

CITY OF NORMAN, OK HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MEETING

Municipal Building, Council Chambers, 201 West Gray, Norman, OK 73069 Monday, October 02, 2023 at 5:30 PM

AGENDA

It is the policy of the City of Norman that no person or groups of persons shall on the grounds of race, color, religion, ancestry, national origin, age, place of birth, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, familial status, marital status, including marriage to a person of the same sex, disability, retaliation, or genetic information, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or otherwise subjected to discrimination in employment activities or in all programs, services, or activities administered by the City, its recipients, sub-recipients, and contractors. In the event of any comments, complaints, modifications, accommodations, alternative formats, and auxiliary aids and services regarding accessibility or inclusion, please contact the ADA Technician at 405-366-5424, Relay Service: 711. To better serve you, five (5) business days' advance notice is preferred.

AMENDED

ROLL CALL

MINUTES

1. CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE MINUTES AS FOLLOWS:

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES OF AUGUST 7, 2023.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUESTS

- 2. HD (23-31) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 606 MILLER AVENUE TO: 1) REPLACE EXTERIOR SIDING ON THE HOUSE AND GARAGE WITH ALTERNATIVE MATERIAL AND ADD AN ALTERNATIVE MATERIAL SOFFIT TO THE GARAGE; 2) REPLACE A REAR WINDOW AND DOOR WITH METAL WINDOWS; AND 3) MODIFY THE NON-ORIGINAL FRONT PORCH.
- 3. HD (23-33) CONSIDERATION OF THE APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF AN AMENDMENT TO CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS HD 23-08 FOR 904 MILLER AVENUE TO MODIFY THE PROPOSED DRIVEWAY AND PARKING PAD AREA OFF FERRILL AVENUE.

REPORTS/UPDATES

4. STAFF REPORT ON ACTIVE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND ADMINISTRATIVE BYPASS ISSUED SINCE AUGUST 7, 2023.

- 5. DISCUSSION OF PROGRESS REPORT REGARDING FY 2023-2024 CLG GRANT PROJECTS.
- 6. DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATION OF APPLICATION FOR FUNDS FOR THE FY 2024-2025 CLG PROGRAM WITH THE OKLAHOMA STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE.

MISCELLANEOUS COMMENTS

ADJOURNMENT

2



CITY OF NORMAN, OK HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MEETING

Municipal Building, Council Chambers, 201 West Gray, Norman, OK 73069 Monday, August 07, 2023 at 5:30 PM

MINUTES

It is the policy of the City of Norman that no person or groups of persons shall on the grounds of race, color, religion, ancestry, national origin, age, place of birth, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, familial status, marital status, including marriage to a person of the same sex, disability, retaliation, or genetic information, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or otherwise subjected to discrimination in employment activities or in all programs, services, or activities administered by the City, its recipients, sub-recipients, and contractors. In the event of any comments, complaints, modifications, accommodations, alternative formats, and auxiliary aids and services regarding accessibility or inclusion, please contact the ADA Technician at 405-366-5424, Relay Service: 711. To better serve you, five (5) business days' advance notice is preferred.

Chair Emily Wilkins called the meeting to order at 5:33 p.m.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT

Commissioner - Vice Chair Barrett Williamson Commission - Chair Emily Wilkins Commissioner Mitch Baroff Commissioner Michael Zorba Commissioner Shavonne Evans * Commissioner Taber Halford Commissioner Sarah Brewer

A quorum was present.

*Commissioner Shavonne Evans arrived at 5:35 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Anais Starr, Planner II, Historic Preservation Officer Jeanne Snider, Assistant City Attorney Amanda Stevens, Development Center Coordinator

GUESTS

Carter Merkle, 518 Shawnee St, Norman, OK Milena Govich, 930 Miller Ave, Norman, OK David Cornue, 930 Miller Ave, Norman, OK Marilyn Govich, 440 Keith St, Norman, OK Kristi Pate, 521 Miller Ave, Norman, OK

3

MINUTES

1. CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE MINUTES AS FOLLOWS:

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 5, 2023.

Motion by Barrett Williamson for approval of the minutes from the June 5th, 2023 regular meeting; **Second** by Taber Halford.

The motion was passed unanimously with a vote of 7-0. Minutes from the previous meeting were approved.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUESTS

 HD (23-23) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 521 MILLER AVENUE FOR THE REPLACEMENT OF METAL WINDOWS WITH METAL WINDOWS OF A DIFFERENT PANE CONFIGURATION ON A NON-ORIGINAL ACCESSORY STRUCTURE.

Motion by Barrett Williamson to approve (HD 23-23) replacement of metal windows with metal windows of a different pane configuration on a non-original accessory structure, as submitted; **Second** by Michael Zorba.

Anais Starr presented the staff report.

• Anais stated that this accessory structure is non-contributing.

There was no applicant presentation.

There were no public comments.

Commission Discussion:

- Anais Starr explained that the property owner is replacing the metal windows with metal instead of wood, as like-for-like is allowed by the Preservation Guidelines. However, this particularly window pane configuration is not available on today's market.
- Commissioner Zorba asked if the twelve windows to be replaced are all metal windows.
- Anais Starr replied yes, the property owner is not wanting to replace the existing wood windows in the structure and they will remain.

The motion was passed unanimously with a vote of 7-0.

3. HD (23-24) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 518 SHAWNEE STREET FOR THE REPLACEMENT

*

OF NON-ORIGINAL WOOD WINDOWS WITH WOOD COMPOSITE WINDOWS Q THE REAR OF THE NON-CONTRIBUTING PRINCIPAL STRUCTURE.

Motion by Mitch Baroff to approve (HD 23-24) replacement non-original wood windows with wood composite windows on the rear of the non-contributing principal structure, as submitted; **Second** Shavonne Evans.

Anais Starr presented the staff report:

• Anais Starr stated that this is a non-contributing structure. Furthermore, she indicated that the windows are the original windows as they are located in a non-original addition.

The property owner, Carter Merkle, discussed the project.

There were no public comments.

There was no further Commission discussion.

The motion was passed unanimously with a vote of 7-0.

4. HD (23-26) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 930 MILLER AVENUE FOR THE ALLOWANCE FOR EGRESS EITHER BY: OPTION 1 – THE ADDITION OF AN EXTERIOR DOOR ON THE EAST WALL OF THE GARAGE; AND/ OR OPTION 2- THE ENLARGEMENT OF AN EXISTNG WINDOW OPENING ALONG WITH REPLACEMENT OF THE WINDOWS LOCATED ON THE EAST WALL OF THE GARAGE.

*

Motion by Michael Zorba to approve (HD 23-26) for the allowance for egress either by **Option 1-** The addition of an exterior door on the east wall of the garage; and/or Option 2- the enlargement of an existing window opening along with replacement of the windows located on the east wall of the garage, as submitted; **Second** by Sarah Brewer.

Anais Starr presented the staff report:

 Anais Starr stated that this is a contributing structure. However, the applicant in unable to expand the footprint of the structure, due to Zoning setback requirements but would like to improve the internal layout of the house. This requires egress for the bedroom that will be located in the garage area.

The property owner, Milena Govich discussed the project.

There were no public comments.

Commission Discussion:

- Commissioner Baroff was unsure as to whether or not the "fixed" windows would comply with code.
- Anais Starr explained that the property owner's new windows would be operable. Which would mean that both option 1 & 2 would comply with code.

5

REPORTS/UPDATES

- 5. STAFF REPORT ON ACTIVE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND ADMINISTRATIVE BYPASS ISSUED SINCE JUNE 5, 2023.
 - 518 Chautauqua Ave: Cement fiberboard replaced and swimming pool installed.
 - 549 S Lahoma: Appeal made by applicant. Judge handed down a mandatory ruling – install windows or make appeal by August 11th.
 - 506 S Lahoma Ave: Construction continues.
 - 720 S Lahoma Ave: Work has not started. Building permit for interior work has been issued. No exterior progress apparent since the March meeting.
 - 610 Miller Ave: Parapet walls re-built and re-sided. Applicant has received approval from insurance company to have original metal tile roof manufactured. It has been ordered.
 - 514 Miller Ave: No change since March meeting. Work has not started.
 - 640 E Boyd St: Work is complete except for front door replacement and painting exterior.
 - 904 Miller Ave: Construction has begun. Foundation is complete.
 - 904 Classen Ave: Work has not started.

Administrative Bypass issued since June 5, 2023:

- 616 Tulsa Ave: Installation of hand railing on front stairs.
- 6. DISCUSSION OF PROGRESS REPORT REGARDING FYE 2023-2024 CLG GRANT PROJECTS.

*

2022-2023 Certified Local Government Grant Funds Budget

PROJECT1: Educational Training \$2,700 Memberships Dues for NAPC PROJECT 2: \$150 PROJECT 3: Historic Tour Expansion \$1,725 PROJECT 4: Historic Tour App Maintenance \$2,000 & Maintenance \$3,725 PROJECT 5: Windows & Wall Workshop \$10,000 PROJECT 6: Quarterly Education Postcard \$1,800

Total CLG Budget

\$18,375

MISCELLANEOUS COMMENTS

- Anais Starr talked about the importance of making sure that historic home buyers are given an accurate disclosure statement so that they know they're buying in a city-designated Historic District. Staff will check on disclosures in the future when an applicant claims they were not informed.
- Ms. Starr stated that sometimes realtors from other cities will list historic homes in Norman, and not realize that they're in a historic district.
- Commissioner Evans said that realtors can't make sellers disclose anything, but by a realtor's code of ethics, they do have to disclose it.
- Anais Starr talked about how to allocate CLG grant project funds.
- This included funding for educational training for her, NAPC membership dues, historic tour expansion, and the windows & wall workshop.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 6:38 p.m.

Passed and approved this _____ day of _____, 2023.

Emily Wilkins, Chair Historic District Commission



MEETING DATE: 10/02/2023

- **REQUESTER:** ROBERT FIGHTMASTER
- **PRESENTER:** ANAIS STARR, PLANNER II
- ITEM TITLE: HD (23-31) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 606 MILLER AVENUE TO: 1) REPLACE EXTERIOR SIDING ON THE HOUSE AND GARAGE WITH ALTERNATIVE MATERIAL AND ADD AN ALTERNATIVE MATERIAL SOFFIT TO THE GARAGE; 2) REPLACE A REAR WINDOW AND DOOR WITH METAL WINDOWS; AND 3) MODIFY THE NON-ORIGINAL FRONT PORCH.

Property History

Historical Information

2004 Miller Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

606 South Miller Avenue. Ca. 1909. Bungalow/Craftsman. This noncontributing, two-story, asbestos-sided, single dwelling has a concrete foundation and an asphalt-covered, gabled roof. The replacement metal windows are four-over-four hung and the wood door is paneled. The full-width porch has been altered to a flat, fiber-glass roof supported by wrought iron columns. Other exterior features include a clipped gabled dormer. Decorative details include double windows and art glass in the wing window. There is a garage to the rear. The buildings are noncontributing due to a lack of historic integrity.

Sanborn Insurance Maps

The primary structure is indicated in its present location on the 1925 and 1944 Sanborn map. The 1944 Sanborn shows a garage structure on the northwest corner of the backyard. This indicates the present-day garage structure was erected sometime after 1944.

Previous Actions

There have been no Certificate of Appropriateness requests granted for this property.

Overall Project Description

The applicant has recently purchased this property and is seeking to improve the appearance with several proposed exterior alterations to the house and garage.

The applicant wishes to address the deteriorated siding found on both the house and the garage. The applicant proposes to replace the existing cement siding on both structures with lap siding comprised of either fiber cement or wood-composite lap siding. Additionally, he wishes to replace one window on the rear of the house with a metal window to match the already installed replacement windows found on other sections of the house. He proposes to replace a door located on the rear patio area with a metal window as well. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness by Administrative Bypass, to install full-view storm doors for the front and rear doors.

The applicant would like to improve the appearance of the non-original front porch by covering the metal columns with cedar columns and replacing the fiberglass roof with a metal roof.

1) REPLACE EXTERIOR SIDING ON HOUSE AND GARAGE WITH ALTERNATIVE MATERIAL AND ADD AN ALTERNATIVE MATERIAL SOFFIT TO THE GARAGE.

Project Description

The applicant proposes to replace the existing cement siding on both structures with either fiber cement or wood-composite lap siding to improve the appearance of the structures.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.c.2.g.3. Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.

Exterior Walls

3.1 Standards for Administrative Bypass

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

.1 Removal of wall materials. Removal of non-original or contemporary synthetic materials to reveal existing historic materials is permitted. If existing historic siding material underneath the non-original or contemporary synthetic materials has been removed, the reinstallation of appropriate/compatible material requires review by the Historic District Commission.

3.2 Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 **Preserve Original Walls**. Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.

.2 Retain Original Building Materials. Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.

.3 **Replace Only Deteriorated Portions**. If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.

.4 Avoid Covering Original Materials. Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.

.5 Replace Missing Features. When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.

.6 Avoid False Historical Appearances. Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

.7 Substitute Materials. Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

Staff Comments

The house and garage both have a variety of materials and design on the exterior. As can be seen from photos, the existing cement siding does not cover another layer of siding material. Even so, it is not possible for staff to determine if the existing cement siding is original to the house or a replacement siding installed post-1944. Regardless, this property retains very little historic fabric and was identified on the 2004 Miller Historic Survey as non-contributing. It should be also be noted that it is not possible for staff to determine if the cement siding contains asbestos.

The Commission has approved both cement fiberboard and wood composite on other noncontributing structures that have suffered hail damage over the last several years. This would be the first case where the Commission would be allowing replacement of the exterior siding that was not encapsulating an original siding material beneath. However, both structures are non-contributing; existing siding may contain asbestos and significant alterations over the years makes it difficult to determine the original exterior design and material. The *Preservation Guidelines* allow for alternative materials on a non-contributing structure upon review on a caseby-case basis. The unique circumstances of this structure may warrant the approval of alternative replacement material.

When the property owner purchased this property, he found the garage structure to be very deteriorated and leaning. In the process of trying to shore up the leaning garage, the applicant's contractor removed the south wall. Staff halted further construction until review and approval of the proposed exterior wall by the Commission could occur.

The garage contains several different materials including various sizes of wood lap siding and cement fiber shingles. The applicant has been made aware by the Building Permit Department that since the south garage wall is located on the property line it must be fire- rated in order to meet residential building code. This will require that both the wall and soffit be covered in fire-rated material such as cement fiber material. The applicant has researched fire-rated wall assemblies and has chosen one that requires fiber cement boards on the soffit. Currently, none of the soffit is covered, but per building code the south wall of the garage would be required to have a fire-rated soffit.

It should be noted that the applicant is proposing lap siding for the house and garage instead of the current shingle design. Since the house has had many alterations and is non-contributing, it seems reasonable to allow flexibility on the design.

The Commission would need to determine if the alternative substitute material in the form of lap siding meets the *Preservation Guidelines*. Furthermore, the Commission would need to determine if exterior modifications are appropriate and if it is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

Commission Action: Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of (HD 23-31) Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 606 Miller Avenue to: 1) replace exterior siding with alternative material siding the house and garage along with the addition of an alternative material soffit for the garage.

2) REPLACE REAR WINDOW AND DOOR WITH METAL WINDOWS

Description

The applicant proposes to replace a window on the southwest corner of the house that has deteriorated. He proposes a metal window which will match other metal windows currently installed on the house. Additionally, on this same room, the applicant wishes to replace the exterior door with a metal window in order to improve internal programming.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.c.2.g.3. Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.

Reference – Preservation Guidelines

Windows

3.11 Standards for Administrative Bypass

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed below. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

.1 Window Replacement. An historic window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:

- a. Replace original windows in-kind, meaning match the original in material and finish.
- b. Muntin width and profile are same as the original in width and profile.
- c. Light pattern is the same as the original.
- d. True divided lights (panes) are the same as the original glass thickness.
- e. Size and dimension of all window components are the same as the original.
- f. Replacement of less than 50% of the windows on a given elevation.

3.12 Guidelines for Windows

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Retain Original Windows. Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.

.2 Retain Historic Glass. Retain original glass in historic windows if at all possible. Leaded glass windows shall be preserved. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.

.3 Glass Replacement. Individual panes of historic glass that have been broken or cracked, may be replaced with modern-day clear glass. Salvaged historic glass or reproduction historic "wavy" glass is also acceptable replacement where historic glass was present.

.4 Glass Variations.

- a. Privacy glass may only be located in the rear or on the side of the structure, where not visible from the front. Smoked or tinted glass is not appropriate for use in historic structures.
- b. Beveled glass in doors and windows is allowed as long as it is compatible with style of the historic building and the original configuration of window panes remains.
- c. Colored glass may be used in transoms and sidelights if supported by historical documentation or compatible with the architectural style.

.5 **Replace Only Deteriorated Features**. If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit. Broken sash cords, for example, can be repaired and do not necessitate replacing an entire window. Match the original in design, dimension, placement, and material.

.6 Sash Replacement. Replacement sash, often referred to as sash replacement kits, are acceptable for use in historic structures. However, replacement window sash shall be unclad wood, with single-pane thickness, true divided light patterns that match the historic muntin pattern and profile of the house.

.7 Window Replacement. An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:

a. Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.

b. Light patterns same as the original.

c. Size and dimension the same as the original.

d. Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.

.8 Retain Original Metal Windows. Replace original metal casement windows only as a last resort after weatherization measures have proven unsuccessful.

.9 **Preserve Original Openings**. Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock window sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic windows for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

.10 Materials. Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum–clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic districts.

3.14 Guidelines for Doors

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 **Retain and Preserve Original Doors.** Retain and preserve original doors and door surrounds including frames, glazing, panels, sidelights, fanlights, surrounds, thresholds, and hardware on front doors and side doors visible from the street.

.2 **Replace Only Deteriorated Features.** If replacement of a deteriorated door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit.

.3 Retain and Preserve Transoms and Sidelights. Transoms and sidelights should be retained and preserved. Avoid altering transoms and sidelights as it distorts the strong vertical proportions of the windows and doors and changes the character of the residence.

.4 **Retain Historic Glass**. Retain original glass in historic doors. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.

.5 Glass Variations

- a. Privacy glass may only be located in the rear or on the side of the structure, where not visible from the front. Smoked or tinted glass is not appropriate for use in historic structures.
- b. Beveled glass in doors is allowed as long as it is compatible with style of the historic building and the original configuration of window panes remains.
- c. Colored glass may be used in transoms and sidelights if supported by historical documentation or compatible with the architectural style.

.6 Wood Doors. Wood doors are required unless there is documentation that other materials were historically used on a particular structure. Keep wood doors appropriately stained or painted to protect from weather.

.7 Replacement Doors. Replacement doors on a historic structure are to be wood and in appropriate design, size and details in keeping with the style of the house. Installation of steel doors on the front of a historic structure is prohibited. Aluminum clad doors are permissible on rear of the structure upon review on a case-by-case basis.

.8 Preserve Original Openings. Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock door sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic doors for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

.9 *Materials.* Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of doors. Fiberglass and aluminum–clad doors can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations of historic structures when not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl is prohibited for historic and non-contributing structures.

.10 New Primary and Secondary Accessory Structures. Doors in new construction shall be similar to those in adjacent historic structures in terms of size, profile, design, proportions, and material. Aluminum clad and fiberglass doors with limited or no visibility from the front façade can be considered on a case-by-case basis.

.11 Additions. For construction of additions, choose doors that match the original structure. Aluminum-clad wood doors are permissible for use in additions that are not visible from the front right-of-way. Fiberglass doors can be considered on a case-by-case basis.

Staff Comments

As mentioned earlier, this structure contains a variety of exterior materials including windows and doors. The applicant wishes to provide some uniformity by replacing one window and one door, both on the rear of the structure, with a metal window that matches the rest of the metal replacement windows in the house.

The wood window to be replaced, does not have the same window pane configuration or the same window opening size as exists with other wood windows in the structure. This indicates that it may not be not be original to this structure. The rear door is a modern-day door and again it is not clear that this was an original opening for this structure. The replacement of the window and door with metal windows to match the rest of the house seems reasonable given: the window and door are not original to the house, the house is a non-contributing, and the requested replacements are on the rear of the structure.

The Commission would need to determine if the replacement of a window and a door on the rear of the structure meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is appropriate for this property.

Commission Action: Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement (HD 23-31) Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 606 Miller Avenue as submitted to: 2) replace rear window and door with metal windows.

