

CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

MINUTES

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Tuesday, August 12, 2025 at 1:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

I. Call to Order

Chairman Finkel called the meeting to order at 1:06 PM.

II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Lee Finkel

Nancy Porter

Peter Olson

Shannon Schueller

Lindsey White

Rick Linn

ABSENT

Lorna Straus

Staff: David Lipovsky, Richard Neumann, Erin Evashevski

III. Pledge of Allegiance

IV. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to approve as amended. Amendments were to add closed session to discuss litigation at end of the meeting, and to remove e under New Business.

Motion made by White, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

V. Approval of Minutes

a. July 8, 2025

Motion to approve as written.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Olson.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

VI. Correspondence

None

VII. Committee Reports

None

VIII. Staff Report

a. CD25-019-058(H) Chambers Deck Repair

Lipovsky stated this is a like for like to replace rotted boards.

Motion to approve the Staff Report.

Motion made by White, Seconded by Linn.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

IX. Old Business

Evashevski stated we need to meet and talk about how we want to interact with staff and each other. She would like to get questions before meetings. Some items to discuss is the question of Use that came up last month and removal of personal items. we cannot change the Secretary of Interior Standards but obviously planning reviews Use. The Commission needs to figure out how they want to handle issues like that. Finkel stated with the various thoughts should we table the May house. Evashevski stated no need to table that application, but would she would like to table the discussion on Secretary of Interior Standard number 1 and the above items. Porter asked about change of use in contributing property, Rose Gazebo, she didn't remember that coming to HDC. Evashevski stated that is what we need to discuss. Olson stated he supports her suggestion having the discussion in general. Finkel agrees. Neumann stated Use might be a good education segment.

a. MD25-069-054(H) Doud Alteration from Home to Hotel

Doud stated he worked with Clement to take the connecting corridor and making it an addition to the house. Doud feels this looks much better. Doud did not bring the back porch plan and he will bring that next month. Neumann gave a positive review and Doud agrees with Evashevski and Neumann. Neumann stated relative to standard 1, Use, the HDC idea of use is does the use of the building have an impact on the historic character of the property. In this case the change isn't a residential use to say a commercial restaurant. Single family to hotel B&B type use is not as impactful. Overall he thinks this approach to expanding the house as an addition is far superior to the other concepts. It does a good job contrasting the existing to the addition. The porches on west balconies as proposed are individual, kind of modern treatment. A lot of historic t-shaped porches have wrap around porches. Roofs work well at the triangles in the center of the wing. Doud and Clement to work on that for review next month. Doud is asking for approval contingent on the porches. Porter stated she likes this plan much better. Porter felt the corridor disturbed the historic feel. Finkel stated the coordination of different peoples views is the best thing we do. Neumann agreed with Finkel's statement and commends their efforts. Motion to approve contingent on the approval of the porch alteration design.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

X. New Business

a. C25-014-061(H) Shepler's Dock Sculpture

This item is not to be reviewed based on the 2022 application amendment. Evashevski stated she was unaware of the 2022 change to not review personal items. White stated we should bring back items of certain sizes. Neumann stated he can't remember why it came about but thought it was about a bench at the library. He did question where this could lead to one day. Perhaps private vs public property would make a difference. Evashevski stated we need to discuss if they want any limits as to number or size of personal items. She believes this was brought up when a bird bath came to the HDC. What extent do you want to eliminate the need to discuss. The word sculpture is a very broad term. White suggested a size limit. Lipovsky thinks design is important in an HD as well. Porter stated the size could be affected by the space as well. Neumann stated what is appropriate or inappropriate when it comes to art is much more objective than a building or addition. Evashevski thinks this is not a straight forward discussion with many factors that could come in to play. Perhaps Neumann, Evashevski and Lipovsky could discuss. Olson thinks where there is a decided cast to an area, like this one, valuing its historic significance is important. We shouldn't shy away from it and is a discussion worth having. Add as an agenda item for the special meeting to discuss and Evashevski, Neumann and Lipovsky can discuss. Porter stated waiting in line on the dock she has heard some positive comments on the sculpture. Motion to schedule a special meeting to discuss this and other items. Schueller asked if they can put a list of questions together prior to the meeting. Evashevski stated that is a great idea. Neumann stated national park service has publications on many topics. Neumann to compile a list of possible publications. Evashevski about interactions with SHPO. she has reached out to see what their availability is. She will see if they can come talk to the Commission.

Motion made by Olson, Seconded by White.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

b. C25-012-062(H) Arnold Dock Sculpture

This item is not to be reviewed based on the 2022 application amendment

c. C25-039-063(H) East Dock Sculpture

This item is not to be reviewed based on the 2022 application amendment

d. C25-057-065(H) Mackinac Market Alterations

Barry Polzin stated this is a straight forward reuse of some of the building that is currently unused. The storage and unfinished space to be boarding house employee housing for Grands various properties. The bike parking will be on the first floor balcony, the condensing unit on second floor balcony, and several roof vents for bathrooms that won't be seen from street or harbor. Finkel asked if he considered outdoor charging. Polzin stated not under roof or near the structure. The charging stations should be at least 15' from a structure, on a non-combustible surface. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Olson.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

e. R325-001-066(H) Kutsop Under Deck

removed from agenda.

XI. Public Comment

None

Motion to go in to closed session to discuss ongoing litigation.

Motion made by White, Seconded by Linn.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

Motion to go back in to open session.

Motion made by White, Seconded by Linn.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn at 2:23 PM.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Schueller.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn