

CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

MINUTES

PLANNING COMMISSION

Tuesday, October 14, 2025 at 3:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

I. Call to Order

Chairman Straus called the meeting to order at 3:03 PM.

II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Trish Martin

Jim Pettit

Michael Straus

Anneke Myers

Mary Dufina

Lee Finkel

Staff: David Lipovsky, Erin Evashevski, Richard Neumann

III. Pledge of Allegiance

IV. Approval of Minutes

a. September 9, 2025 Special Meeting

Motion to approve as written.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

b. September 9, 2025

Motion to approve as amended. Amendment was to correct 26b to 20.06

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

V. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to approve as submitted.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

VI. Correspondence

- a. Letter from Moira Croghan re: Grand Hotel Housing

Straus read the letter in opposition to the Grand Hotel housing project aloud. Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

- b. Letter re: Master Plan from Mackinaw City

Straus read the letter regarding Mackinaw City Master Plan aloud. Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

- c. Letter from Cristina Staats re: Grand Hotel Housing

Straus read the letter in opposition to the Grand Hotel housing project aloud. Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

- d. Letter from Christopher & Susan Dick re: Grand Hotel Housing

Straus read the letter opposing the Grand Hotel housing project aloud. Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

- e. Letter from Jack Dehring Jr. re: Grand Hotel Housing

Straus read the letter opposing the Grand Hotel housing project aloud. Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

VII. Staff Report

- a. HDC Meeting Summary

Finkel summarized the October 14th HDC meeting.

b. DPW Update

Allen Burt shared pictures of construction progress. Trickle towers are being demolished. The flat roofs are at the end of their life span and need to be replaced. Work is being done on the pipe gallery. Electrical work is being done. Blowers have been installed. Still on schedule to be done by late April. Pettit asked bottom line how much this is costing the City of Mackinac Island. Burt stated \$24,000,000.00.

VIII. Committee Reports

Straus reported that there was a public workshop for the housing zoning amendments. Adam Young is putting everything together for a special meeting in November. Schedule is to look at draft in November, hold a public hearing in December and submit to City Council in January. Motion to set the meeting on November 11, 2025, at 2:00 PM.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

IX. Old Business

a. R425-098-052 Grand Hotel 12 Dwelling Units Amendment to Boardinghouse

Straus stated the applicant is requesting boardinghouse use. A special land use would be required. Tamara Burns read aloud her special land use statement submitted with the amendment. Pettit asked if this would be on sewer. Burns stated it would require connection to the sewer. Fishbeck has confirmed there is capacity on the line. Pettit asked if there was discussion on kitchens. Straus stated they are requesting boardinghouse. The question is if this application is multi-family. Evashevski stated the applicant is contending this is boardinghouse use. Evashevski and Lipovsky stated it is multi-family, not boardinghouse. Evashevski stated the applicant is aware of the opinion of the city attorney as is the Planning Commission. The applicant can submit the special land use application and argue their case in the hearing. Jurcak argued that boardinghouse was approved for other applications. Straus pointed out that was R3, not R4. Pettit remembers in the DPW unit the REU's were calculated differently for each use in the building. Jurcak stated all the past applications they reviewed were labeled as boardinghouse and included kitchens. This included Hoban Hill. Burns is wondering the difference between the Hoban Hill boardinghouse and the proposed studio apartments. She wants to know where in the ordinance it is explained. Evashevski stated Hoban Hill is a mixed use multi-family and boardinghouse. Evashevski stated she doesn't know how they can discuss this without acknowledging the definition of dwelling unit. Evashevski read the definition aloud. She then read aloud the definition of boardinghouse. Straus stated in order to move forward a hearing must be scheduled. Myers asked about the section 18.08, Review Process. Reading this out loud it is clear it must go to the city architect for review. Motion to set the hearing for December 9, 2025 at 2:00 PM. The applicant accepts that today, October 14, 2025, starts the 100 day clock again.

Motion made by Straus, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

b. R321-007-008 Hoban Hill Condominiumization

Andrew Doud gave an update on Hoban Hill progress. Benser still needs to build his building. They would like to move forward with condominiumization for the common space. Myers stated per section 24.03, each street shall have a paved driving surface of asphalt or other approved material. Pettit does not think crushed gravel should be approved. Myers requested the specific gravel they would like to use. Doud does not want asphalt at this time because there is another building to be built. Myers stated section 24.04 requires a maintenance plan. Doud stated he is bringing that to the next meeting. Evashevski stated an easement relocation is needed for the water line easement. The line has been relocated but the plat map does not show the change. An agreement needs to be done with the City and applicant for the water line easement. There are issues with a potential existing easement for access to the property. Neil Hill is working on this. Evashevski asked for the master deed. Doud did not have it. Myers wants to compare the approved site plan and what Doud submitted today. Burt asked about water for Benser's building. Evashevski asked about the general common elements. The road is a turn around. Motion to table for more information.

Pettit asked if the Hoban Hill lighting was addressed. Doud confirmed the lighting has been corrected. Pettit stated it is very bright. Doud said he has no problem with less light and will look into it.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

X. New Business

a. R425-055-56-081 Gough Barn Demo

Lipovsky stated this is a barn in disrepair and needed to be removed. Lipovsky allowed the applicant to take it down due to the safety issue. The applicant followed the 7 items in the ordinance. Motion to approve the demolition. Myers would like a finding from Lipovsky regarding the 7 items that needed to be followed in the demolition process.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

b. MD25-069-083(H) GHMI Twilight Building Fence

Straus stated this was approved by HDC. Hopkins stated they would like to build a fence that matches Windermere to create a street scape along Hoban. The goal is to provide connection between Main Street and Hoban and clean up the clutter in the area that has become a safety issue. The fence would be within their property lines. The gate swings in and there is a removable fence in the middle. Jurcak stated it is

set back so when they bring a bike out it is not on the sidewalk. The utility pole will be outside of the fence. Myers asked Lipovsky to address the bush with the City and Streets Committee. Pettit asked if there will be public parking allowed. Jurcak stated no. They are allowing their employees only, with a special section for e-bikes. Straus asked about people used to parking there, and they park against the fence, who is responsible for moving those. Straus anticipates a problem with sled parking as well. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

c. C25-025-085(H) Verdes Enclose Patio

Straus stated the applicant would like to change their patio to an enclosed structure. Lipovsky stated it does meet all zoning requirements. Myers asked about the bottom lands. Green stated they own the bottom lands. Straus confirmed there will be an exit on the back side. It is not intended to be an entrance. Libby stated that exit is currently on the side. Straus confirmed it will not interfere with dock porter parking. Motion to approve. Myers asked about traffic during construction. Libby stated materials will be staged in the bike rental area. Myers confirmed there will be room for carriages and cars to turn around. Proposed start date is as soon as possible.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

XI. Public Comment

Ira Green commented that he would like to be on the list and would like to volunteer to landscape and maintain the area between the fence and the alley.

Angel Callewaert expressed support for Grand Hotel housing project. She stated she was an attorney and agreed that the use is boardinghouse.

Cristina Staats stated she is against the Grand proposal. She is against anything that changes the dwelling and variances that protect the neighborhood. She has another letter that she will submit today.

Dufina asked about Pierson approval. Pereny confirmed HOA and Grand approval was received.

Pettit stated he is disappointed. Employers say they are going to do things, and do not. Pettit believes we should have rental units registered and inspected by the City, just like St Ignace does. Pettit will no longer approve any more boardinghouse applications until we can prove our zoning ordinances are being followed. Dufina stated we have a section in our Ordinance regarding inspecting rentals but it just hasn't been done. Myers asked Evashevski to provide our ordinance to the Planning Commission. Pettit stated year-round residents are not happy with the City at all and are selling their homes and leaving the island. Burt stated Dombroski and Bradley used to do inspections. Myers stated we do

have a Fire Marshall and that would be his duty. Article 4, section 10 is our rental inspection ordinance. Evashevski stated this should be addressed with City Council. Myers asked Pereny to include the fact that as a Planning Commission alot of the city ordinances are not being followed as agreed to by owners, in the City Council update letter. Straus stated this also has to do with the penalty. If a penalty is too small they don't care. It was suggested a letter be sent to council regarding ordinances on the books aren't being followed, and the Planning Commission would like the city to develop a plan to reinstate rental/employee housing inspections. Also include deed restriction rules.

Dombroski, via Zoom, stated the Building inspector is done once occupancy is issued. It is intended for the fire department to do the inspections. The building inspector can go along if he wants. Pettit asked how Dombroski knew where to inspect. Dombroski stated the clerk is supposed to be informed of rentals. ~~[After checking with the Clerk, there is not a registry being kept at this time]~~

XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn at 4:43 PM.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel



Michael Straus, Chairman



Katie Pereny, Secretary