



Historic Preservation Commission - Regular Meeting AGENDA

Tuesday, June 15, 2021 at 4:30 PM
Ketchum City Hall
480 East Avenue North, Ketchum, ID 83340

In recognition of the Coronavirus (COVID-19), members of the public may observe the meeting live on the City's website at ketchumidaho.org/meetings. If you would like to comment on an agenda item, please submit your comment to participate@ketchumidaho.org by noon the day of the meeting. Comments will be provided to the Historic Preservation Commission.

CALL TO ORDER

CONSENT CALENDAR—ACTION ITEMS

1. Minutes of June 1, 2021.

PUBLIC HEARINGS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF – ACTION ITEMS

2. ACTION ITEM: Recommendation to review and adopt proposed Ketchum Criteria for designating historic structures and evaluate the list of 26 buildings on the Historic Buildings List

ADJOURNMENT

Any person needing special accommodations to participate in the meeting should contact the City Clerk's Office as soon as reasonably possible at 726-3841. All times indicated are estimated times, and items may be heard earlier or later than indicated on the agenda.



Historic Preservation Commission - Regular Meeting MINUTES

Tuesday, June 01, 2021 at 4:30 PM
Ketchum City Hall
480 East Avenue North, Ketchum, ID 83340

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 4:33 PM by Chairman Mead.

PRESENT

Chairman Mattie Mead via teleconference
Vice-Chair Wendolyn Holland via teleconference
Commissioner Jennifer Cosgrove
Commissioner Jakub Galczynski
Commissioner Rick Reynolds

CONSENT CALENDAR—ACTION ITEMS

1. Minutes of May 18, 2021

Motion to approve the Minutes of May 18, 2021.

Motion made by Vice-Chair Holland, Seconded by Commissioner Reynolds.

Voting Yea: Chairman Mead, Vice-Chair Holland, Commissioner Cosgrove, Commissioner Galczynski, Commissioner Reynolds

STAFF AND COMMISSION COMMUNICATIONS (Historical Preservation Commission Deliberation, Public Comment may be taken)—ACTION ITEMS

2. Discussion and direction to staff on the following:
 1. Review, discuss and establish the City of Ketchum criteria that qualifies a property to be placed on the Historic Building List.
 2. Review and discuss the Historic Building List consisting of 26 properties to determine if the properties should remain on the list or if additional properties should be added to the list based on the criteria the Commission has identified.
 3. Set a hearing date for public review and comment on items 1 & 2.

Director Suzanne Frick outlined the procedure to the Commission as follows:

- 1) Define Ketchum's criteria.
- 2) Define how each property meets that criteria.

Langston Guettinger of Logan-Simpson went over the criteria for a site to be considered a Ketchum Heritage Site.

1. Traditional Architecture
2. Community Tradition
3. Associated with a significant event or person
4. Eligible for National Historic Register.
5. Workmanship and feeling

The Commission reviewed the criteria used by other cities.

Boise, ID used the following criteria to determine significance:

1. Historical or cultural importance, 2. Architectural importance, and 3. Archeological importance. The Commission discussed the archeological aspect of preservation.

Lafayette, CO: Guettinger went over the selection criteria used by Lafayette, CO. Chair Mead liked the criteria used by this city. Commissioner Galczynski agreed. There was a discussion of the word *Feeling* vs the word *Concept* in describing the design of a building.

Taos, NM: After noting the criteria from Taos, NM only required one area of significance for a property to be considered for preservation, the Commission discussed the validity of multiple factors. Langston pointed out that one factor was enough to be considered, but more were needed to preserve. Vice-Chair Holland agreed with the item *to be suitable for preservation*. Commissioner Reynolds agreed. Commissioner Cosgrove and Vice-Chair Holland thought the Commission did not have the expertise to determine if a building was *Suitable* for preservation.

Tuscon, AR: There was a discussion of the code from Tuscon, AR. Commissioner Cosgrove and Vice-Chair Holland agreed that the criteria of how location and context of a building was relevant to preservation in Ketchum.

Director Frick suggested Staff and Logan-Simpson would develop a list of criteria for the Commission's discussion and approval.

Next meeting to be held on Tuesday, June 15th at 4:30 PM. The list for review would be delivered to the Commission by June 8th.

Vice-Chair Holland thought some properties that had been removed from the list might be eligible to be added back. She thought the OLDEST structure on the list should be considered by the criteria of age alone (i.e. Bonning Cabin). She proposed a title search and history for each property in the Community Core. She thought we should do the research to uncover history not currently known.

Director Frick suggested getting an estimate for title search for the 26 properties to see if it would be economically feasible.

Commissioner Galczynski noted the GIS did not have associated dates. He suggested a GIS electronic search of the oldest properties as they may be overgrown and easily overlooked.

ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn at 6:15 PM.

Motion made by Commissioner Cosgrove, Seconded by Commissioner Reynolds.

Voting Yea: Chairman Mead, Vice-Chair Holland, Commissioner Cosgrove, Commissioner Galczynski, Commissioner Reynolds



City of Ketchum

June 15, 2021

Historic Preservation Commissioners
City of Ketchum
Ketchum, Idaho

Recommendation To Review and Adopt Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures and Review Historic Building List

Recommendation and Summary

Staff is recommending the Commission review and adopt the Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures and adopt the following motion:

I move to adopt the Ketchum Criteria for designating historic structures.

Introduction and History

At the June 1, 2021, meeting, the Commission reviewed and provided direction on criteria to be used for designating structures that will be placed on the Historic Building List. These criteria will be used to evaluate the 26 buildings currently on the Historic Building List.

Attachment A is the proposed criteria based on Commission review and comments at the last meeting.