3) MODIFY THE NON-ORIGINAL FRONT PORCH

Description

The applicant wishes to approve the appearance of the non-original metal front porch. He propose to cover the metal columns and fascia with cedar. Additionally he would like to replace the fiberglass roof with a metal roof.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.c.2.g.3. Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.

Reference – Preservation Guidelines

3.16 Guidelines for Entrances, Porches, and Balconies

The Historic District Commission will use following criteria for review of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Preserve Original Entrances, Porches, and Balconies. Retain and preserve entrances, porches, and balconies that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including columns, pilasters, piers, entablatures, balustrades, sidelights, fanlights, transoms, steps, railings, floors, and ceilings.

.2 Replace Only Deteriorated Elements. If replacement of a deteriorated detail or element of an entrance, porch, or balcony feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated detail or element in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in design, dimension, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered only if using the original material is not available.

.3 *Match Original.* If full replacement of an entrance, porch, or balcony is necessary, replace it in-kind, matching the original in design, dimension, detail, texture, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered only if original material is no longer available.

.4 **Replace Missing Features**. Replace missing entrance, porch, or balcony features with a new feature based on accurate documentation of the missing original or a new design compatible with the historic character of the building and the district.

.5 Screen Porches Carefully. Consider the screening of a historic porch only if the alteration is reversible and can be designed to preserve the historic character of the porch and the building.

.6 Avoid Enclosures. It is not appropriate to enclose a front porch or a front balcony.

.7 Avoid Removing Details. It is not appropriate to remove any detail material associated with entrances and porches, such as graining, beveled glass, or bead board, unless an accurate restoration requires it.

.8 Avoid Changes to Primary Façades. It is not appropriate to remove an original entrance or porch or to add a new entrance or porch on a primary façade.

.9 Avoid False Historical Appearances. Features or details that are introduced to a house shall reflect its style, period, and design. Features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

.10 Maintain Porch Elevation. At no time shall the porch elevation be lowered to grade and steps redesigned.

.11 *Maintain Wood Elements.* Wood porch floors and columns may require an eventual replacement due to moisture penetration; wood floors and columns shall only be replaced with wood of the same profile and dimension.

12. New Balconies and Porches. Balconies and porches built on the rear and not visible from the front right-of-way are to be constructed to be compatible with the principal structure in material, scale, and size. New balconies or porches on the front or side of a historic structure will only be considered if there is historic evidence that one existed. The design and materials are to be based on historic evidence of the design or be a design seen in similar structures in the historic neighborhood.

13. Respect Design. Original design, construction, and materials shall be respected on primary façades. Installation of non-original materials, such as decorative tile, is not appropriate.

Staff Comments

This porch is made of metal indicating it is a modern-day addition. The applicant's proposal to add cedar to the metal columns and fascia, would make this front porch more compatible with the neighborhood.

This request for a metal roof would be the second such request the Commission has considered. However, the current fiberglass roof, is neither original to the structure nor a compatible material with the surrounding neighborhood. While metal is not typical of the historic structure, as noted previously, this house is a non-contributing structure with a non-original front porch. Though metal is not typical, given it is a modern-day porch, it seems reasonable to allow a more sturdy and durable roof material.

The Commission would need to determine if the modifications to the front porch for this noncontributing structure meet the *Preservation Guidelines* and if they are compatible with the surrounding Miller Historic District.

Commission Action: Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of (HD 23-31) Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 606 Miller Avenue to: 3) modify the non-original front porch.

	Staff Only Use Item 2.							
The City of Norman Historic District Commission	HD Case #:							
FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (COA)	Date:							
	Received by:							
Note: Any relevant building permits must be applied for and paid for and Community Development Office. 405-366-5311	separately in the Planning							
Address of Proposed Work:								
Applicant's Contact Information:								
Applicant's Name: Robert Fightmaster, Managing Membe	r Fight3 Investments LLC							
Applicant's Phone Number(s): 405-826-4651								
Applicant's E-mail address: rfightou@gmail.com								
Applicant's Address: 12513 Shire Lane OKC, OK 73170								
Applicant's relationship to owner: Contractor Engineer	r 🗆 Architect Owner							
Owner's Contact Information: (if different than applicant)								
Owner's Name:								
Owner's Phone Number(s):								
Owner's E-mail:								
Project(s) proposed: (List each item of proposed work requested	d. Work not listed cannot be							
reviewed.)								
1) Replace existing concrete tile siding with 8-inch wood composite siding on Replace siding on S side of garage and cover soffit and fascia with noncol	• •							
 <u>Replace 2 storm doors with, full view glass storm doors.</u> Appl 	-							
Z) <u>Replace Z sterin deers with, fair new glass sterin deers.</u> Appl	Svar tillough Authinistrative Dypas							
3) Replace window on SW side of home in back yard with aluminu	n windows that match							
previously replace windows on home. Replace exterior door to								
4) Cover existing aluminum porch covering with cedar planks and	uild columns to replace current							
aluminum columns. Replace fiberglass roof of structure with alu	minum panels.							
Supporting documents such as project descriptions, drawings	and pictures are required							
see checklist page for requirements.								
Authorization: I hereby certify that all statements contained within	• •							
documents and transmitted exhibits are true to the best of my know	•							
this proposal is approved and begun, I agree to complete the chang								
approved plans and to follow all City of Norman regulations for such								
City of Norman to enter the property for the purpose of observing an								
for the presentations and to ensure consistency between the approv								
completed project. I understand that no changes to approved plans approval from the Historic Preservation Commission or Historic Preservation	•							
Property Owner's Signature:	Date:							
 I authorize my representative to speak in matters i 								
agreement made by my representative regarding this proposal will b	e binding upon me.							
Authorized Representative's Printed Name: Robert Fightma	ster							
Authorized Representative's Signature:	Date: 09/07/2023							

The City of Norman Historic District Commission Certificate of Appropriateness Request **Application Checklist**

Supporting Documents

The purpose of supporting documentation is to illustrate existing conditions and proposed work as installed. Photos, site plan, elevation drawings, and specification sheets all need to clearly illustrate both the existing status as well as the proposed changes. It recommended that you meet with the Historic Preservation Officer prior to submitting your COA application request to ensure you have a complete application by deadline. Incomplete applications will not be forwarded for review by the Historic District Commission. Please contact staff to discuss project before submitting application (405)366-5392.

A. Documentation of Existing Conditions – Pictures of the appearance, condition and dimensions of any existing materials to be replaced or altered must be submitted.

🖾 B.	Site	Plan -	Show	existing	structure	es and	site e	element	s as	s well	as	propose	d struct	tures	and site
eleme	ents.	The fol	lowing	element	s should	be inc	cludeo	d on a s	ite p	olan d	Iraw	n to sca	le:		

	🖾 Buildings, garages, sheds					
	🛛 Fences, walls					
	Sidewalks, driveways, parking pads					
	☑ Patios, decks, Swimming pools, etc.					
	□ Trees (see F Tree Preservation Plan)					
	Note: Additions and New Structures need to s	show adjacent property structures and site elements				
	on the site plan.					
⊠ C.	Illustration of the proposed materials and c	lesign - Photos, drawings and/or samples must be				
provid	ed to illustrate the design, materials, and finish	nes of the proposed work.				
□ D.	Elevation drawings and floor plans indicati	ng existing and proposed features:				
	Exterior materials	Architectural Elements				
	🛛 Doors	🖌 Windows				
	Foundation materials, dimensions	I Porches, stoops, gutters				
	Roof, ridgeline, chimneys	□Steps, ramps, railings				
□ E.	Trees Preservation Plan showing (required	for major projects only, such as additions). This				
can be	e included on site plan. Show existing large sha	ade trees 8" in diameter or greater and existing				
ornam	nental trees greater than 4" in diameter. Descr	ption of how existing trees will be protected during				
constr	ruction needs to be provided. Any trees propos	sed to be removed must be indicated.				
□ F.	Additional Documents for New Constructio	n or Additions:				
	Streetscape elevation of existing structure and adjacent structures	□ Floor height of proposed house addition, comparison to adjacent properties				
	□ Color Photos of site - front, side and rear	□ Total height of proposed house or addition, comparison to neighboring structures				
	□ Site Plan to include structures, pavement, trees of subject property and adjacent properties	Elevation drawings of each façade of proposed house or addition				
	Topographical information if proposing to change grades of site	□ Floor Plans				





Replace existing damaged asbestos tile shingles with 8 inch overlap composite smooth wood siding. Replace storm door with full view aluminum glass door. Cover existing porch structure with 8 inch cedar planks. May be used to form a faux column or 8 x8 inch cedar columns may be installed. Cedar accent shutters added lower level windows. Home to be repainted.



Building Supplies / Siding & Stone Veneer / Composite Siding & Accessories / Composite Siding Panels

SmartSide 0.375-in x 8-in x 192-in Primed Wood Composite Lap Siding (10.45-Sq.Ft/Pi

Item #572643 Model #25797

Shop SmartSide **** * 265



This will be smooth wood siding, no grain.

5

12 ft. SM-Rib Galvalume Steel 29-Gauge Roof/Siding Panel in Slate

★★★★★ (30) ✓ Questions & Answers (82)













+3

Hover Image to Zoom

\Lambda Share 🛱 Pri

Item 2.

Andersen 2000 Series 36 in. x 80 in. White Universal Full View Aluminum Storm Door with Nickel Hardware

★★★★★ (1614) ✓ Questions & Answers (656)















Hover Image to Zoom

Building Supplies / Lumber & Composites / Appearance Boards

RELIABILT 1-in x 8-in x 8-ft Unfinished Cedar Board Item #803695 Model #CD10808



Windows & Doors / Windows / Single Hung Windows

RELIABILT 46000 Series 35.5-in x 47.5-in x 2.6-in Jamb Aluminum New Constructi Item #1790295 Model #ASHB3648RB





606 Miller Ave Norman, OK



Damaged siding on south side of home



Damaged siding on porch



Damaged siding on north side of home



Storm door to be replaced with Aluminum full view storm door.



Garage is covered in asbestos tile shingles. Back section shingles have been covered with old wood siding. All is in really bad condition. None appear to be original to property. Propose to replace with 8 inch overlap composite wood siding.

South side of garage is on property line with neighbor. This will require fire safety changes to this side of home. Cement fiber overlap non-combustible siding will be used on this section. Soffit to be added to cover rafters. Soffit and Fascia to be non combustible siding per code.





