

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE HYRUM CITY PLANNING COMMISSION HELD FEBRUARY 9, 2023 AT THE HYRUM CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 60 WEST MAIN, HYRUM, UTAH.

**CONVENED:** 6:30 P.M.

**CONDUCTING:** Chairman Terry Mann

**PRESENT:** Chairman Terry Mann, Vice Chairman Blake Foster, Commissioners Angi Bair, Brian Carver, Paul Willardson, and Alternate Member Dixie Schwartz.

**EXCUSED:**

**CALL TO ORDER:** There being five members present and five members representing a quorum, Chairman Terry Mann called the meeting to order.

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Zoning Administrator Matt Holmes, Alternate Member Dixie Schwartz, and three citizens. Secretary Hailey Brown recorded the minutes.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** Angi Bair led the governing body and the citizens in the Pledge of Allegiance.

**INVOCATION:** Alternate Member Dixie Schwartz

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

The minutes of a regular meeting held on January 12, 2023 were approved as written.

**ACTION** Commissioner Angi Bair made a motion to approve the minutes of January 12, 2023 as written. Commissioner Blake Foster seconded the motion and Commissioners Bair, Carver, Foster, Mann, and Willardson voted aye.

**AGENDA APPROVAL:**

A copy of the notice and agenda for this meeting was EMAILED to The Herald Journal, posted on the Utah Public Notice Website and Hyrum City's website, distributed to each member of the Planning Commission, and posted at the City Offices more than forty-eight hours before meeting time.

**ACTION** Commissioner Paul Willardson made a motion to approve the agenda for February 9, 2023 as written. Commissioner

**Angi Bair seconded the motion and Commissioners Bair, Carver, Foster, Mann, and Willardson voted aye.**

6. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Annual Planning Commission Review

- I. Election of Planning Commission Chairman and Vice Chairman.
- II. Review appointment terms of Planning Commission Members.
- III. Set meeting schedule for next year.
- IV. Review past years work - conducted by Chairman.
- V. Review plans for the coming year.

B. Annette Francis - Presentation on affordable housing needs in Cache Valley.

7. ADJOURNMENT

***OTHER BUSINESS:***

**ANNUAL PLANNING COMMISSION REVIEW:**

**Election of Planning Commission Chairman and Vice Chairman.**

**ACTION** Commissioner Blake Foster made a motion to appoint Commissioner Paul Willardson as Planning Commission Chairman for 2023. Commissioner Brian Carver seconded the motion and Commissioners Bair, Carver, Foster, Mann, and Willardson voted aye.

**ACTION** Commissioner Paul Willardson made a motion to appoint Commissioner Blake Foster as Planning Commission Vice Chairman for 2023. Commissioner Angi Bair seconded the motion and Commissioners Bair, Carver, Foster, Mann, and Willardson voted aye.

**Review appointment terms of Planning Commission Members.**

Chairman Terry Mann advised of the appointment terms for each member.

**Set meeting schedule for the year.**

The Planning Commission agreed to keep the regular Planning Commission Meetings on the second Thursday of each month at 6:30

p.m.

**ACTION**            **Commissioner Paul Willardson made a motion to approve the meeting schedule for the 2023 year. Commissioner Brian Carver seconded the motion and Commissioners Bair, Carver, Foster, Mann, and Willardson voted aye.**

**Review past years work - conducted by Chairman.**

Chairman Terry Mann conducted the review on agenda items approved in 2022. She also gave updates on the progress of previously approved subdivisions.

**Review plans for the coming year.**

Commissioner Angi Bair mentioned the updates to the General Plan that are currently under review.

Zoning Administrator Matt Holmes said workshop dates need to be set for discussions on the General Plan. Matt said the month of March is open and would be a good time for a workshop.

**ANNETTE FRANCIS - PRESENTATION ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEEDS IN CACHE VALLEY.**

Annette Francis said she is here to present on senior housing needs. She came in as a realtor on the Terra Alta Ventures senior housing development plan that came in for approval. She is looking at discussing senior housing again because her mother is in a situation where she doesn't qualify for low income and can't live alone because of her health. There is a demographic she wants to talk about that affects Hyrum City because of the large senior population here. In general, older women tend to be hit more on poverty. The Blacksmith Fork Assisted Living costs approximately \$5,500 a month. Annette would like to present a better cost option. She presented a four-plex that looks like a regular home and could be incorporated into a regular city block. This would be a good option for a few years until care can no longer be given by family. This would give them their own space and shared amenities with other people. She stated that 40% of seniors don't want to visit the senior center yet and want to be independent. Annette proposed to create a zone for senior housing such as an overlay where independent senior living can be built. She asked if senior housing can be zoned as business or commercial because assisted living facilities are recognized in C-2. Providence City recognizes residential care facilities in this zone.

Commissioner Brian Carver said a residential care facility is an assisted living with full time care.

Annette Francis asked if she lists the services she can provide such as house cleaning, laundry, groceries, and yard care if that could be recognized the same way as full-time care. She would have some services provided and others as an add on in the rent. Seniors last longer on their own if they know they can get the care they need. Providence City allocates zones in which senior living can be placed. Annette asked if the C-2 zone can be modified to add senior living.

Commissioner Brian Carver said the building Annette Francis is proposing already fits in the commercial zone.

Annette Francis said she was told it would have to be a PUD for approval.

Commissioner Brian Carver said a PUD allows for more units than generally allowed. They also give more creativity in design.

Zoning Administrator Matt Holmes said a PUD is a minimum of two and a half acres and the lot she is proposing does not meet the size requirement. PUD's require site plan approval.

Commissioner Brian Carver said multi-family of any size is allowed in a commercial zone.

Zoning Administrator Matt Holmes said the commercial mixed use that was presented included commercial with residential in one building and two other buildings with residential only which isn't allowed in a commercial zone.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that a residential unit has common living and recreation areas rather than single living quarters. He asked if C-2 is a mixed use zone.

Zoning Administrator Matt Holmes said C-1 is a standard commercial zone. C-2 requires commercial and residential not strictly just residential. The type of multi-family unit being proposed would fit in C-1. C-1 and C-2 zones allow for senior living.

Commissioner Brian Carver said this could be done in an R2-A zone.

Zoning Administrator Matt Holmes said there was one last year and the City Council didn't like the proximity of it.

Commissioner Brian Carver doesn't like the R-2A zone.

Annette Francis said the State of Utah is requiring implementation of three or more moderate income housing strategies. She asked if Hyrum City is working on that implementation in the general plan and asked where that process is at.

Commissioner Brian Carver said senior living was discussed as an implementation to the general plan.

Commissioner Angi Bair said ADU's (attached dwelling units) were discussed.

Zoning Administrator Matt Holmes said ADU's are approved just not detached dwelling units.

Annette Francis asked if she could reduce or eliminate parking for residents in a senior unit. Another idea would be to implement zoning incentives for lower income housing. Kartchner asked the city about smaller lot sizes, but lower lots are still expensive for seniors to buy. She is looking to get a monthly payment of \$1,500 or less for senior housing. Another proposal Annette gave was when developers donate retention ponds or parks to the city, they go for a low bid to allocate for senior housing. She brought up the topic of detached dwelling units as well. Her example given was Dawn Asay of Hyrum, who previously rented a small old chiropractor space that was turned into a home and rented for \$650. The current owner still lives in the home. People say that ADU's become rundown. Annette thinks that one multi-family block allowing for ADU's would be beneficial to the city. She would be in favor of doing a boxable in her backyard, but city code doesn't allow for those. They are roughly \$10,000 and you buy the kit then have it delivered to the site to be built.

Annette Francis said she could make a multi-family home look nicer than some homes on the block. Neighbors wouldn't know any difference besides the few extra cars there. Seniors only need one parking stall because more stalls than that makes it be what it wasn't meant to be. She would like to see a home under 1,200 square feet and doesn't care what the amenities are. She said if these homes were mixed in with other homes she doesn't believe it would make a big difference for the public. Annette believes multiple demographics can live together and they don't need to be separated. A C-2 zone could be done but she doesn't want commercial on the second level and asked if commercial had to be done that way. In conclusion as the general plan is being reevaluated, she would

like the city to look at the proposals she had mentioned. Annette asked what the reason is for requiring brick homes and if multi-family housing could be changed to not require brick.

Commissioner Brian Carver said brick is durable and lasts longer, but it is more expensive. He believes there are design standards in the way with affordable housing.

Annette Francis asked if there could be other incentives to help with costs such as giving her an impact fee free of charge or reduce impact fees if used for low-income housing. Another idea would be for the city to facilitate a rehab of houses. Annette found a home that was ten feet short of multi-family housing. Private builders don't want to build low-income housing because of the high work and low payback. The state has grants, but it is so much work to go through the process. Annette owns a lot in Rolling Hills and said all covenants have been removed there, asking if she could build multi-family housing on that lot in the subdivision.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that wouldn't work because of public opposition.

Annette Francis asked if she finished a basement apartment and built the home with vinyl and rock if she would be turned down for approval.

Commissioner Brian Carver said if the home was owner occupied then it would meet code.

Annette Francis said owner occupied would be hard. The class of people in these nicer homes don't need to rent their basements because they have enough money to live there. Once invested to put an apartment in, it makes it hard on the homeowner not being able to rent it and have to move away. The city should incentivize one multi-family home per block for low-income. It is hard for low-income housing in the state when the city won't consider it.

Joni Kartchner from North Logan City Council said North Logan is currently working on their 50-year plan. People are struggling to afford homes now. Some builders say the minute land is developed costs rise. Land in North Logan is too expensive to make profit. She believes it is best to use better building materials, but you have to shrink the home square footage. Joni said it is hard to find an affordable home in today's market. She believes boxables are a great option for people to buy a kit and build a home. Walkable spaces are a great option because then people have

amenities within a close distance to get everything they need. Eventually land will max out on what can be built. Housing takes younger people and older singles to make it more affordable. Low-income housing needs to be blended in and then when the homes are sold it should be noted that they can't be sold at market value to keep it available for low-income households.

Annette Francis said property values don't drop to live by multi-family housing. She doesn't think the community is serviced by having separation. If homes are slightly more expensive but have more units that would also work if they were affordable. The larger low-income builders are hurting so the city should allow for more low-income in the private sector. If the city can allocate savings, can they be passed on to keep housing from being sold at market value. Does the Planning Commission have any recommendations?

Commissioner Brian Carver said he hopes that Annette Francis will speak with the City Council on recommendations because the Planning Commission can recommend but the City Council has to give approval. Suggestions for the city could be to look at changes of codes or zones, or a public hearing to see the public's thoughts. The City Council needs to encounter the negativity that comes from the public. Multi-family housing is judged on a few bad apples, so the City Council doesn't approve it.

Annette Francis said it would be helpful for the city to find a zone in the community that would allow for her to do this senior housing and look at giving incentives.

Commissioner Brian Carver said the City Council is concerned that the city code is fifteen years old. Needs and attitudes have changed, but the code has not changed. Commissioner Brian Carver believes Annette Francis will get the sympathy she is looking for from the City Council because they are coming to terms that changes need to be made. They are getting one style of development in for approval so they need to make fundamental changes to allow for other types of development. The City Council needs to approve of a building style and then take the objection from the citizens.

Annette Francis asked if Hyrum City code is legal with the law.

Zoning Administrator Matt Holmes said Hyrum City already has five of the required moderate-income housing strategies implemented in the code.

Commissioner Brian Carver said the state claims Hyrum City wasn't showing the steps taken on the progress of the implementation of

these codes.

Commissioner Angi Bair said the public also needs more education. The City Council listens to the public views. She advised that Annette may want to advertise for the public to understand and connect with her on this senior housing issue. Angi said a large portion of Cache County is considered low-income because of poverty levels.

Annette Francis said to keep her in mind when looking at education for the public if the city gets involved with that.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

**ACTION**            **There being no further business before the Planning Commission, the meeting adjourned at 7:41 p.m.**

---

Terry Mann  
Chairman

ATTEST:

---

Hailey Brown  
Secretary

Approved: March 9, 2023  
As Written