Analysis

Staff is requesting Commission review and adoption of the proposed criteria. Once the criteria are established, staff is recommending the Commission use the criteria to evaluate the 26 building currently on the Historic Building List.

To assist the Commission evaluation of the 26 buildings and any other building that may be considered for the list, staff has prepared an evaluation matrix (Attachment B).

Attachments:

- A: Proposed Ketchum Criteria for Historic Structures
- B: Evaluation matrix

Designation criteria for structures on the Historic Building List.

The following Primary Criteria shall be used to determine if a structure shall be placed on the Historic Building List:

1. *Primary Criteria Historic Building.* Historic buildings must be at least fifty (50) years old and meet one or more of the criteria for architectural, social/historic or geographic/environmental significance as described below. A historic building may be exempt from the age standard if it is found to be exceptionally important in other significant criteria.
2. *Primary Criteria Historic Buildings or Sites.* Historic buildings or sites shall meet one or more of the following criteria:

A. Architectural criteria.

- (1) Exemplifies specific elements of an architectural style or period;
- (2) Example of the work of an architect or builder who is recognized for expertise nationally, state-wide, regionally, or locally;
- (3) Demonstrates superior craftsmanship or high artistic value;
- (4) Represents an innovation in construction, materials or design;
- (5) Style particularly associated with Ketchum or one of its neighborhoods;
- (6) Represents a built environment of a group of people in an era of history;
- (7) Pattern or grouping of elements representing at least one of the above criteria; or
- (8) Significant historic remodel.

B. Social/historic criteria.

- (1) Site of historic event that had an effect upon society;
- (2) Exemplifies cultural, political, economic or social heritage of the community;
- (3) Associated with a notable person or the work of a notable person; or
- (4) Is valued by the Ketchum community as an established or familiar visual or cultural feature due to its architectural history, siting, cultural characteristics or

heritage.

C. Geographic/environmental criteria.

- (1) Enhances sense of identity of the community;
 - (2) Is an established and familiar natural setting or visual feature of the community; or
 - (3) Relates positively to buildings in its immediate vicinity in terms of scale, size, massing, etc. such that its removal would be an irreparable loss to the setting.
3. *Primary Criteria for All Sites.* All sites will be evaluated for their physical integrity using the following criteria, but a site need not meet all of the following criteria:
- A. Shows character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the community, region, state or nation;
 - B. Retains original design features, materials and/or character;
 - C. Is in the original location or same historic context after having been moved; and
 - D. Has been accurately reconstructed or restored based on documentation.

Historic Preservation Designation Criteria - Ranking Matrix

Purpose:

This ranking matrix has been prepared for the Historic Preservation Commission as a tool to assist in determining whether a proposed building qualifies to be placed on the City of Ketchum Historic Building List. A specific ranking or certain total of points does not dictate placement on the list.

Eligibility:

For a building to be placed on the Historic Building List, it must qualify for all three primary criteria.

Criteria 1 - Historic Building

Criteria 2 - Significance

Must meet a minimum of one subcriteria for one significance area (architectural, social/historic, or geographic/environmental).

Criteria 3 - Physical Integrity

Must meet a minimum of one subcriteria for physical integrity.

Ranking:

Primary Criteria 1: Historic Building

Place an "X" in the box for properties 50 years or older.

Primary Criteria 2: Significance and Primary Criteria 3: Integrity

Rank each building/site on a scale of 0-3 using the following assumptions. Please attempt to be as consistent in the use of each ranking level as possible.

0 - does not meet criteria

1 - minimally meets criteria

2 - meets criteria

3 - exceeds criteria

NOTES:

This section is for Commission members to put their thoughts or comments on the rankings.

| Common Name | Street Address | CRITERIA 1 | CRITERIA 2 | | | | | | | | | | | | CRITERIA 3 | | | | NOTES: | | | |
|---------------------------------------|--|-------------------|------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|--------------------------|---|---|---|--------------------------|---|---|--------------------|--------|---|---|---|
| | | Historic Building | Architectural Criteria | | | | | | | | Social/Historic Criteria | | | | Geographic/Environmental | | | Physical Integrity | | | | |
| | | | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 3 | A | | B | C | D |
| Example: My House | 1234 5th St | X | 0 | 2 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | recent restoration based on historic photographs, but not really representing innovations. Associated with a notable person, but should be discussed further on whether that criteria is met. |
| PROPOSED LIST | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Bonning Cabin | 531 5 th Street East | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Thornton House | 560 East Avenue North | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| E.B Williams House | 520 East Avenue North | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Jack Frost Motel | 591 4 th Street East | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| George Castle Cabin | 431 ½ Walnut Avenue | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Michel's Christiania Restaurant | 303 Walnut Avenue | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Brass Ranch House | 571 2 nd Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| McCoy/Gooding/Miller House | 480 East 2 nd Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Lon Price/Esther Fairman House | 180 Leadville Avenue North | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| St. Mary's Catholic Church | 380 Leadville Avenue North | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Fagan Property | 411 Sun Valley Road | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Comstock & Clark Mercantile | 300 North Main Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Pioneer Saloon | 308 North Main Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Helm Property | 340 North Main Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Former Post Office | 460 North Main Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Bert Cross Cabin | 271 ½ Leadville Avenue North | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Ketchum Kamp Hotel | 220 North Main Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Lewis Bank | 180 North Main Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| First Telephone Co. | 340 North 2 nd Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Dynamite Shed | 271 Sun Valley Road | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Battis house | 431 Washington Avenue | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| McAtee House | 380 1 st Avenue | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Forest Service Park | Between River and 1 st Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Community Library/Gold Mine | 331 Walnut Avenue | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Thrift Shop | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Greenhow & Rumsey Store (NRHP listed) | 211 North Main Street | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Horace Lewis Home/Elephant's Perch | 280 East Avenue North | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |