



Measure C Citizen Oversight Committee Special Meeting Agenda 4:00 PM - November 29, 2017

Measure C Committee Members

Chris Buzzard
Dean Fender
Dan Hansen
Nicki Jones
Molly Knappen

George Morris, Jr.
James Ratekin
Sharon Simonton
Kirk Trostle

Alternates

Linda Dye
Stacey Poliquin

The Citizen Oversight Committee holds its meetings in the Town Council Chambers at Town Hall, located at 5555 Skyway, Paradise, California, 95969. In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need a special accommodation to participate, please contact the Town Clerk's Department at 872-6291 Extension 102 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. Hearing assistance devices for the hearing impaired are available from the Town Clerk. Members of the public may address the Citizen Oversight Committee on any agenda item. If you wish to address the Committee on any matter on the Agenda, it is requested that you complete a request card and give it to the Committee Secretary prior to the beginning of the Oversight Board Meeting. All writings or documents which are related to any item on an open session agenda and which are distributed to a majority of the Oversight Committee will be available for public inspection at the Town Hall in the Town Clerk Department at 5555 Skyway, at the same time the subject writing or document is distributed to a majority of the subject body. Regular business hours are Monday through Thursday from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.

1. OPENING

- a. Call to Order
- b. Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America
- c. Roll Call

2. ITEMS

- a. Approve Minutes of the October 24, 2017 Regular Measure C Oversight Committee Meeting.
- b. Concur with Council's approval of funding the maintenance bay supporting Police Fire, Public Works and Animal Control Fleet services with Measure C Funding
- c. Consent to additional funding for Animal Control Services starting in 2018/19 and to other budget adjustments described at October 24, 2017 meeting:
 - a. Increase revenues to \$1,368,621
 - b. Decrease K9 Program support to \$11,000
 - c. Decrease police roof replacement to \$47,000
 - d. Increase construction of additional fleet maintenance bay and lift \$60,000
 - e. Increase fixed reserve to \$203,710

3. ADJOURNMENT

STATE OF CALIFORNIA) COUNTY OF BUTTE)	SS.
I declare under penalty of perjury that I am employed by the Town of Paradise in the Town Clerk's Department and that I posted this Agenda on the bulletin Board both inside and outside of Town Hall on the following date:	
<hr/>	
TOWN/ASSISTANT TOWN CLERK SIGNATURE	



Measure C Oversight Committee Meeting Minutes

4:00 PM – October 24, 2017

1. OPENING

The Measure C Citizen Oversight Committee meeting was called to order by Chair Molly Knappen at 4:00 p.m. in the Council Chamber located at 5555 Skyway, Paradise, CA, who led the pledge of allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT: Chris Buzzard, Dean Fender, Dan Hansen, Nicki Jones, George Morris, Sharon Simonton and Chair Molly Knappen.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: Jim Ratekin and Kirk Trostle.

ALTERNATE PRESENT: Linda Dye

2. ITEMS

- a. **MOTION by Hansen, seconded by Morris**, approved Minutes of the July 25, 2017 Regular Measure C Oversight Committee meeting. Roll call vote was unanimous with Fender and Simonton abstaining.
- b. Financial update and approve the quarterly report from the Measure C Citizens Oversight Committee to the residents of Paradise for the 1st quarter of the 2017/2018 fiscal year - Administrative Services Director/Town Treasurer - Gina Will.

Administrative Services Director/Town Treasurer Gina Will provided an update of the Measure C 4th Quarter 2016/2017 final income/expenses and the 1st quarter of 2017/2018. (Report attached to the minutes)

MOTION by Buzzard, seconded by Fender, to approve the quarterly report from the Citizen's Oversight Committee to the residents of Paradise for the 1st quarter of the 2017-18 Fiscal year. Roll call vote was unanimous with Ratekin and Trostle absent and not voting.

- c. Update on Measure C Projects

Fire Chief Hawks provided an update on the progress of the new Fire Engine 81 that will be delivered sometime in November and will be in service by the middle of December. The fire engine that is on the market, still has not been sold, but there has been interest in it. The Chief is confident it will sell, it just needs the right buyer since it is a specialized item. The engine has continued to generate revenues by being rented to the State.

Town Engineer/Public Works Director Mattox updated the committee on the Police Department roof and window projects that have now been completed. Mr. Mattox also discussed the challenging working conditions for the Fleet Manager. The Fleet Manager only has one lift bay and when an immediate repair is necessary, he is forced to work outside in the elements of extreme heat and/or cold. The Town is considering purchasing another metal building and lift that would provide additional working space and create efficiencies for fleet services. The cost for this proposed item is approximately \$60,000.

The committee did not discuss this item because it was not on the agenda, but it will be brought back for further discussion at a later date.

3 ADJOURNMENT

Chair Knappen adjourned the meeting at 4:57 p.m.

Date approved:

By: _____
Molly Knappen, Chair

Attest: _____
Dina Volenski, CMC, Town Clerk

Town of Paradise
Measure C (0.50% Transaction and Use Tax)
Financial Plan as of October 24, 2017

Description	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	Totals
Revenues	1,236,212	1,355,070	1,368,621	1,382,307	1,396,130	1,410,091	8,148,431
2nd Investigation Position	110,238	164,899	187,929	157,714	157,714	157,714	
Police Cadets (3) (2)	55,241	46,410	46,602	46,000	46,000	46,000	
Lieutenant Transition & Training		22,050					
15 Police Cars	13,597	36,254	100,000	100,000	100,000	100,000	
Body Cameras	14,786	5,917	5,917	5,917	5,917		
K9 Program	9,514	10,516	11,000	11,000	11,000	11,000	
Enhanced PD Training	16,101	14,101	15,000	15,000	15,000	15,000	
Roof Replacement		1,712	47,000				
LiveScan Machine	11,670						
PD Siding & Repairs	97,251	54,863					
Patrol Cameras & Cases		3,240					
Men's Locker Room Floor		4,102					
Emergency Electrical/Generator		85,718					
Police Totals	328,398	449,782	413,448	335,631	335,631	329,714	2,192,604
Maintain CAL FIRE Contract	144,401	141,120	250,000	250,000	250,000	250,000	
Fire Engine 81 & 82	98,226	125,668	167,183	167,183	167,183	127,033	
Future Apparatus Funding		50,000					
Apparatus Equipment		1,788					
SCBA's	24,931	3,048					
Exhaust Extraction	21,674						
Station 81 Storage Wall		1,411					
Fire Totals	289,232	323,035	417,183	417,183	417,183	377,033	2,240,849

Town of Paradise
Measure C (0.50% Transaction and Use Tax)
Financial Plan as of October 24, 2017

Description	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	Totals
Support for 2 AC Officers & Rabies Vaccine	25,079	30,647	75,083	70,200	70,200	70,200	
Rendering Setup and Maintenance			13,700				
Officer and Supervisor Training		3,500	1,600				
Sanitation Unit	5,405						
Raised beds, metal bowls, air conditioner, computer		2,469	1,017				
Online dog licensing program & setup		10,000	4,000	4,000	4,000	4,000	
Washing Machine Cover & Concrete Repairs		2,200	8,000				
Isolation Units		6,442					
Animal Control Totals	30,484	55,257	103,400	74,200	74,200	74,200	411,741
Maxwell Drive SR2S			76,045				
Bille Overlay (Fern to Oliver)			132,700				
Fleet Repair Facility Construction & Lift			60,000				
Pedestrian Safety Crossing	24,779						
Pearson Road Improvements	200,502						
Almond Street Multi-Modal				388,000			
Ponderosa SR2S				193,000			
2016 Overlay & Markings		500,914					
Public Works Totals	225,281	500,914	268,745	581,000	-	-	1,575,940
Measure C Logos		275					
10% Fixed Reserve			203,710	203,710	203,710	203,710	
Contingency Reserve				254,011	254,011	254,011	1,577,148
Total Expenses	873,395	1,329,263	1,406,486	1,865,735	1,284,735	1,238,668	7,998,282
Net Total	362,817	25,807	(37,865)	(483,428)	111,395	171,423	150,149
Designated Reserves							
Police Car Payments							150,149
Unassigned							(0)



TOWN OF PARADISE
Council Agenda Summary
Date: November 14, 2017

Agenda No. 6(b)

ORIGINATED BY: Marc Mattox, Public Works Director / Town Engineer

REVIEWED BY: Lauren Gill, Town Manager

SUBJECT: Fleet Maintenance Bay Addition

COUNCIL ACTION REQUESTED:

1. Conceptually approve the addition of a fleet maintenance bay at 767 Birch Street, and
2. Authorize staff to prepare formal bid documents relating to the addition of the fleet maintenance bay, and
3. Direct staff to convene a Special Meeting for the Measure C Oversight Committee, seeking concurrence of funding the maintenance bay supporting Police, Fire, Public Works and Animal Control fleet with Measure C.

Background:

The current 2-bay fleet maintenance shop, located at 767 Birch Street, was built in the 1960's for Paradise Fire Department to store and maintain the engines of the time. Since then, the building has been converted into a maintenance facility for the post-incorporation needs of the Town of Paradise for the entire emergency and non-emergency fleets. The fleet itself has changed and grown tremendously since the time the facility was built, totaling over 100 vehicles and other pieces of equipment. A 2-bay workspace is no longer sufficient for the safe and efficient maintenance of the fleet.

Analysis:

Action needs to be taken to improve the safety of our employees and overall efficiency of the fleet maintenance operations. Specifically, the following items outline some of the basic issues associated with current conditions:

- (1) Work on fire engines cannot be performed inside the building. This is due to the size limitations of the existing engine's cabs which, when raised, exceed the dimensions of the facility bay and door. Even a simple oil change must be performed outdoors. Any repairs requiring an engine to be lifted must be subcontracted to a third party shop – and in most cases, increasing costs.
- (2) Work in the shop driveway exposes employees to extreme weather elements. Without a conditioned space for oversized vehicles or when multiple reactive repairs are required simultaneously, staff is forced to utilize the existing driveway. At times during the extreme heat, this means working on top of fire engines, where the surface temperature of the work area exceeds 130 degrees. Conversely, ground repairs on asphalt concrete radiating extreme heat reduce overall repair efficiency and can also expose staff to hazardous conditions.
- (3) Work in the shop driveway is not sustainable due to planned capital roadway improvements along Birch Street. Depending on construction schedule, as soon as 2019, new sidewalks will be installed in coordination with an adjacent transit center facility. This construction will drastically reduce the depth of the shop's driveway to perform repairs, rendering the remaining driveway too short for fire engine repairs.

Measure C Oversight Committee 2(b)

- (4) The current facility is equipped with 2-bays with only one 7,000lb hoist. The 7000lb hoist is sufficient to lift police cars and small SUV's. All other trucks and larger vehicles must be maintained in the empty bay of the shop using floor jacks and jack stands. Often times, a vehicle is "stuck" on the lone hoist due to lead times on parts, multi day jobs, or when staff is addressing an item of higher priority. When this occurs all work must be done in the empty bay with floor jacks and jack stands. Working on floor jacks and jack stands is not only inefficient and increases injury risk to staff. One 7000lb rack is insufficient to keep up with the safety and maintenance needs of our fleet.

Staff is recommending Council conceptually approve a plan to construct a third bay structure, adjacent to the existing facility. This third bay would have provide the adequate space and 15,000lb hoist to properly maintain the Town's existing and growing fleet. This solution will have many benefits:

- Fire engine maintenance, repair, and storage will be indoors. Pick-up trucks and large SUV's will be able to be lifted and maintained on a vehicle hoist. Having a vehicle "stuck" on a rack will no longer cause the workflow to drastically slow or even stop.
- Working quarters in the current shop will no longer be as crowded as the third bay will provide additional storage for inventory, supplies, and equipment.
- Up to 3 jobs at one time can be in progress. For instance, one car can be on a hoist waiting for parts, while work is being performed on another hoist, and a fire engine that is taken apart can wait until the mechanic is available to finish repairs.
- By installing an additional hoist and third bay the workflow in the shop will become more efficient, workload and pace will become safer and more sustainable, and the town will have the proper facility to maintain our growing fleet and maintenance demand into the future.
- Less work requiring heavy vehicles to be lifted will be subcontracted out.

Staff has researched various options and has identified the best alternative to proceed as being the procurement and construction of a pre-fabricated metal building on a new concrete pad east of existing facilities, on Town-owned property.

Prior to fully designing a project solution, staff is seeking Council conceptual approval to proceed with the project. If approved, a bid-package would be presented to Council at a later date for approval for advertisement.

Financial Impact:

Staff has prepared an estimate for the proposed work including all components of the third bay, including materials, construction, hoist and operational necessities. The current estimate for this work is \$60,000. The use of Measure C funds is proposed for this effort. Measure C is a sales tax measure to benefit Police, Fire, Roads and Animal Control. Use of Measure C funds for a permanent investment into the fleet shop directly correlates with proposed conditions of the Funds. A major investment in the Town's fleet maintenance operations has not been made since incorporation and would not be possible to consider without Measure C. Staff expects \$30,000 combined savings between the FY 17/18 Measure C Budget between the Police Department re-roofing effort and Bille Road Overlay / Maxwell Drive Improvements. This \$30,000 savings could provide half of the needed funding for the fleet project. Remaining funding would be proposed from Measure C revenues observed above original estimates.

If conceptually approved, staff could convene a Special Meeting of the Measure C Oversight Committee to seek concurrence of the funding allocation.



**Town of Paradise
Measure C Citizen Oversight
Committee
Date: November 29, 2017**

Agenda Item: 2(c)

Originated by: Gina S. Will, Administrative Services Director/Town Treasurer

Approved by: Lauren Gill, Town Manager

Subject: Consent to additional funding for Animal Control Services

Committee Action Requested:

1. Consent to additional funding for Animal Control Services starting in 2018/19.
2. Consent to other budget adjustments described at October 24, 2017 meeting:
 - a. Increase revenues to \$1,368,621
 - b. Decrease K9 Program support to \$11,000
 - c. Decrease police roof replacement to \$47,000
 - d. Increase construction of additional fleet maintenance bay and lift \$60,000
 - e. Increase fixed reserve to \$203,710

Alternative:

Decline to consent and make alternative budget suggestions.

Background:

The 2017/18 operating and capital budgets, including Measure C, were adopted June 27, 2017. Currently about three months of transactions have been recorded. Staff met with the Measure C Citizen's Oversight Committee on October 24, 2017 to review final numbers for 2016/17 and progress on the 2017/18 budget to date.

Discussion:

At the November 14, 2017 Town Council meeting, Council approved the following budget adjustments, pending concurrence with the Measure C Committee, which were discussed on October 24, 2017.

- Increase the revenues budget from \$1,335,000 to \$1,368,621. This assumes a 1% increase from 2016/17.
- Decrease the K9 program support budget from \$13,000 to \$11,000. \$9,514 was spent in 2015/16 and \$10,516 was spent in 2016/17.
- Decrease the roof replacement budget from \$75,000 to \$47,000 as the project is complete and total expenditures to date total \$46,670.
- Increase budget by \$60,000 in order to construct a fleet maintenance bay and purchase another large equipment lift. Currently there are no facilities large enough to repair fire engines or other large equipment in a semi-climate

controlled environment.

- Increase the reserve requirement for 2017/18 to \$203,710 from \$188,000. This adjustment is to align Town Council's request for a 10% fixed reserve with revised projected revenues.

In addition, Council approved, with Measure C Committee concurrence, some additional funding for Animal Control Services as described below.

Despite administration and police leadership efforts, Animal Control continues to have operating challenges. One of the most chronic challenges has been unfilled employment vacancies. The division has been trying to fill an Animal Control Officer position since May 2017. After exhausting all previous applicants, the division needs to start the process over and go out again for applications. Staff spent some time analyzing the situation and has reached some conclusions:

- An Animal Control Officer is a representative of the Town in delicate situations. They are responding to calls for service when dangerous or aggressive dogs are present. They are issuing citations for unleashed and unlicensed dogs. They are utilizing judgment in determining when dog barking has become excessive. They are witnesses in hearings and can be called to testify in court.
- A vacancy in the Animal Control division draws resources from both police and administrative service departments. A Police Lieutenant spends more time at Animal Control addressing operating issues when a vacancy exists. Finance and Human Resources also spend additional time addressing various issues when a vacancy exists.
- The Town's salary pay plan for this position is the lowest in the area with arguably more responsibilities:

City	Position Title	Hourly Min	Hourly Max
Chico	Animal Control Officer I	\$ 15.41	\$ 21.28
Chico	Animal Control Officer II	\$ 17.02	\$ 23.47
Butte Co.	Animal Control Officer	\$ 15.63	\$ 20.94
Butte Co.	Sr. Animal Control Officer	\$ 20.00	\$ 26.81
Yuba City	Animal Control Officer I	\$ 16.09	\$ 19.55
Yuba City	Animal Control Officer II	\$ 17.64	\$ 21.43
	AVERAGE	\$ 16.97	\$ 22.25
Paradise	Animal Control Officer	\$ 14.20	\$ 18.12

While increasing the salary pay plan does not guarantee a larger pool of qualified applicants, it does increase the chance that a quality individual may apply that otherwise would not. Staff recommends increasing the range of the Animal Control Officer to \$16.00 through \$20.42 to make it more competitive with the area and to compete with

the salaries of other private enterprise positions.

Because the increase then exasperates the compaction of the Animal Control Supervisor, the supervisor salary was also compared:

City	Position Title	Salary Min	Salary Max
Chico	Animal Services Manager	\$ 30.15	\$ 38.48
Butte Co.	Animal Control Supervisor	\$ 18.75	\$ 25.15
Butte Co.	Animal Control Program Manager	\$ 30.00	\$ 40.20
Yuba City	Animal Services Manager	\$ 38.23	\$ 46.46
	AVERAGE	\$ 29.28	\$ 37.57
Paradise	Animal Control Supervisor	\$ 17.00	\$ 21.69

In order to retain the current Supervisor and to attract a future Supervisor (if needed), staff proposes to increase the range to \$19.00 through \$24.26 that is still well below average for the area.

This will increase costs in the division about \$15,400 annually. The estimated salary savings for 2017/18 from the current vacancy is about \$23,000, so there will actually be net salary savings for Measure C in the current fiscal year. Staff will complete a thorough review of personnel expenses as part of the mid-year budget report, so will bring actual related budget adjustments for 2017/18 personnel at that time.

Staff recognizes that Animal Control is already underfunded and this only perpetuates the problem. However, staff cannot properly identify and address all the other operating needs while these chronic vacancies exist. This is another step in the plan to create sustainable operations for the division.

With the salary adjustments, the funds dedicated (including Measure C) for animal control and shelter operations total about \$325,000 a year. This provides 112 hours of animal control services each week and 20 hours a week that the shelter is open to the public. In comparison, Oroville contracts with Northwest SPCA and for about \$301,000 a year. They receive a limited 40 hours of animal control service and 45.5 hours of public shelter operations.

Animal Control is at least the same, if not more important, to safety of the citizens of the Town of Paradise than shelter operations. Staff manage the disposal of over one hundred deer each year. They are involved in over 30 hearings a year for dangerous and code violating animals. They enforce State law, which prevents the spread of rabies. Dispatch records indicate that about 1,000 Animal Control incidents are reported each year ranging from dogs running loose to animal cruelty.

Staff have been in continuing contact with Butte Humane Society since about June 2017. While they are at least initially receptive to the idea of providing sheltering services, they currently are not interested nor have the capacity to provide Animal

Control services.

As the Committee is well aware. Measure N, the \$12 per parcel annual assessment for Animal Control Services only provides \$132,362 of needed funding. This means that over \$190,000 is needed from fees for services or other funding sources to maintain a minimum level of service now that donation funds have been depleted.

Finally, the Town Manager proposes to convene a committee of stakeholders to continue the discussion and options for Animal Control funding. The discussion will include the merits of continued use of Measure C funds, Measure N funds, fundraising and any grant opportunities.

Fiscal Impact:

The recommended budget adjustments impact the overall Measure C Financial Plan. A detailed amended Measure C Financial Plan is included with the agenda material, and following is a summary:

Projected Revenues			\$8,148,431
Commitments for:	Police	\$2,343,028	
	Fire	2,240,849	
	Animal Control	457,941	
	Public Works	1,575,940	
	10% Fixed Reserve	814,840	
	Contingency Reserve	715,833	(8,148,431)
Net Remaining			0