

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of the Meeting of March 20, 2024

Commissioners Present: Jim Welter (Vice-Chair), Cheryl Jones, (Chair), Jane Branigan, Ralph Hammond-Green, David McKinley

Commissioners Absent: Jim Boyd, Crystal Cauley, John Falvo

Staff Present: Matt Manley, Strategic Project Manager, Daniel Heyman, Staff Attorney

- I **Call to Order.** Chair called the regular meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:00 pm.
- II **Agenda.** On motion of Commissioner Hammond Green and seconded by Commissioner Branigan the agenda was approved.
- III **Minutes.** On motion of Commissioner Welter and seconded by Commissioner McKinley the minutes of the meeting of February 21, 2024 were approved.
- IV **New Business**
- IV(A) **Certificate of Appropriateness** - David Sparks and Paul Donahue, 1116 Highland Avenue (File No. H24-014-COA). Prior to the opening of the public hearing, Chair announced that there is one new application for a COA in the Hyman Heights Historic District. Any persons desiring to testify at any of the public hearings must first be sworn as witnesses and will be subject to cross-examination by parties or persons whose position may be contrary to yours. A copy of the procedure and rules for a quasi-judicial hearing is provided on the back table next to the agenda. Since this is a quasi-judicial hearing, it is very important that we have an accurate record of the hearing Therefore, we must ask that you refrain from speaking until recognized by the Chair and, when recognized, come forward to the podium and begin by stating your name and address. Anyone present who has knowledge of anything of value that has been given or promised in exchange for a position to be taken on these applications should disclose it now. Anyone wishing to speak during the public hearing should come forward and be sworn in. Chair swore in all potential witnesses. Matt Manley, Paul Donahue, Melissa Wilkinson, Susan Sparks McKenzie were sworn in.

Chair opened the public hearing.

Matt Manley stated the city is in receipt of a COA application from David and Louise Sparks, property owners and Paul Donahue of Mountain Remodeling for the removal of an existing deck and an addition to the kitchen (10' x 9'5") and a new 24' x 14' deck addition to the rear for the property located at 1116 Highland Avenue and possessing a PIN 9569-71-4674 and located within the Hyman Heights Local Historic District. The proposed project type is a major work according to the Residential Historic District Design Standards.

A Historic District Overlay map was shown and is included in the staff report and presentation.

An aerial view of the property was shown and is included in the staff report and presentation.

A history of the subject property was given and is included in the staff report and presentation.

Photos of existing conditions of the property were shown and are included in the staff report and presentation.

A site plan was shown of the proposed addition and deck reconstruction and is included in the staff report and presentation.

The Design Standards that apply were included in the staff report and presentation.

Suggested motions were shown for approval and denial and are included in the staff report and presentation.

Paul Donahue, contractor explained the proposal and submitted a set of plans labeled Exhibit A into the record. The brick will match the existing brick. They will match the paint as close as possible. They will match the asphalt shingles as close as possible. Chair asked about the deck roof. It will be tongue and groove pine. Chair asked what landscaping is being changed. Mr. Donahue stated no trees will be removed and there will be no new plantings. The deck materials will be treated lumber and stain and there will be stone footers. The gutters on the deck roof will be 5' aluminum to match. Mr. Donahue was willing to accept any conditions the Commission may have. Mr. Donahue stated they plan to remove existing addition on rear of house and replace in similar footprint but expand to meet the dimensions of the house. Replace the deck. Extend about 2 feet. He stated the existing addition was not framed correctly. The brick was done poorly. Foundation is failing underneath that portion of the home. The existing deck joists are too far apart, the deck is sagging. He stated the new door shown on Exhibit A is no longer being proposed. Roof will be extended to cover the new deck. Roof will not have to be raised. Deck is attached to the house.

Chair raised issue of new additions mimicking historic elements. The standards require that new work be distinguishable from historic elements. The applicant agreed to do something like a soldier course of brick that will distinguish the old from new. Chair suggested that the exact method can be approved by staff.

Chair asked if any would like to speak for or against the application.

Melissa Wilkinson, 1109 N Main Street stated she was concerned about the impact of the project. She asked several questions about the survey line and if the deck extension would be moving closer to her property. She asked that some kind of fencing be placed temporarily to keep any debris from construction from entering her property in order to protect the four grandchildren she cares for. She also brought up concerns about the additional runoff created by the covered deck and asked that the drainage be directed away from her house.

Susan Sparks McKenzie, 1126 Highland Avenue spoke in favor. She is the daughter of the owners. They recently purchased the property to locate closer to her.

Chair clarified that their role was limited to the historic appropriateness of the proposal and that questions about setbacks, survey lines, and stormwater runoff were not in their purview. The Commission then reviewed the Design Standards and then determined the various standards applicable to the proposal.

Chair closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Welter moved the Commission to find as fact that the proposed application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, as identified in file # H24-014-COA and located within the Hyman Heights Historic District, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission Design Standards (Residential) for the following reasons: 1. The deck is installed in an inconspicuous location. [Sec. 4.1.2] 2. The deck is scaled to existing building proportions. [Sec. 4.1.3] 3. The proposed addition does not destroy, damage or obscure character defining features of the building [Sec. 4.2.1] 4. The proposed addition is an inconspicuous elevation at the rear of the building and aligning with the existing roofline [Sec. 4.2.5] 5. (3.4 .4) Brick, stone, copper, bronze, concrete, or cement block surfaces should be left in their historically unfinished condition. - HPC deemed that the new brick was not historical so it was not out of line with the standards 6. (4.2.7) Design an addition to be compatible with the historic building in mass, materials, and relationship of solids to voids in the exterior walls, yet make the addition discernible from the original - HPC gave staff the authority to approve a brick course that would distinguish the addition from the original structure. Mr. McKinley seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

- V **Old Business.** The Commission discussed the Blue Ridge Community College Event, the distribution of the Coloring Books and finding a date/time to present to City Council - possibly in May during Preservation Week.
- VI **Other Business.** None
- VII **Adjournment.** The Chair adjourned the meeting at 6:20 p.m.


Chair