

## WORK SESSION COUNCIL MEETING

Tuesday, February 20, 2024 at 6:00 PM
City Council Chambers, 240 Lincoln Street
AGENDA

Join Zoom Meeting
https://us06web.zoom.us/j/81944958399?pwd=rrUFi6SbdoZYbxcjeiZRfbhlrObZWc. 1

Meeting ID: 81944958399
Passcode: 255990

1. NEW BUSINESS (NON-ACTION ITEMS)
A. Presentation on Forms of Municipal Government - Jason Grant, ICMA

Action item in 2023 Strategic plan
2. ADJOURNMENT

## Understanding Council-Manager Form of Government

## U.S. Constitutional Federal Republic

- Article IV - Guarantees Republican Form of Government (Representative Democracy)
- $10^{\text {th }}$ Amendment -

Powers not delegated to the to federal government are reserved for States


## Federal and State Powers

| Exclusive Federal Powers | Concurrent Powers | Exclusive State Powers |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Coin/print money | Taxation | Issue licenses |
| Regulate interstate and foreign <br> commerce/trade | Pass and Enforce Laws to <br> execute respective powers | Regulating intrastate commerce |
| Conduct Foreign Policy | Charter banks and corporations | Providing for public safety, <br> health, and welfare |
| Declare war | Take land for public use with just <br> compensation (eminent domain) | Conduct elections <br> Assemble, maintain, <br> and regulate a standing army <br> Establish courts |
| Establish a post office | Borrow money | Exeng <br> Ext any powers not delegated <br> to the federal government or <br> prohibited by the Constitution |
| Establishing rules of <br> naturalization | Build Roads/Infrastructure | Establish local governments |

## Understanding Local Government



No Uniform
Structure

High Degree of
Professionalism

Responds to
Immediate Needs

9
Differs by Location

Child of the State

## Forms of Local Government

| Form of Government | Number | Percent |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Council-Manager | 4,398 | $40.0 \%$ |
| Mayor-Council | 4,171 | $38.0 \%$ |
| Commission | 1,303 | $11.9 \%$ |
| Town Meeting | 1,056 | $9.6 \%$ |
| Representative Town Meeting | 59 | $0.5 \%$ |

Source: ICMA Survey Research 2018-2019;
municipalities with population of 2,500 or more

## Form of Government by Population

| Population Range | Mayor-Council | Council-Manager |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Over $1,000,000$ | $67 \%$ | $33 \%$ |
| $500,000-1,000,000$ | $54 \%$ | $43 \%$ |
| $250,000-499,999$ | $50 \%$ | $50 \%$ |
| $100,000-249,999$ | $26 \%$ | $74 \%$ |
| $50,000-99,999$ | $32 \%$ | $67 \%$ |
| $25,000-49,999$ | $38 \%$ | $61 \%$ |
| $10,000-24,999$ | $44 \%$ | $54 \%$ |
| $5,000-9,999$ | $44 \%$ | $54 \%$ |
| $2,500-4,999$ | $55 \%$ | $44 \%$ |
| Under 2,500 | $57 \%$ | $42 \%$ |

## Manager v. Mayor as CEO

| Manager | Mayor |
| :--- | :--- |
| Hire/Fire all department heads based on <br> professional qualifications | Hire/Fire all department heads as at-will positions |
| Assure effective and efficient operation of <br> government to achieve Council goals and <br> objectives | Assure operation of government achieves goals <br> and objectives of the mayor |
| Offers policy recommendation at request of <br> Council, but has no power to overturn or solicit <br> public influence on Council decisions | Offers policy recommendation to Council whether <br> requested or not, can veto any Council decision, <br> and seeks public influence on Council decisions |
| Can be removed at any time by simple majority <br> vote of Council | Cannot be removed from office for the duration of <br> their term regardless of performance |
| Obligated to fully and faithfully administer <br> government to achieve Council adopted outcomes | No requirement to achieve the adopted outcomes <br> of Council |

