



## AGENDA

### PUBLIC PARTICIPATION INFORMATION

Public information on this meeting is posted outside City Hall.

**We welcome you to watch Commission Meetings via live stream.**

You will find this option on our website at [www.ketchumidaho.org/meetings](http://www.ketchumidaho.org/meetings).

**If you would like to comment on a public hearing agenda item, please select the best option for your participation:**

1. Join us via Zoom (*please mute your device until called upon*).  
**Join the Webinar:** <https://ketchumidaho-org.zoom.us/j/82965953611>  
Webinar ID: 829 6595 3611
2. Address the Commission in person at City Hall.
3. Submit your comments in writing at [participate@ketchumidaho.org](mailto:participate@ketchumidaho.org) (*by noon the day of the meeting*).

*This agenda is subject to revisions. All revisions will be underlined.*

---

### CALL TO ORDER:

### ROLL CALL:

### COMMUNICATIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS:

### CONSENT AGENDA:

*Note re: ALL ACTION ITEMS - The Commission is asked to approve the following listed items by a single vote, except for any items that a commissioner asks to be removed from the Consent Agenda and considered separately.*

1. ACTION ITEM: Approval of the October 17, 2023 Minutes
2. ACTION ITEM: Recommendation to review and approve the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Decision for the 180 N Leadville Relocation Request to Demolish a Historic Structure Application.

### PUBLIC HEARING:

### NEW BUSINESS:

3. Main Street Reconstruction and Listed Historic Structures Discussion

4. 2024 HPC work plan, grant, and GIS discussion

**ADJOURNMENT:**



CITY OF KETCHUM  
MEETING MINUTES  
OF THE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
Tuesday, October 17, 2023

---

**CALL TO ORDER:**

Spencer Cordovano called to order at 4:30 p.m. *(00:00:02 in video)*

**Roll Call:**

Wendolyn Holland \*via zoom  
Rick Reynolds  
Spencer Cordovano  
Jakub Galczynski

**Also Present:**

Morgan Landers – Director of Planning and Building  
Adam Crutcher – Associate Planner  
Heather Nicolai – Planning Technician/Office Administrator

**COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS:**

None

**CONSENT AGENDA:**

1. **ACTION ITEM: Approval of September 6, 2023 Minutes** *(00:00:35 in video)*

**Motion made by Rick Reynolds to approve the September 6, 2023 Minutes; Seconded by Jakub Galczynski.** *(00:00:46 in video)*

**MOVER:** Rick Reynolds

**SECONDER:** Jakub Galczynski

**AYES:** Wendolyn Holland, Spencer Cordovano, Jakub Galczynski & Rick Reynolds.

**NAYS:** None

**RESULT: UNANIMOUSLY ADOPED**

**PUBLIC HEARING:** *(00:00:55 in video)*

2. **ACTION ITEM: Review and approve the Request to Demolish a Historic Structure for the proposed relocation of the structure located at 180 N Leadville Avenue** *(00:01:00 in video)*

- Staff presentation – Adam Crutcher, Associate Planner *(00:01:10 in video)*
- Applicant Presentation, Lucas Winter, Jarvis Group, Architect *(00:16:10 in video)*
- Applicant Presentation, Michelle Griffith, ARCH Community Housing Trust –

*(00:19:10 in video)*

- Commission Questions for staff & applicant *(00:20:47 in video)*

**PUBLIC COMMENT OPENED** *(00:32:20 in video)*

**PUBLIC COMMENT CLOSED** *(00:32:55 in video)*

- Commission comments and questions *(00:33:05 in video)*
- Public Comment reopened *(00:53:30 in video)*
  - Perry Boyle *(00:53:45 in video)*
- Public Comment closed *(00:55:27 in video)*
- No response from applicant *(00:55:30 in video)*
- Commission comments and questions *(00:55:40 in video)*
- Applicant response – Michelle Griffith, ARCH Community Housing Trust *(01:14:15 in video)*
- Commission deliberations *(01:14:30 in video)*

Brief recess at 5:53pm *(01:20:35 in video)*

Restart @ 5:56pm *(01:20:40 in video)*

- Commission questions to staff of options, purview *(01:20:40 in video)*
- Commission deliberations *(01:24:00 in video)*

**Motion made by Rick Reynolds to approve the Request to Demolish a Historic Structure for the proposed relocation of the structure located at 180 N Leadville Avenue.** *(01:28:39 in video)*

**MOVER:** Rick Reynolds

**SECONDER:**

**AYES:**

**NAYS:**

**RESULT: MOTION FAILED TO BE SECONDED**

**Motion made by Wendolyn Holland to deny the Request to Demolish a Historic Structure for the proposed relocation of the structure located at 180 N Leadville Avenue. Seconded by Jakub Galczynski.** *(01:30:20 in video)*

**MOVER:** Wendolyn Holland

**SECONDER:** Jakub Galczynski

**AYES:** Wendolyn Holland, Spencer Cordovano & Jakub Galczynski

**NAYS:** Rick Reynolds

**RESULT: MOTION ADOPTED 3-1**

**NEW BUSINESS:**

General Updates, announcements and highlights from staff *(01:31:40 in video)*

**ADJOURNMENT:** *(01:34:33 in video)*

Motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:10 p.m.

**MOVER:** Rick Reynolds

**SECONDER:** Jakub Galczynski

**AYES:** Wendolyn Holland, Spencer Cordovano, Jakub Galczynski & Rick Reynolds.

**NAYS:** None

**RESULT: UNANIMOUSLY ADOPED**

---

Spencer Cordovano, Chairperson  
Historic Preservation Commission

---

Morgan Landers, Director Planning and Building  
City of Ketchum



City of Ketchum  
Planning & Building

IN RE: )  
 )  
**180 N Leadville Relocation** ) **KETCHUM HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
**Request to Demolish a Historic Structure** ) **FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, AND**  
 ) **DECISION**  
 )  
**Date: November 7, 2023** )  
 )  
**File Numbers: H23-084** )

PROJECT: 180 N Leadville Relocation Request

FILE NUMBER: H23-084

APPLICATION TYPE: Request to Demolish a Historic Structure

REPRESENTATIVE: Lucas Winter

PROPERTY OWNER: 180 Leadville LLC (Bob Reniers)

REQUEST: Proposal to relocate existing residence out of Ketchum city limits to a location undetermined

LOCATION: 180 N Leadville Avenue (Ketchum Townsite: Lot 4 Blk 22)

ZONING: Mixed-Use Subdistrict of the Community Core (CC-2)

**RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS**

The Historic Preservation Commission held a public hearing and considered the Request to Demolish a Historic Structure for the proposed relocation of the Price/Fairman residence located at 180 N Leadville Avenue during their meeting on October 17<sup>th</sup>, 2023. After considering the project plans, staff’s analysis, and the applicant’s presentation, and holding the required public hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission denied the request with a vote of 3-1.

Public Hearing Notice

The public hearing notice was published in the Idaho Mountain Express on September 27<sup>th</sup>, 2023. A public hearing notice was mailed to adjacent properties within 300 feet of the project site on September 27<sup>th</sup>, 2023. A public hearing notice was posted on the project site and the City’s website on September 27<sup>th</sup>, 2023.

## BACKGROUND

The applicant, 180 N Leadville LLC, has submitted a request to relocate a historic structure located at 180 N Leadville Ave (Ketchum Townsite Lot 4 Blk 22) within the Mixed Use Subdistrict of the Community Core (CC-2) Zone. The building was historically a single-family residence occupied by Alonzo Price & Esther Fairman, longtime Ketchum residents in the 20th Century. The request proposes to relocate the residence to a different location within Blaine County.

The Alonzo Price/Esther Fairman Residence is a 1.5 story private residence with a detached single car garage constructed in 1929 by Alonzo Price and his family. Price was the resident agent of the Philadelphia Smelter and Idaho Mining & Smelting Company in the early 1900s and owned ranch property along Warm Springs Creek. Price sold this ranch property in 1947 to a group of investors, including Owen Simpson, who then developed the area into Warm Springs Ranch, a tourist destination and resort. Esther Fairman was one of three children of Alonzo Price and lived in the residence until 1998. Fairman was involved in many activities throughout the Wood River Valley including the founding of the Presbyterian Church of the Big Wood (across from YMCA), legal secretary for George Kneeland, and 76-year member of Snowdrop Rebekah Lodge. Rebekah Lodges were, and continue to be, locations for the International Association of Rebekah Assemblies (IARA). This organization was created in 1851 for women to practice humanitarianism particularly in assisting orphans & the elderly.

The residence remains in the same location as it was built and is an example of settlement era architecture of the 1920's. As stated in the 2005 Walsworth study, "The exterior walls of both buildings are clad in clapboard siding and the front-gable roof is covered with metal sheeting and has overhanging rafters and eaves. Architectural elements such as windows and doors are historically correct, and intact landscaping features reflect the 1920's settlement period." The residence was put on the historic building/site list by the HPC as the building met most, if not all, integrity criteria and met Architectural criteria 3.a.1 and Social/Historic criteria 3.b.4 sections of the historic building/site standards. These criteria state:

*"Exemplifies specific elements of a recognized architectural style or period or a style particularly associated with Ketchum neighborhoods" (Architectural criteria 3.a.1)*

*"Is valued by the Ketchum community as an established or familiar visual or cultural feature due to its architectural history, siting, massing, scale, cultural characteristics, or heritage such that its removal would be irreparable loss to the setting" (Social/Historic criteria 3.b.4)*

## FINDINGS OF FACT

The Historic Preservation Commission having reviewed the project record, provided notice, and conducted the required public hearing does hereby find that the project does not conform to applicable standards and criteria as set forth in Chapter 17.20 – Historic Preservation. The commission discussed the project’s conformance with the alteration/demolition criteria and whether the proposed relocation met standards. The Commission found the relocation to not be in conformance with the alteration/demolition criteria. Therefore, the Commission does hereby make and set forth these Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision as follows:

### Findings Regarding Review Criteria for Requests to Alter or Demolish a Historic Structure

*17.20.030.C.1 - Is the structure of historic or architectural value or significance and does it contribute to the historic significance of the property within the Community Core?*

The Price/Fairman residence is one of the 24 structures on the Historic Building List adopted by the HPC on October 19, 2021. The 2005 Walsworth Associates Windshield Survey identified the residence as a historic building due to its themes of settlement architecture and the association with the Price family who came to Ketchum in 1885 as one of the first homesteaders. The existing residence was built in 1929 for the purpose of the Price family relocating from the Philadelphia Smelter and is an example of settlement era architecture in Ketchum.

The structure is of historic value as it was the home of Alonzo Price and Esther Fairman who are historic citizens of Ketchum, particularly with Alonzo’s involvement with the Philadelphia Smelter. The residence also reflects a time period in which residential buildings were located closely to the downtown. The residence remains in its original location and has not experienced alterations, allowing for the structure to be a quality example of what development in the immediate area looked like in the 1920’s & 1930’s.

The architectural significance of the residence rests in the fact that it is one of the few remaining structures representing the time period in which it was built and is an example of settlement era residential architecture. While there are other settlement era residential structures within the Community Core, the subject structure differs as it has not experienced alterations/additions and remains in good quality, providing a good example of this Ketchum settlement vernacular.

The Commission finds that due to the residence’s association with the Price family and its representation of the residential neighborhood which used to be in the immediate area that the structure is of historic significance and contributes to the historic significance of the property within the Community Core. The structure being one of the few remaining structures representing the time period which it was built as well as a good example of settlement era residential architecture.



*17.20.030.C.2 - Would the loss, alteration of, or addition to, the structure adversely affect the historic integrity of the structure, impact the significance of the structure within the Community Core, impact the architectural or aesthetic relationship to adjacent properties, or conflict with the Comprehensive Plan?*

Historic integrity measures how effectively a building's materials, design, feeling, location, association, workmanship, and setting convey the property's historic significance. The historic significance of the structure comes from the Price family residing in the structure for many decades as well as being one of the few examples of settlement era architecture. The Price/Fairman residence has not been heavily altered since its original construction in 1929 as staff has only found evidence of reroofs and interior work done to the structure. Due to the residence remaining in its original location and not experiencing any alterations to reflect its exterior appearance, the structure is found to retain its integrity. A relocation of the structure would impact the integrity of the structure as it would no longer be in its original location and not be able to effectively display the residential neighborhood which was present in the 1920's & 1930's. The relocation would also remove the built environment connection which ties the Price family to subject property.

The proposed relocation of the structure would impact the significance of the structure within the Community Core. The residence remains in its original location and represents a time period in the 1920's & 1930's when settlement residences were located close to Ketchum's downtown. The residence is one of the few remaining structures representing this architectural time period. The removal of the residence from the subject property would also impact the architectural and aesthetic relationship to adjacent properties as the small scale is one that is not found in modern development styles.

The commission finds that the project conflicts with the Comprehensive Plan, particularly Policy CD-1.2. This policy, titled *Preservation of Historic Buildings and Sites*, states "Individual buildings and sites of historical, architectural, archaeological, or cultural significance should be identified and considered for protection. The City should encourage the private sector to preserve and rehabilitate buildings and sites through local landmark designation, public improvements, guidelines, and other tools." The relocation of the residence outside of Ketchum City limits would remove the Commission's ability to preserve the structure and review any potential alterations or additions.

*17.20.030.C.3 - Does the structure retain the requisite integrity to convey its historic and/or architectural significance?*

The Price/Fairman residence retains its historic integrity as the building is located in its original location, still remains in good condition, and has not experienced any exterior alterations. The historic significance of being the residence for the Price family has not changed and the building still conveys that significance through being in its original location. The architectural significance of being a quality example of settlement era architecture still remains as the building has not received any alteration/additions and remains in good condition.

*17.20.030.C.4 - Does the proposed demolition or alteration adversely affect the historic significance or architectural distinction of the structure or the Community Core?*

The Commission finds the proposed relocation would adversely affect the historic significance and architectural distinction of the structure, particularly within the Community Core. The relocation would result in the termination of connecting Alonzo Price and Esther Fairman to the built environment in Ketchum as well as removing a building which represents an era when settlement residences were adjacent to the downtown. The proposal would also mean losing a residence with settlement era architecture not commonly seen on the historic building/site list.

### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The City of Ketchum is a municipal corporation established in accordance with Article XII of the Constitution of the State of Idaho and Title 50 Idaho Code and has exercised its authority pursuant to Chapter 46 of Title 67 of Idaho Code to enact the ordinances and regulations, which ordinances are codified in the Ketchum Municipal Code (“KMC”) and are identified in the Findings of Fact and which are herein restated as Conclusions of Law by this reference and which City Ordinances govern the applicant’s Request to Demolish a Historic Structure application for the use of the project site.
2. The Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to hear the applicant’s Request to Demolish a Historic Structure application pursuant to KMC 17.20.010.B. HPC review is required for all requests for partial or total demolitions, exterior alterations, and additions to all structures on the Historic Building List. A relocation constitutes a substantial exterior alteration.
3. The City of Ketchum Planning Department provided notice for the review of this application in accordance with Section 17.20.030.B and Ketchum Municipal Code § 17.96.080.
4. This Request to Demolish a Historic Structure application is governed under the regulations and review criteria specified in Ketchum Municipal Code 17.20.030.C.

## DECISION

**THEREFORE**, for the reasons stated in the Findings of Fact above as applied to the relevant standards, the Ketchum Historic Preservation Commission **denies** the Request to Demolish a Historic Structure (Application File No. H23-084) at 180 N Leadville Avenue.

**Administrative Appeal Notice:** Applicant has the opportunity, pursuant to Ketchum City Code 17.20.030(F) and 17.144, to administratively appeal this Decision to the City Council.

**Regulatory Taking Analysis Notice:** Applicant has the opportunity, pursuant to Idaho Code 67-8003, to submit a written request for a regulatory taking analysis of this Decision.

Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision adopted this 7<sup>th</sup> day of November 2023.

---

Spencer Cordovano  
City of Ketchum  
Historic Preservation Commission