Full back view of Home



Back of home covered in 3 different types of siding. Asbestos shingles on kitchen. 2 different types of wood siding on other part of back of home. None appear to be original to property.

Propose to replace with 8 inch overlap composite wood siding.

Propose replacement of storm door on kitchen with Full view aluminum glass storm doors that match front of house.

Propose removal of door to bedroom/laundry room. Aluminum window that matches the other replaced windows would be installed.



Propose replace of window on 3rd bedroom/Laundry room to aluminum window that matches other replacement windows previously installed.



MEETING DATE: 10/02/2023

- **REQUESTER:** NATHAN VAUGHN
- **PRESENTER:** ANAIS STARR, PLANNER II
- ITEM TITLE: HD (23-33) CONSIDERATION OF THE APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF AN AMENDMENT TO CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS HD 23-08 FOR 904 MILLER AVENUE TO MODIFY THE PROPOSED DRIVEWAY AND PARKING PAD AREA OFF FERRILL AVENUE.

Property History

Historical Information

On March 6, 2023, the Historic District Commission approved the demolition of the historic structure on the parcel and the construction of new house and garage apartment.

Previous Actions

September 3, 2019 – A Certificate of Appropriateness request for the removal of the original wood windows and replacement with vinyl windows was denied.

November 21, 2019 – An appeal of the Historic District Commission's denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the original wood windows and replacement with vinyl windows was heard by the City Council. The Council denied the appeal. No further appeals were filed.

October 3, 2022 - Mr. Shumway, a prospective buyer of the property, sought feedback on the possibility of the demolition of the existing historic structure and replacement with new construction. The Commission indicated that this was possible but would need to see the design of the proposed structure to ensure it was compatible with the surrounding District. Mr. Shumway did not purchase property and therefore did not pursue a COA for demolition.

March 6, 2023 – A Certificate of Appropriateness request was approved for:

- a. Demolition of house;
- b. Construction of a new house;
- c. Construction of a new garage apartment;
- d. Installation of new driveway and parking area; and

Item 3.

e. Installation of rear parking pad off alleyway.

Zoning Designation: The property's current zoning designation is R-3, Multi-Family Dwelling District. This zoning allows for either a single family dwelling, single family dwelling with a garage apartment or a duplex. It should be noted that this lot is also located in the Central Norman Zoning Overlay District which limits bedroom count to three or less. Four or more bedrooms requires Special Use approval from City Council.

REQUEST - TO MODIFY PROPOSED DRIVEWAY AND PARKING PAD AREA OFF FERRILL AVENUE

Description

The property owner Nathan Vaughn, proposes to widen the driveway off Ferrill Avenue from the approved ten-foot width to eighteen-foot width, to allow for the ease of vehicular movement.

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

Sidewalks, Driveways, and Off-Street Parking

2.9 Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Front Driveway Location. Preserve and retain historic front driveways locations. New or expanded front driveways shall be perpendicular to the street, except in individual cases where there is historical documentation of an alternate configuration. Unless there is historic documentation otherwise, driveways shall be located along the property line on one side of the house.

.2 Driveway Width. Driveways shall be one car width, not to exceed 10 feet wide, unless there is historic documentation of an alternate configuration. Driveway width may vary as it approaches a garage in order to correspond to the width of the door opening.

.3 New Driveway Composition. Driveways shall be constructed from material allowed by the City Code. Existing gravel driveways may remain in place subject to other provisions in the City Code.

.4 **Ribbon Driveways**. Ribbon driveways are permitted to remain or may be newly installed in historic districts. The minimum width of ribbon paving is 18 inches.

.5 Driveway Approaches. Maintain the rhythm of existing approaches when introducing new driveways. Driveway approaches may be a maximum of 16 feet wide at the curb, narrowing to 10 feet at the sidewalk or property line.

.6 **Circular Drives**. Drives connecting to the street by two or more curb cut openings are not permitted in front yards or corner side yards unless demonstrated as historically present on the specific property in question.

.7 Shared Driveways. Historic driveways shared by two adjacent properties may be retained and preserved.

.8 Sidewalk Location. Sidewalks on private property shall be maintained in their traditional location, usually perpendicular to the street, unless there is historical documentation of another location.

.9 Sidewalks and Curbs. Public sidewalks and curbs on the street shall be constructed of finished concrete. Sidewalks and curbs on private property may be constructed of finished concrete, brick, or stone.

.10 New Paved Areas. New paved areas should not directly abut the principal site structure, significantly alter the site topography, or overwhelm in area the residential, landscaped character of a rear or side yard. Care must be taken that paved areas do not injure nearby trees by intruding onto their root areas. They shall be designed to be compatible in location, patterns, spacing, configurations, dimensions, and materials with existing walkways and driveways. Paved areas shall not overwhelm the principal structure.

.11 Rear Yard Area. New parking areas are permitted off alleyway with no visibility or limited visibility from the front right-of-way(s). Corner lots are considered to have two front elevations. Rear yard parking must meet Norman City Codes.

.12 Side Yard Parking Area. The establishment of parking areas adjacent to the side of historic structures is not allowed.

.13 Front Yard Parking Area. Parking areas in the front yard of the property are prohibited except within an existing driveway.

