

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE HYRUM CITY PLANNING COMMISSION HELD MARCH 9, 2023 AT THE HYRUM CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 60 WEST MAIN, HYRUM, UTAH.

CONVENED: 6:30 P.M.

CONDUCTING: Chairman Paul Willardson

PRESENT: Chairman Paul Willardson, Vice Chairman Blake Foster, Commissioners Angi Bair, Brian Carver, Terry Mann, and Alternate Member Dixie Schwartz.

EXCUSED:

CALL TO ORDER: There being five members present and five members representing a quorum, Chairman Paul Willardson called the meeting to order.

OTHERS PRESENT: Two citizens. Secretary Bethany Sproul recorded the minutes.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Commissioner Dixie Schwartz led the governing body and the citizens in the Pledge of Allegiance.

INVOCATION: Commissioner Terry Mann

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The minutes of a regular meeting held on February 9, 2023 were approved as written.

ACTION **Commissioner Terry Mann made a motion to approve the minutes of February 9, 2023 as written. Commissioner Blake Foster seconded the motion and Commissioners Bair, Carver, Foster, Mann, and Willardson voted aye.**

AGENDA APPROVAL:

A copy of the notice and agenda for this meeting was EMAILED to The Herald Journal, posted on the Utah Public Notice Website and Hyrum City's website, distributed to each member of the Planning Commission, and posted at the City Offices more than forty-eight hours before meeting time.

ACTION **Commissioner Angi Bair made a motion to approve the agenda for March 9, 2023 as written. Commissioner Terry Mann seconded the motion and Commissioners Bair, Carver,**

Foster, Mann, and Willardson voted aye.

6. WORKSHOP

A. Discussion on updating the General Plan & city zoning.

7. ADJOURNMENT

WORKSHOP:

DISCUSSION ON UPDATING THE GENERAL PLAN & CITY ZONING:

Commissioner Angi Bair stated that at the recent legislative conference a \$50,000,000 grant was approved that would provide \$20,000 to assist first time home buyers to purchase a brand-new home for \$450,000 or less. The plan is to encourage cities to reduce lot sizes, so it is possible for builders to build homes under \$450,000.

Commissioner Terry Mann asked if they have to allow smaller lots and if townhomes would count under the grant.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that the requirement is for the home to be \$450,000 or under.

Commissioner Angi Bair asked how they would be able to get a new home under \$450,000.

Commissioner Brian Carver stated that new home options are very limited. There are older homes that may fit in that price range, but they are not on the market.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that the State of Utah is trying to incentivize builders to keep building as there is a shortage of homes.

Commissioner Dixie Schwartz asked if that counts the building lot.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that it does count the building lot. If the city allows smaller lot sizes, the builders can save money. Those savings can then be transferred to the homebuyer. She added that the city needs more than just townhomes.

Commissioner Terry Mann asked if there should be whole areas designated for smaller lots or have a mixture of lot sizes.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that the state does not go into detail about that. He was concerned that the grant may act more

like a stimulus, which may end up inflating the housing market again. However, requiring the home to be priced under \$450,000 may help with the issue.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if the grant would only apply to first time home buyers.

Commissioner Angi Bair answered that the grant is for first time home buyers or those who have not owned a home in the past three years. The grant is an attempt to try to close the gap between the median income range and the median price range.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that the median income range is \$65,000-\$68,000 a year. Affordable housing to those with a median income would be \$200,000.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that if the resident ever sold or refinanced the home they bought with the grant, the money would have to be paid back to the government. This would allow for other first time home buyers to use the grant. If the grant does not work, then they would try to apply it to existing homes as well. She mentioned that Ogden and Salt Lake City have not had any new construction under \$450,000.

Commissioner Brian Carver said the median house price in Salt Lake City last year was \$600,000.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that builders have options to fit homes in the affordable housing range.

Chairman Paul Willardson stated that all the city would need to do to accommodate for the new grant is to allow smaller frontages.

Commissioner Angi Bair mentioned they have smaller lot sizes in Wapiti Loop.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that Wapiti Loop is a PUD. He said that some City Council members are fed up with PUDs as they are not seeing much good coming from them. PUDs allow developers to have flexibility but also gives the city the arbitrary decision of what they ask for as a part of the PUD. He mentioned that most of the recent PUDs have been used for townhomes.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if City Council had given any specifics of what they felt the PUDs were lacking.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that City Council wants a variety

of creative housing options. There have been concerns on the infrastructure and open space resulting in the homeowner associations asking the city to take ownership. This resulted in the city approving PUDs as long as the roads were built to their standards. The open spaces would then be dedicated and donated to the city for maintenance.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that City Councilman Jared Clawson wanted to get rid of the PUD ordinance and create new zones instead. Brian Carver said that many people will not like the changes.

Chairman Paul Willardson stated that the Planning Commission can only make recommendations. City Council makes the City Code changes.

Commissioner Angi Bair said they could consider twin homes as they are not as limiting as townhomes. The expense of the lot would be shared, which would help with affordability.

Commissioner Terry Mann agreed that twin homes could be incorporated into new lots.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that the R1A and R2A zones accommodate for multifamily housing, however nothing in the city is designated as those zones. It is possible for people to request R1A and R2A as rezones.

Commissioner Angi Bair asked if only one person per block could do a fourplex.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that fourplexes must be 600 feet away from each other. He stated that the city has not seen a fourplex ever since the change was made where they would have to request a rezone. He suggested that instead of requiring a conditional use permit, they could make them be a permitted use.

Commissioner Terry Mann said that the change would make a fourplex an option.

Commissioner Brian Carver agreed they should keep the option open. He said that they could look at a map of Hyrum and mark which blocks already have fourplexes. They can reevaluate if needed in five years.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if they marked the blocks that have fourplexes if they would send the map to City Council to look over.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that the new change would not have to be open to the whole city but could be restricted to a specific zone. He stated that a multifamily building up to a fourplex could be allowed as a permitted use in the R2 zone. He suggested that the city should be more creative of where they place the zones. Commissioner Brian Carver added that the Planning Commission should keep a list of what they have been discussing.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if they would keep the restriction of one fourplex per block.

Commissioner Brian Carver said yes.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if anyone had anything else they wanted to say on the matter. There being no further discussion, he allowed Michael Nelson to ask a question.

Michael Nelson asked if a fourplex would be allowed one per block and if across the street had an open spot, as it was not considered to be within the same block.

Commissioner Brian Carver agreed that while the fourplexes would not be on the same block, it was still within 600 feet.

Michael Nelson asked if the rule was a combination of one per block and the 600 feet distance.

Chairman Paul Willardson clarified that the rule was based on the distance of 600 feet. He asked if there were any other issues that should be addressed.

Commissioner Terry Mann asked if in new subdivisions they should require a specific percentage of the lots to be smaller.

Commissioner Angi Bair stated that PUDs are very subjective. While a proposal may technically fit in zoning regulations, City Council and the public still have a say against it. She said that the City Code should be more specific.

Chairman Paul Willardson stated that every builder should receive the same treatment.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that they should keep the same standards so builders will know what to expect when they create and present development plans. He mentioned a previous plan that Annette Francis presented costed about \$50,000 to create just for it to get shut down.

Chairman Paul Willardson said that he was concerned with making lot sizes and frontages smaller in case of any fire or snow issues. He said that if they do change the frontages, that they must have setbacks, and the houses must be smaller as well.

Commissioner Brian Carver said he liked that idea. He had the same concerns as well.

Commissioner Terry Mann said that an option for small lots are shotgun homes.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that Elk Mountain had a mixture of developments, which had many options for different age groups.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that Elk Mountain is the most creative PUD Hyrum City has. The development started back in 2004, and was later bought by Kartchner, who kept it close to the original concept. He felt that ever since then, most PUDs were trying to pack in as much townhomes as possible.

Commissioner Angi Bair stated that Neighborhood Nonprofit had come in to revise their plans to accommodate for multifamily housing.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that City Council said no to the Neighborhood Nonprofit's proposed changes. He said that instead of planned unit developments, the Planning Commission could look at a mixed density zone. They can give the developer the flexibility of providing the mix, or the city gives specific percentages of what densities they want. They could also give incentives where if they meet a specific percentage of a specific density or style, they can receive a bonus of some kind. This would give a mixed community feel with many options.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that they can keep some density requirements so there is still some open space.

Commissioner Brian Carver said they can set up an ordinance for mixed density or create a whole new zone dedicated to smaller homes. There should be a limit on how many acres can be rezoned that way so not all future developments are tiny homes.

Chairman Paul Willardson stated that the Planning Commission's goal is to make ways to accommodate for affordable housing. He said that even if they allow smaller frontages or lots, it does not guarantee the lower price.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that builders know what people will

buy and how much they will pay for it.

Chairman Paul Willardson said that in a free market, it makes sense that someone would try to sell something for as much as they can.

Commissioner Terry Mann asked what the incentives would be.

Commissioner Brian Carver said they could provide housing authority and tax incentives, however, it is not worth it at Hyrum City's current size. There are bonuses or waivers the city could provide if the builder guarantees to keep a number of homes in a certain price range. Density bonuses could work as well. He added that Nibley City has a density bonus in one of their overlays that the Planning Commission could look at.

Chairman Paul Willardson stated that if there were homes on the market, the easiest answer would just be to build cheaper homes, however, there is nothing on the market.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that builders have different prices based on who they are selling to. They research who is buying and the price set by the market. Commissioner Angi Bair said that builders stopped taking contracts as just three months later, the unit could be sold for \$15,000 more. They wait in order to make more money.

Commissioner Brian Carver mentioned that people had been walking out on contracts as the prices were raised on them.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that now builders are trying to incentivize buyers to keep their contracts as the market has shifted again.

Commissioner Blake Foster asked where they would allow smaller lots and higher density housing.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that they need to see where spaces are still available.

Commissioner Angi Bair asked what the white spots on the zoning map were.

Commissioner Brian Carver answered that the white space is land not annexed in the city. The Utah State code now allows islands of unannexed land that is surrounded by the city.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that most of the property within the

city is already developed.

Commissioner Brian Carver mentioned that 100 acres between the Neighborhood Non-Profit development and the meat farm were going on the market.

Commissioner Terry Mann said that they should plan for the future growth of Hyrum City.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that if changes could be made now, it would give the opportunity for subdivisions that have been approved but not completely developed to be able to make changes to their plan and add options for affordable housing.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that they should mix the types of residential units within the area. A certain percentage of homes could be multifamily, but instead of them all being in the same spot, they should be mixed in with the whole community.

Commissioner Angi Bair suggested allowing detached ADUs which would allow for more housing options. It could help residents with housing their senior parents, young couples, or college students. They would have to instate some regulations.

Chairman Paul Willardson commented that family members may want their own space, but still be close.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that Nibley City allows detached housing units if the lot size is big enough.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if they should put a stipulation of distance on detached ADUs.

Commissioner Brian Carver said they could make the distance smaller.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that they should require that the homeowner lives at the address of the ADU as the property would be managed better.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that the main home should be owner occupied, but the detached ADU itself does not need the owner in it as well.

Commissioner Angi Bair commented that a detached ADU would also work as a guest house.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if allowing detached ADUs would create an increase with Airbnb's in Hyrum City.

Commissioner Brian Carver said yes. Logan City requires a business license and conditional use permit for a detached ADU to be used as an Airbnb. He said that it would be a burden on the city but would give the city a mechanism in case a property owner starts to abuse the rules. Commissioner Brian Carver said he was unsure how much of an issue short term rentals are in the area.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if there were any other topics the Planning Commission wanted to discuss.

Commissioner Brian Carver brought up the possibility of deed restrictions. They can require the home to be sold at a specific rate, which would have to be included on the title. He said that this would be something he would have to investigate more.

Commissioner Angi Bair commented that the state may be giving incentives as it has to be given from bigger government agencies as the market is so high.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that there is no way to make housing affordable in a free market without government incentives. He hopes that tax credits will get applied to smaller projects as Hyrum only needs 10 units not 50.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked how they should address the issue of big companies, like JBS, needing to house their employees.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that there is an ordinance for boarding houses, but those are not as popular anymore so it may be better to offer another option.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if a boarding house would require the residents to share a common area.

Commissioner Angi Bair answered yes, one person would have their own bedroom but would share everything else with other residents. She said that apartment complexes would be better.

Commissioner Terry Mann asked if there is anything available for apartment complexes in current zoning.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that a developer could use the PUD ordinance or build in a commercial zone.

Commissioner Angi Bair suggested that they could put them in the industrial zone, which would make it possible for the employees to commute to work.

Commissioner Brian Carver agreed that allowing a type of housing in an industrial zone could be possible.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that typically a private developer would build the project and then the corporation would lease it and provide it to the employees.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that as a last resort, JBS bought apartments in Logan and kicked out the tenants to make room for their employees.

Commissioner Terry Mann said that the city is not quite like Jackson Hole yet.

Commissioner Angi Bair commented that everyone in the Jackson Hole area keeps getting pushed out of the area due to the housing prices.

Commissioner Terry Mann said that they need to have this discussion in case any of the big manufacturers need housing for their employees.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that 4400 South may become a three-lane road that will intersect with Highway 89 and 91. Trucks need access to the highway but going through town is problematic. Trucks going through Nibley has helped a bit, even with the addition of the roundabout. He said there may potentially be a four-lane thorough fair and more industrial development in that area.

Commissioner Terry Mann stated that they should be making the zoning changes before problems arise.

Chairman Paul Willardson said it would be a proactive thing to do. He asked Brian Carver to review the list of what they had been discussing.

Commissioner Brian Carver restated the points they had gone over, which were: the permitted use of fourplexes in the R2 zone, smaller lots and frontages in mixed residential zones, requiring a variety of densities in a subdivision, detached ADUs and high-density housing for a workforce in an industrial zone.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that they had also discussed changing

the zoning so the city was more than just one type of zone. Especially the outliers that have not been developed yet. She added that with requiring a specific lot size, neighbors are already more spread out from each other.

Commissioner Brian Carver said another issue outside of affordable housing was the preservation of open space and farmlands. He said that they should encourage a development style that would allow a good balance of urban growth and open space which could either be an open public space, horse pasture or be for an agricultural operator. He suggested the Planning Commission to look at examples of other communities doing it.

Chairman Paul Willardson asked if Hyrum City would have to purchase the property.

Commissioner Brian Carver said it would be ideal if the city did not have to purchase the land. He said there are many ways to negotiate. The land could be deeded to an organization or land trust and remains undeveloped, but still maintained.

Commissioner Angi Bair said that North Logan has a one-acre lot minimum, but the lots are only a half-acre lot, and the other half would remain undeveloped.

Commissioner Brian Carver stated an example of forty acres and one unit allotted one lot. However, instead of making each lot have one acre, all the homes would be grouped together, and the surrounding space would remain undeveloped. The land could be used either for recreational or agricultural purposes. He did admit that this does not address the affordability issues. But it does keep the community character intact and allow for fire breaks. He added that they should protect sensitive lands and keep homes out of floodplains and wetlands.

Commissioner Angi Bair said there should be a variety of people in Hyrum City. She added that zoning may need to change and open space may not be something the city can have if the population continues to grow.

Commissioner Brian Carver said that conservation easements are only permanent on paper. If the land is not maintained, the easement can get thrown out. Cache County had just passed a bond to raise property taxes to purchase easements on land to leave land for future generations. There is the possibility of a 20-30 year easement, so people may be able to reevaluate if they still need the land undeveloped. Brian Carver added that he did not see

any need to build by the river.

ADJOURNMENT:

ACTION **There being no further business before the Planning Commission, the meeting adjourned at 7:42 p.m.**

Paul Willardson
Chairman

ATTEST:

Bethany Sproul
Secretary

Approved: April 13, 2023
 As Written