## Role of Mayor

| Council-Manager | Mayor-Council |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Advance a vision for the city | Advance a vision for the city |  |
| Serve as official spokesperson for the city | Serve as official spokesperson for the city |  |
| Serve as ceremonial head of the city | Serve as ceremonial head of the city |  |
| Meet with constituents | Meet with constituents |  |
| Identify solutions to citywide problems | Identify solutions to citywide problems |  |
| Develop policy recommendations for Council <br> consideration | Develop policy recommendations for Council <br> consideration |  |
| Set Council agenda and run oversee all Council <br> meetings | Run daily operation of Government and <br> oversee all department heads |  |
| Vote on all items before Council with a city- <br> wide perspective | Veto any Council action they disagree with to <br> require $2 / 3$ majority of Council to approve | 9 |

## Form of Government Considerations

## Separate or Unified Powers

Calls for separation of powers are generally made in the name of expediency.

Calls for unified power are generally made in the name of effectiveness.


## Administration-Politics Dichotomy

The debate on form of government generally centers upon whether the Chief Executive should be a professional with the proven knowledge, skills and abilities necessary to run a government organization or an individual popularly elected by the people to serve the will of majority voters.


## Accountability

The desire to hold the executive accountable for effective, efficient, or equitable governance is the primary concern raised in form of government challenges.


## Corruption

Distrust in government is growing at all levels (federal, state, and local). While local government still fares better than trust in federal or state government, it is on the decline. Fears of corruption from elected officials and government employees is a major issue in form of government debates.


## Representation

Operating under a republican form of government (representative democracy), the issue of representation in government is of particular concern for communities.

Communities considering changes to their form of government often seek to address how to assure government represents the needs and interests of the people


## Partisanship

Form of government is itself a nonpartisan issue. However, advocates for and against council-manager or mayorcouncil governments often seek solutions to either reduce or increase political partisanship in the administration of programs and services.


## Council-Manager Structure

## Collaborative Government



- Mayor is accountable for providing strong leadership that results in a clear direction and policy guidance for the Council.
- Council is accountable for determining what outcomes are best suited to address the needs and interests of the people they are elected to represent.
- City Manager is accountable for the effective and efficient operation of government to deliver on the goals adopted by the elected body.


## How It Works

## Appointing a Manager

- Manager appointed by majority vote of council for a definite or indefinite term
- Council (inclusive of the mayor) may terminate the manager by a majority vote at any time
- Appointment should be based on professional experience, administrative qualifications, and education. Political affiliations should not influence appointment.



## How It Works

Hiring Staff


- Elected Body Hires Manager/Administrator
- Manager/Administrator hires Department heads
- Department heads hire professional staff


## How It Works

## Budget Process

- In consultation with the elected body, the manager prepares a budget for its consideration based on the elected body's adopted strategic priorities
- Elected body makes any changes to the proposed budget it deems necessary and relevant
- Manager is responsible for administering the budget as ultimately approved by the elected body.


## Role of City Manager

- Works in partnership with elected officials to offer professional expertise and experience for consideration in their policy decisions
- Provides strategic planning to support long-term, community-wide benefits for the community rather than short-term political gains
- Assures that staff at all levels of government have the knowledge, skills, and abilities to deliver the programs and services to the people
- Support the Council by assuring its vision and policies are carried out fully and faithfully by staff regardless of personal or political sentiment toward the Council's vision or policies


## WalletHub's Best Run Cities

Where Council-Manager Cities Fare Better:
\$ ECONOMY

| \% in Top 10 | \% in Top 25 |
| :--- | :--- |
| CM: $38 \%(8)$ | CM: $71 \%(15)$ |
| MC: $7 \%(2)$ | MC: $36 \%(10)$ |

\% in Top 10 \% in Top 25 CM: 19\% (4) CM: 62\% (13) MC: 18\% (5) MC: 39\% (11)
\% in Top 10 \%in Top 25 CM: 33\% (7) CM: 62\% (13) MC: 11\% (3) MC: 43\% (12)

Where Mayor-Council Cities Fared Better:
INFRASTRUCTURE \& \% in Top 10 CM: 10\% (2)
POLLUTION CONTROL MC: $25 \%(7) \quad$ Mc: $57 \%(16)$

## Research Findings

- Municipal governments with a higher concentration of powers (i.e. mayor-council) tend to have more bureaucratized administrations (Lupuente).
- Mayor-Council cities are less likely to implement cost-saving strategies when compared to municipalities with the council-manager form of government (Aguado).
- Mayor-council cities are more likely to offer ineffective financial declines in population and economic base when compared to financial incentives implemented in council-manager cities (Feiock, Jeong, \& Kim).
- Council-Manager cities have stronger budgetary solvency compared with mayor-council cites. (Jimenez).
- Council-manager governments have been shown to be more likely than mayor-council governments to utilize sophisticated revenue forecasting and expenditure analysis techniques, prepare multiyear budgets, emphasize strategic planning and long-term policy priorities, realize efficiency gains, lower per capita spending for basic services, and engage in other practices designed to promote long-term budget stability (Marlowe).


## Research Findings

- Council-Manager governments $57 \%$ less likely to have corruption convictions (Nelson \& Afonso).
- Council-Manager governments more likely to make economic development decisions based on strategic plan guidance (Feiock \& Kim).
- Political influence of a mayor on the appointment of the chief administrative officer has a negative influence on the financial outcomes of local government (Lee, Park, \& Butler).
- Municipalities headed by a city manager are associated with increased bond ratings (Dove).
- Council-Manager cities tend to be equipped with more advanced information systems, which lead to improved efficiency over mayor-council cities (Kim)


## Key Questions for Consideration

## Key Questions to Consider

- Should the chief executive officer of the city be accountable to the people on a daily basis or to the electorate once every four years?



## Key Questions to Consider

- Should department heads be hired based on qualifications or political allegiance?



## Key Questions to Consider

- Do organizations thrive with consistent and effective service, or with regular turnover at the most senior-level positions?



## Key Questions to Consider

- Is running the city a full-time job or part-time activity?



## Questions?

## Bibliography

Aguado, N. Alexander. 2018. "Mayor-Council Form of Government and Policy Responses in Times of Economic Travail." Politics \& Policy 46(5): 714-30.

Dove, John. 2017. "Local Government Type and Municipal Bond Ratings: What's the Relationship?" Applied Economics 49(24): 2339-51.

Feiock, Richard C., Moon-Gi Jeong, and Jae-Hoon Kim. 2003. "Credible Commitment and Council-Manager Government: Implications for Policy Instrument Choices." Public Administration Review 63(5): 616-25.

Feiock, Richard C., and Jae-Hoon Kim. 2000. "Form of Government, Administrative Organization, and Local Economic Development Policy." Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory 11(1): 29-49.

Jimenez, Benedict S. 2020. "Municipal Government Form and Budget Outcomes: Political Responsiveness, Bureaucratic Insulation, and the Budgetary Solvency of Cities." Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory 30(1): 161-77.

## Bibliography

Kim, Yong-Mi. 2003. "Do Council-Manager and Mayor-Council Types of City Governments Manage Information Systems Differently? An Empirical Test." International Journal of Public Administration 26(2): 119-34.

Lee, Hakyeon, Jinsol Park, and J.S. Butler. 2021. "Forms of Government and Municipal Financial Performance." Public Money \& Management.

Lupuente, Victor. 2010. "A Tale of Two Cities: Bureaucratisation in Mayor-Council and Council-Manager Municipalities." Local Government Studies 36(6): 739-57.

Marlowe, Justin. 2005. "Fiscal Slack and Counter-Cyclical Expenditure Stabilization: A First Look at the Local Level." Public Budgeting \& Finance (Fall).

Nelson, Kimberly L., and Whitney B. Afonso. 2019. "Ethics by Design: The Impact of Form of Government on Municipal Corruption." Public Administration Review 79(4): 591-600.