Staff Comments

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness by Administrative Bypass to increase the parking pad off the alleyway. He is limited on the amount of additional parking off the alleyway, as there is a telephone box and utility pole preventing any additional parking off the alleyway. Under the Core Area Parking regulations, once the alleyway parking has been installed to maximum extent available, he would then be allowed to install additional driveway width off of Ferrill Avenue.

An eighteen-foot driveway is not typical of historic driveways in the Miller Historic District. However, this parcel is being redeveloped with modern-day structures along with present-day expectations for vehicle parking. The parking area at the end of the driveway between the house and garage apartment meets the *Preservation Guidelines* for location since it is not located in the front yard or side yard. The proposal to remove concrete from the south edge of the parking pad area, will help reduce the impact to the neighbor's property to the south. The request to widen the driveway to eighteen-foot will allow for easier ingress and egress from the parking area located behind the house and prevent future parking issues.

Staff would note that there will not be any trees removed in order to install the drive or parking area.

The Commission would need to assess whether the requested additional driveway width will overwhelm the parcel. Furthermore, the Commission would need to determine if the request meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is compatible with the surrounding Miller Historic District.

Commission Action

Approve, deny, amend or postpone the request for an amendment to the Certificate of Appropriateness HD 23-08 for 904 Miller Avenue to modify the proposed driveway and parking pad area off Ferrill Avenue.

	Staff Only Use:				
The City of Norman Historic District Commission					
FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (COA)					
	Received by:				
Note: Any relevant building permits n Community Development Office. 405	arately in the Planning and				
Address of Proposed Work:					
Applicant's Contact Information:					
	HARRESON KENNODY HUMES				
	Number(s): 405 657 8987				
	address: NATHAN ~ MYHILHUMES				
	SS: GILLAHOMA CITY, OK 7314				
	Contractor Dengineer				
Owner's Contact Information: (if d					
	PAGE ST. PROPERTIES				
	Owner's Phone Number(s): 405 657 8187				
	UAT HAN a my HIL Homes . com				
Project(s) proposed: (List each iter reviewed.)	ork not listed cannot be				
1) REVISED PRIVEWAY LA					
2)					

3)

4)

Supporting documents such as project descriptions, drawings and pictures are required see checklist page for requirements.

Authorization:

hereby certify that all statements contained within this application, attached documents and transmitted exhibits are true to the best of my knowledge and belief. In the event this proposal is approved and begun, I agree to complete the changes in accordance with the approved plans and to follow all City of Norman regulations for such construction. I authorize the City of Norman to enter the property for the purpose of observing and photographing the project for the presentations and to ensure consistency between the approved proposal and the completed project. I understand that no changes to approved plans are permitted without prior approval from the Historic Preservation Commission or Historic Preservation Officer

Property Owner's Signature:

Date: 9/

37

C





APPROVED MARCH 6, 2023 (HD 23--08)





LOCATION MAP



GENERAL NOTES:

- DIMENSIONS GIVEN FOR REFERENCE ONLY. FOR FOOTING AND STEM WALL DIMENSIONS, REFER TO SHEET S.101.
- 2. IT IS RESPONSIBILITY OF THE GENERAL CONTRACTOR TO FIELD VERIFY LOCATION OF HOUSE PRIOR TO CONSTRUCTION.
- 3. SITE PLAN IS DRAWN AS ACCURATE AS POSSIBLE. IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT A CIVIL ENGINEER VERIFY LOT DIMENSIONS AND HOUSE LOCATION.
- JAGGERS HOME DESIGN ASSUMES NO RESPONSIBILITY FOR ACCURACY OR VARIANCES IN SITE DIMENSIONS. GENERAL CONTRACTOR MUST REVIEW CERTIFIED PLAT PLAN TO VERIFY ACCURACY.
- BUILDER SHALL INSPECT LOT BEFORE CONSTRUCTION BEGINS FOR CONDITIONS WHICH MAY AFFECT POSITIONING OF STRUCTURE ON LOT. CONDITIONS MAY INCLUDE BUT NOT LIMITED TO CURB DRAINS, MAN HOLES, LIGHT POLE, ELECTRICAL BOXES, HYDRANTS, TREES, ETC.

LOT COVERAGE STRUCTURES = 1882 sq. ft. CONCRETE =1524 sq. ft. TOTAL = 3406 sq. ft.



- **MEETING DATE:** 10/02/2023
- **REQUESTER:** HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
- PRESENTER: ANAIS STARR, PLANNER II
- **ITEM TITLE:** STAFF REPORT ON ACTIVE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND ADMINISTRATIVE BYPASS ISSUED SINCE AUGUST 7, 2023.



- **MEETING DATE:** 10/02/2023
- **REQUESTER:** HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
- PRESENTER: ANAIS STARR, PLANNER II
- ITEM TITLE: DISCUSSION OF PROGRESS REPORT REGARDING FY 2023-2024 CLG GRANT PROJECTS.



- **MEETING DATE:** 10/02/2023
- **REQUESTER:** HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
- PRESENTER: ANAIS STARR, PLANNER II
- ITEM TITLE: DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATION OF APPLICATION FOR FUNDS FOR THE FY 2024-2025 CLG PROGRAM WITH THE OKLAHOMA STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE.