

CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

MINUTES

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Tuesday, June 10, 2025 at 1:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

I. Call to Order

Chairman Finkel called the meeting to order at 1:00 PM.

II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Lee Finkel

Lorna Straus

Nancy Porter

Peter Olson

Shannon Schueller

Lindsey White

Rick Linn

Staff: David Lipovsky, Dennis Dombroski, Erin Evashevski, Richard Neumann

III. Pledge of Allegiance

IV. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to approve as written.

Motion made by Olson, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

V. Approval of Minutes

a. May 13, 2025

Motion to approve as amended. Amendments are to add Chair name in "Call to Order" and clarifying "back side of dock" under "Shepler's Dock Traffic Flow Equipment"

Motion made by Straus, Seconded by Porter.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

VI. Correspondence

None.

VII. Committee Reports

None.

VIII. Staff Report

a. Job Status Report

Finkel stated the additions to Gatehouse marked "not been started", have been done. Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Straus, Seconded by Porter.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

b. MD25-030-038(H) Window Casing Replacement

Lipovsky stated this was for like for like repairs. Motion to approve the Staff Report.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Schueller.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

IX. Old Business

a. MD23-011-072(H) Lenox Handrail Amendment

Lipovsky stated this is a new code compliant white painted metal handrail to blend in with the building. Neumann did a favorable review. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Straus.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

X. New Business

a. C25-027-039(H) Trayser Big Store Flat Roof

Lipovsky stated the roof was leaking in numerous areas. This became a health and safety issue. The roof was replaced with a commercial grade rubber roof. Same color but different material. Neumann gave a favorable review. Dombroski stated normally this would come to the table but due to the safety issue leaking over the electric panel, they deemed it needed to get done sooner rather than later. Straus wants it on the record that yes we follow rules carefully but on occasion there are times that rules need to be bent a little. This is what we count on Dombroski and Lipovsky to do. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Straus.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

b. CD25-027-041(H) Trivisonno Barn Porch Board Replacement

The contractor summarized the project as replacing the front and rear porch boards on the deck on upstairs. The wood was not holding paint, rotting, and not safe to walk on. The applicant would like to use a composite material and paint. Schueller asked if boards are the same size. The contractor said a 1/4" larger. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Schueller, Seconded by Olson.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

Straus commented that it is helpful when we are told exact dimensions. We have to be careful that what the applicant says and what we approve are identical. Straus would like the application to be specific.

c. R325-017-042(H) Mackinac Island Bible Church Porch and Steps

The applicant spoke to Pereny and he has agreed to use the material suggested by Neumann which is Azek tongue and groove. Motion to approve contingent on tongue and groove composite material, as recommended by Neumann, be used.

Motion made by Olson, Seconded by White.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

d. MD25-067-044(H) Schunk Fence and Railing Replacement

Lindsey Shunk stated they want to replace the fence and 2nd story balcony. Material is the same. The new style will be straight. They would like to remove the trellis. Neumann did a favorable review on the fence. Lipovsky stated the new rail system will meet current code and does meet the Standards for Review. Olson noted that the railing is not part of the review. Neumann feels the railing is a historic detail that matches something on the front of house but didn't have enough information to make a call on the railing. Chippendale railing for something less.... Motion to approve the fence replacement and addition and table the house railing for further information to then be reviewed. Olson would like to separate the two items. Evashevski stated she believes the Motion on the table accomplishes that. Straus stated the scalloping is significant to the fence on the house and has been that way a long time. Schueller stated the fence is 38 years old. Olson withdrew his motion. Motion to split the discussion into two pieces; the fence and the porch railing.

Motion made by Olson, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

Motion by Olson, second by Finkel to approve the fence as presented by the applicant. Neumann gave a favorable review. Further discussion before the vote revealed that the Commission members felt strongly that the scalloped design should remain. Removing the scallop would be a departure from what is there. Schunk stated they wanted something a little shorter. They wanted a center gate instead of the trellis. They picked the style from another house in the historic district. Finkel asked if they would consider keeping the scallop design. Schunk stated she would rather not. Straus stated the proposed is more than a "little bit" of change. Porter stated she doesn't think we can force them to do the scallops. Neumann did do a favorable review. It was noted that the Commission members opinion is subjective and not historical. Linn asked how much it would cost to repair while this is debated. Schunk did not know. Several pieces were broken off in the ice storm. Roll call vote: Ayes: White, Porter. Nays: Finkel, Straus, Schueller, Olson, Linn. Motion fails. Motion by Straus, second by Olson to table the railing for further information. Neumann wants more comprehensive photos that show where it is and shots around the house showing how it fits with other railings around the house. Neumann stated that a layer of plexiglass could be installed on the inside to meet code. Roll call vote: Ayes: Finkel, White, Porter, Straus, Schueller, Olson, Linn. All in favor. Motion carries.

e. RS25-046-045(H) Gilmer Shed

Tamara Burns stated the Gilmers would like some storage space on their lot. The lot is quite small so they found a spot on the building with no windows to attach a 9'x12' shed. The same materials as the house would be used. Schueller asked if there is anything there now. Burns stated no and she thought there was a trellis against the house. Straus asked if it will be more visible from the street. Burns stated no. The owners would like to use the shed for storage of snowmobiles, ladders, etc. Neumann gave a favorable review. It fits in well and there is a wall it can fit in to without altering the resource. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Olson.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

XI. Public Comment

None

XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn at 2:07 PM.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

Straus acknowledged the two new HDC members; Rick Linn and Lindsey White.