as funds permit.
LUI-38	(6-12) Partially implemented (see LUI-37).
LUI-39	(6-13) Ongoing directive.

INTERGOVERNMENTAL COORDINATION

LUP-68; 69; 70; 71	(6-13) Ongoing and partially implemented as opportunities are afforded.
LUI-40; 41; 42	(6-13) Ongoing and partially implemented as opportunities are afforded.

LAND USE CONTROLS

LUP-72	(6-14) Ongoing directive.
LUP-73	(6-14) Implemented and ongoing as opportunities are afforded.
LUP-74	(6-14) Partially implemented. Economic conditions affecting General Fund revenues have resulted in a reduction in Code Enforcement staff.

LUP-75	(6-14) Ongoing and implemented.
LUP-76	(6-14) Implemented.
LUI-43; 44	(6-14) Implemented and ongoing.
LUI-45	(6-14) Implemented and ongoing.

TERTIARY PLANNING AREA

LUP-77; 78; 79	(6-15) Partially implemented and ongoing directive.
LUP-80; 81; 82	(6-15) Partially implemented and ongoing as opportunities are afforded.
LUI-46; 47	(6-15) Implemented and ongoing. Town staff provided input for the new Butte County General Plan adopted October, 2010.
LUI-48; 49	(6-15) Partially implemented.

CIRCULATION ELEMENT:

CP-1	(6-18) Partially implemented and ongoing.
CP-2	(6-18) Circulation problems have been formally prioritized for elimination as funding permits via BCAG adoption of Regional Transportation Plan.
CP-3	(6-18) Ongoing directive and implemented.
CP-4	(6-19) Ongoing and implemented on case by case basis.
CP-5	(6-19) Partially implemented and ongoing. Butte County collects development impact fees for upper ridge development, a portion of which is earmarked for Paradise portions of Skyway and Clark Roads.
CP-6	(6-19) Ongoing directive with little progress due to limited opportunities, constraints.
CP-7	(6-19) Not implemented due to existing spatial distribution of signaled intersections, resource limitations, etc.
CP-8	(6-19) Implemented and ongoing.
CP-9	(6-19) Ongoing, partially implemented and in process.
CP-10	(6-19) Ongoing directive. Pearson, Foster Roads sidewalk improvements completed. Additional Pearson Road improvements/signalization at Recreation Drive are scheduled for Summer Of 2012.
CP-11	(6-19) Ongoing directive; partially implemented. A Master Bicycle Plan is adopted and current through March, 2017. A BTA grant funding application has been recently filed by the Town with Caltrans and has been accepted as complete for processing.
CP-12	(6-19) Implemented. Butte County and the Town have adopted

	compatible road standards for the Town's Sphere of Influence.
CP-13	(6-19) Partially implemented and ongoing.
CP-14	(6-19) Ongoing directive; partially implemented via Paradise Express service.
CP-15	(6-19) Consolidation of County-wide transit services has helped promote implementation.
CP-16	(6-19) Ongoing directive implemented as opportunities arise. Construction of an additional Park & Ride facility in the Central Commercial area was completed in 2011.
CP-17	(6-19) Ongoing and partially implemented.
CP-18	(6-20) Ongoing and partially implemented.
CP-19	(6-20) The component regarding children has not been implemented due to lack of available funding.
CP-20	(6-20) Not being implemented due to lack of resources and staff.
CI-1	(6-20) Ongoing directive.
CI-2	(6-20) Not being implemented due to lack of resources, staff and opportunities.
CI-3	(6-20) Implemented and ongoing.
CI-4; 5; 6	(6-20) Ongoing and partially implemented.
CI-7	(6-20) Ongoing directive; partially implemented by covenant agreements.
CI-8	(6-20) Ongoing implementation continuing via various small scale public infrastructure projects.
CI-9	(6-20) Ongoing directive.
CI-10	(6-21) Ongoing implementation as funds permit.
CI-11	(6-21) Refer to comment for CP-5.

HOUSING ELEMENT:

NOTE: A separate report detailing implementation of the Town of Paradise Housing Element is attached to this report. The format and contents of the Housing Element report is dictated by the California Department of Housing and Urban Development and is therefore generated as a stand-alone, but related document.

NOISE ELEMENT:

NP-1 thru NP-7	(6-33) Ongoing implementation as needed.
NP-8	(6-33) Ongoing directive.
NP-9	(6-33) Ongoing implementation in accordance with noise

	regulations of Paradise Municipal Code.
NP-10	(6-34) Ongoing implementation as needed.
NI-1; 2	(6-34) Ongoing implementation as needed.
NI-3	(6-34) Implemented and ongoing.
NI-4; 5	(6-34) Ongoing implementation as required.
NI-6	(6-34) Implemented and ongoing.
NI-7	(6-34) Implemented.

SAFETY ELEMENT:

SP-1	(6-41) Ongoing implementation as needed.
SP-2	(6-42) Ongoing implementation as needed.
SP-3	(6-42) Implemented and ongoing.
SP-4	(6-42) Ongoing implementation at staff level. See note for LUP-6.
SP-5; 6; 7	(6-42) Implemented and ongoing.
SP-8	(6-42) Ongoing directive.
SP-9	(6-42) Implemented and ongoing.
SP-10; 11; 12	(6-42) Implemented and ongoing.
SP-13	(6-42) Ongoing implementation as needed.
SP-14	(6-42) Ongoing implementation via regulatory efforts of the Town's Onsite Sanitation Division, the County Dept. of Public Health Services and RWQCB.
SP-15; 16; 17	(6-43) Ongoing implementation as needed.
SI-1	(6-43) Implemented and ongoing.
SI-2	(6-43) Ongoing directive.
SI-3	(6-43) Implemented and ongoing.
SI-4	(6-43) Not implemented at this time due to legal (Prop.218) constraints.
SI-5; 6; 7	(6-43) Implemented and ongoing.
SI-8	(6-43) Ongoing and partially implemented.
SI-9	(6-43) Ongoing as opportunities arise and funding sources become available.
SI-10	(6-43) Implemented.
SI-11	(6-43) Ongoing implementation as needed.
SP-18; 19	(6-45) Functionally implemented and ongoing as a result of establishment and successful operation of the Town's HHW facility.
SP-20; 21; 22	(6-45) Ongoing. See County Hazardous Waste Management Plan.
SP-23; 24	(6-45) Implemented.

SI-12 thru SI-19	(6-46) Ongoing implementation as needed.
SI-20; 21; 22	(6-46) Ongoing and implemented.

OPEN SPACE/CONSERVATION ELEMENT:

OCEP-1	(6-49) Implemented.
OCEP-2; 3; 4	(6-49) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-5; 6	(6-49) Ongoing implementation as needed.
OCEI-1	(6-50) Implemented via Town adoption of scenic highway land use regulations.
OCEI-2	(6-50) Implemented as needed.
OCEI-3	(6-50) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-7	(6-51) Partially implemented, ongoing directive.
OCEP-8	(6-51) Ongoing and partially implemented as needed; Memorial Trailway extension completed in 2010 indicates progress.
OCEP-9	(6-51) Implemented. Butte County has completed the first phase of significant public access improvements for Lookout Point.
OCEP-10	(6-51) Partially implemented and ongoing via Paradise Memorial Trailway Plan.
OCEP-11	(6-51) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-12	(6-51) Ongoing directive.
OCEI-4;	(6-51) The PRPD adopted a revised and updated 15 year District Master Plan during 2010 that will assist in implementation of this directive.
OCEI-5	(6-51) Implemented and ongoing. Recent Terry Ashe Recreation Center facilities improvements has assisted and additional improvements are planned, including the PCV project, etc.
OCEI-6	(6-51) Not implemented due to lack of resources, necessity and direction.
OCEI-7	(6-51) Partially implemented as an ongoing directive.
OCEP-13	(6-52) Ongoing directive.
OCEP-14; 15; 16	(6-52) Partially implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-17	(6-52) Ongoing directive.
OCEP-18; 19; 20; 21	(6-53) Ongoing and partially implemented.
OCEP-22	(6-53) Partially implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-23	(6-53) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-24; 25	(6-53) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-26	(6-53) Partially implemented and ongoing via case by case analysis.
OCEP-27	(6-53) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-28	(6-53) Partially implemented and ongoing. Adoption of 2010 California Green Building Standards Code has assisted.

OCEP-29	(6-53) Ongoing directive.
OCEP-30	(6-53) Partially implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-31	(6-53) Ongoing partial implementation.
OCEP-32	(6-53) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-33	(6-54) Implemented.
OCEP-34; 35	(6-54) Implemented/ongoing via execution of a solid waste franchise agreement with NRWS.
OCEP-36	(6-54) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEI-8	(6-54) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEI-9	(6-54) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEI-10	(6-54) Implemented and ongoing via RWQCB and the Town's Wastewater Management District.
OCEI-11	(6-54) Partially implemented and ongoing as opportunity affords itself.
OCEI-12	(6-54) Largely implemented via tree ordinance regulations.
OCEI-13	(6-54) Ongoing directive.
OCEI-14	(6-54) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEI-15	(6-54) Partially implemented and ongoing.
OCEI-16	(6-54) Not implemented; lack of funding.
OCEI-17	(6-54) Not implemented; lack of local opportunities.
OCEI-18	(6-55) Implemented and ongoing directive.
OCEI-19; 20	(6-55) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEI-21; 22; 23; 24	(6-55) Implemented and ongoing. See comments for OCEP-34; 35 and SP-18; 19.
OCEI-25	(6-55) Progress toward implementation has been achieved; Town Council has adopted regulations resulting in a reduction in leaf burning.
OCEI-26	(6-55) Partial implementation and ongoing. See note for LUP-6.
OCEI-27	(6-55) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-37	(6-56) Not implemented; Opportunities for implementation have not been available.
OCEP-38	(6-56) Implemented.
OCEP-39	(6-56) Ongoing directive.
OCEP-40	(6-56) Implemented by Town-wide Design Standards adopted in 2010.
OCEP-41	(6-57) Implemented and ongoing.
OCEP-42	(6-57) Ongoing and partially implemented on a case by case basis.
OCEP-43	(6-57) Limited implementation due to lack of resources, staff, etc.
OCEI-28	(6-57) Partially implemented and ongoing.
OCEI-29	(6-57) Not implemented at this time due to lack of staff, resources

OCEI-30 and competing priorities.
(6-57) Ongoing directive.

EDUCATION AND SOCIAL SERVICES ELEMENT:

SOCIAL SERVICES ELEMENT - (Education and Schools)

ESP-1 thru ESP-7	(6-59) Ongoing directives; implemented as opportunities arise.
ESP-8	(6-60) Ongoing directive.
ESP-9; 10	(6-60) Implemented and ongoing.
ESI-1	(6-60) Implemented and ongoing.
ESI-2; 3; 4	(6-60) Ongoing directives implemented as opportunities arise.
ESI-5	(6-61) Not implemented.
ESI-6	(6-61) Not implemented; prohibited by California State law.

SOCIAL SERVICES ELEMENT - (Senior Services):

ESP-11; 12; 13	(6-62) Partially implemented and ongoing.
ESP-14; 15; 16	(6-62) Partially implemented and ongoing.
ESI-7	(6-62) Partially implemented and ongoing but no formally established liaison activity.
ESI-8; 9	(6-62) Implemented.
ESI-10	(6-62) Partially implemented via federal funded Town housing programs.

SOCIAL SERVICES ELEMENT - (Child Day Care):

ESP-17; 18; 19	(6-63) Implemented.
ESI-11	(6-63) Implemented.

SOCIAL SERVICES ELEMENT - (The Arts)

ESP-20	(6-64) Partially implemented and ongoing as opportunities are afforded.
--------	---

ESP-21	(6-64) Implemented and ongoing.
ESP-22	(6-64) Implementation ongoing.
ESP-23	(6-64) Partially implemented and ongoing.
ESI-12	(6-64) Partially implemented.
ESI-13	(6-64) Not being implemented by local government efforts but via private sector (Paradise Ridge Chamber, etc.).
ESI-14	(6-64) Partially implemented and ongoing.
ESP-24	(6-65) Limited implementation effort.
ESP-25	(6-65) Not implemented. Such opportunities have yet to materialize.
ESP-26	(6-65) Limited implementation effort.

SOCIAL SERVICES ELEMENT - (Library Services)

ESI-15	(6-65) Limited implementation effort.
ESI-16	(6-65) Not implemented. No advocacy nor demand for implementation currently exists.

SOCIAL SERVICES ELEMENT - (Activities for Teenagers):

ESP-27; 28	(6-66) Implemented and ongoing. Boys and Girls Club, PRPD programs/activities contribute greatly.
ESP-29	(6-66) Limited implementation as opportunities are afforded.
ESI-17; 18	(6-66) Implemented as the opportunity arises.
ESI-19	(6-66) Limited implementation.

j:\cdd\planning\General Plan Misc\Status Reports\gp-imp-11 rpt

M E M O R A N D U M

AGENDA NO.6 (b)

TO: Paradise Planning Commission

FROM: Susan Hartman, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: Planning Commission Discussion of the Draft Annual Housing Element Progress Report for Calendar Year 2011

DATE: May 9, 2012

BACKGROUND:

Government Code Section 65400 requires each local jurisdiction to prepare an annual report on the status and progress in implementing its General Plan Housing Element using forms and definitions adopted by the California State Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD). The annual progress report must be submitted to HCD and the Governor's Office of Planning and Research (OPR).

Section 65400 further states that the annual Housing Element progress report "shall be at an annual public meeting before the legislative body where members of the public shall be allowed to provide oral testimony and written comments." In order to provide an opportunity for members of the public to provide this input, staff desires to provide the progress report for Town Council consideration during their regularly-scheduled June 5, 2012 meeting, thereby facilitating submittal to HCD and OPR within the first week of June, 2012.

The attached annual Housing Element progress report reveals that, of a total of four new dwelling units, all permits issued were for affordable to moderate or above-moderate dwelling units. The remaining units needed for the 2009-2014 planning period, by income level are: 412 affordable to very low income households; 188 affordable to low income households; 168 affordable to moderate income households and 360 affordable to above moderate income households.

Since the Housing Element was adopted on December 8, 2009 (Resolution 09-67), relatively few of the housing element programs were fully implemented during calendar year 2011, other than those programs where implementation involves ongoing directives to promote affordable housing through various means. The report contains a detailed enumeration of each program and its implementation status as of December 31, 2011.

COMMISSION ACTION REQUESTED:

Be prepared to publicly discuss this matter and to provide direction via an adopted motion to staff regarding any specific recommendations to be forwarded to the Town Council to facilitate additional and/or further implementation of the 1994 Paradise General Plan Housing Element.

Attachment

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202)

Jurisdiction Town of Paradise

Reporting Period 1/1/2011 - 12/31/2011

Table A

Annual Building Activity Report Summary - New Construction Very Low-, Low-, and Mixed-Income Multifamily Projects

Housing Development Information								Housing with Financial Assistance and/or Deed Restrictions		Housing without Financial Assistance or Deed Restrictions		
1	2	3	4				5	5a	6	7	8	
Project Identifier (may be APN No., project name or address)	Unit Category	Tenure R=Renter O=Owner	Affordability by Household Incomes				Total Units per Project	Est. # Infill Units*	Assistance Programs for Each Development	Deed Restricted Units	Note below the number of units determined to be affordable without financial or deed restrictions and attach an explanation how the jurisdiction determined the units were affordable. Refer to instructions.	
			Very Low- Income	Low- Income	Moderate- Income	Above Moderate- Income			See Instructions	See Instructions		
(9) Total of Moderate and Above Moderate from Table A3 ▶ ▶			0	0	0	0						
(10) Total by income Table A/A3 ▶ ▶				0	0	0	0					
(11) Total Extremely Low-Income Units*												

* Note: These fields are voluntary

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202)

Jurisdiction Town of Paradise
Reporting Period 1/1/2011 - 12/31/2011

Table A2

Annual Building Activity Report Summary - Units Rehabilitated, Preserved and Acquired pursuant to GC Section 65583.1(c)(1)

Please note: Units may only be credited to the table below when a jurisdiction has included a program in its housing element to rehabilitate, preserve or acquire units to accommodate a portion of its RHNA which meet the specific criteria as outlined in GC Section 65583.1(c)(1)

Activity Type	Affordability by Household Incomes				(4) The Description should adequately document how each unit complies with subsection (c)(7) of Government Code Section 65583.1
	Extremely Low-Income*	Very Low-Income	Low-Income	TOTAL UNITS	
(1) Rehabilitation Activity	0	0	0	0	
(2) Preservation of Units At-Risk	0	0	0	0	
(3) Acquisition of Units	0	0	0	0	
(5) Total Units by Income	0	0	0	0	

* Note: This field is voluntary

Table A3

Annual building Activity Report Summary for Above Moderate-Income Units (not including those units reported on Table A)

	1. Single Family	2. 2 - 4 Units	3. 5+ Units	4. Second Unit	5. Mobile Homes	6. Total	7. Number of infill units*
No. of Units Permitted for Moderate	3					3	
No. of Units Permitted for Above Moderate	1					1	

* Note: This field is voluntary

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202)

Jurisdiction Town of Paradise

Reporting Period 1/1/2011 - 12/31/2011

Table B

Regional Housing Needs Allocation Progress

Permitted Units Issued by Affordability

Enter Calendar Year starting with the first year of the RHNA allocation period. See Example.		2007	2008	2009	2010	2011						Total Units to Date (all years)	Total Remaining RHNA by Income Level
Income Level		RHNA Allocation by Income Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	Year 7	Year 8	Year 9		
Very Low	Deed Restricted	412											412
	Non-deed restricted												
Low	Deed Restricted	189											188
	Non-deed restricted					1						1	
Moderate	Deed Restricted	174											168
	Non-deed restricted					3	3					6	
Above Moderate		465	51	27	23	3	1					105	360
Total RHNA by COG. Enter allocation number:		1,240											1,128
Total Units ▶ ▶ ▶			51	27	23	7	4					112	
Remaining Need for RHNA Period ▶ ▶ ▶ ▶ ▶													

Note: units serving extremely low-income households are included in the very low-income permitted units totals.

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202)

Jurisdiction Town of Paradise

Reporting Period 1/1/2011 - 12/31/2011

Table C

Program Implementation Status

Program Description (By Housing Element Program Names)		Housing Programs Progress Report - Government Code Section 65583. Describe progress of all programs including local efforts to remove governmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement, and development of housing as identified in the housing element.	
Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E.	Status of Program Implementation
HI-1: Reduce infrastructure constraints to development	Reduce constraints associated with wastewater disposal.	Dec. 2012	In discussion with the City of Chico for the conveyance of wastewater from commercial areas in Paradise to the Chico City sewer system and treatment plan.
HI-2: Affordable housing resources	Promote affordable housing through work with developers.	2008-2014	Development Impact Fee deferral program has been implemented for development applications, including those building affordable and/or multifamily housing.
HI-3: Affordable housing incentives	Reduction in development standards to promote affordable housing.	Mar. 2010	Affordable housing incentives regulations are in place, promoting density bonuses for housing projects that include affordable housing units.
HI-4: Density bonus	Compliance with Government Code Sections 65915 & 65917.	Feb. 2010	Zoning ordinance amendment consistent with GC Sections 65915 & 65917 is tentatively scheduled for FY 2012/13. Density Bonus brochure will be developed accordingly. See comment for HI-3 above.
HI-5: Publicly owned lands inventory	Develop and maintain inventory of land within Town limits and its sphere of influence for potential housing sites.	Nov. 2009	No new public lands acquired resulting in new housing opportunities since an inventory was compiled in 2009. On-going development of Paradise Community Village in partnership with CHIP affordable housing.
HI-6: Housing authority	Support the Housing Authority's role in Public Housing Rental Program and Section 8 housing.	2008-2014	On-going directive; on-going implementation.
HI-7: Small lot consolidation and development	Encourage consolidation of small parcels for residential use.	May. 2010	On-going directive. Opportunities for small lot consolidation did not present themselves during 2011.
HI-8: Promote second units	Encourage development of affordable second units.	Dec. 2010	Second units are promoted through the use of administrative permits acted upon by staff as opposed to site plan review permits which previously required a public hearing. Reduction of 200' stream setbacks to 100' for sewage disposal promotes second unit density previously unavailable.
HI-9: Address discrimination	Provide filing information for discrimination complaints.	2008-2014	On-going directive. Fair housing/non-discrimination requirements are posted at Paradise Town Hall. No fair housing complaints were filed with the Town during 2011.
HI-10: Annual report	Provide annual report to Town Council and Planning Commission.	27 July	Implemented and on-going. Report for 2011 presented to Planning Commission during May 2012, Town Council during June 2012.

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202)

Jurisdiction Town of Paradise

Reporting Period 1/1/2011 - 12/31/2011

HI-11: Housing rehabilitation and improvement	Provide rehab and repair opportunities.	2008-2014	Continuing to aggressively promote and provide housing rehabilitation through CalHOME and HOME funds.
HI-12: Condominium and mobile home conversions	Revise Chapter 16.10 of the Paradise Municipal Code to address conversions.	June. 2011	Not yet implemented, but work effort is underway.
HI-13: Down payment assistance	Pursue housing program grants to fund down payment assistance.	2008-2014	On-going program administered by Business & Housing for payment assistance to lower income first time home buyers.
HI-14: Enforce housing codes	Provide a safe and decent living environment.	2008-2014	Procedure in place through building division for the thorough investigation of housing complaints and the prompt abatement of resulting violations.
HI-15: Conversion of at-risk units	Reduce potential conversion of affordable housing to market-rate.	2008-2014	The Town is notified as a party on title to assisted affordable housing units. Coordination with Butte County Housing Authority is on-going.
HI-16: Removal of constraints	Update town codes to reduce/remove constraints.	2008-2014	Town allows for the application of planned developments to accommodate smaller lot sizes while providing open space for constrained areas, also clustered wastewater treatment facilities for the development. Reductions in sewage disposal setbacks assist development. Deferral of frontage improvements (through covenants) for projects to help encourage the development of special needs housing.
HI-17: Reduce standards for seniors and disabled housing	Revise Zoning Ordinance to provide reduced standards	Dec. 2009	Paradise Municipal Code revised April 2010 to allow for handicapped and/or disabled parking space facilities to be located within a yard setback area subject to the issuance of an administrative permit.
HI-18: Emergency shelters and transitional/supportive housing	Revise zoning code to be consistent with requirements of state law.	Aug. 2010	PMC revised October 2010 to include emergency shelters as a land use allowed by right in the Community Services zoning district.
HI-19: Housing for persons with disabilities	Ensure projects for disabled accessibility are reasonably accommodated.	May. 2010	Housing Rehabilitation Program administered through Business & Housing includes projects involving improvements necessary to ensure accessibility for disabled persons.
HI-20: Special needs housing	Provide incentives for development of housing for persons with special needs.	Feb. 2010	Deferral of Development Impact Fees and increased density through the use of a clustered wastewater treatment system are available for interested developers.
HI-21: Energy conservation and efficiency	Promote energy conservation and efficiency in residential development.	July. 2011	PMC revised December 2010 to include the adoption of the state green building standards. 2010 adopted Design Standards include energy efficiency recommendations for development considerations such as solar access, water conservation, and landscaping.

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT
Housing Element Implementation
(CCR Title 25 §6202)

Jurisdiction	Town of Paradise
Reporting Period	1/1/2011 - 12/31/2011

General Comments:

The Town of Paradise continues to see a reduction in building activity in this poor economy. However, Paradise remains committed to providing housing at all income levels and works diligently within the limited budget resources that remain to assist owners with rehabilitation and renovation of existing homes. In addition, building construction permits for the Community Housing Improvement Program (CHIP) project for 36 affordable dwelling units are scheduled to be issued June 2012.