

# **Town of Beaufort, NC** 701 Front St. - P.O. Box 390 - Beaufort, N.C. 28516 252-728-2141 - 252-728-3982 fax - www.beaufortnc.org

# Town of Beaufort Historic Preservation Regular Meeting 6:00 PM Tuesday, March 7, 2023 - Train Depot, 614 Broad Street, Beaufort, NC 28516 Minutes

## Call to Order

Vice-Chair Flowers called the March 7, 2023 Beaufort Historic Preservation Commission regular meeting to order at 6:00 pm.

## **Roll Call**

Members Present: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Members Absent: Chair Joyce McCune

A quorum was declared with six members present.

Staff Present: Kyle Garner, Town Attorney Jill Quattlebaum, and Laurel Anderson. Commissioner Marianna Hollinshed was also present.

## Agenda Approval

Member Hunsucker made the motion to approve the Agenda and Member Huckabee made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

## **Election of Officers**

Member Huckabee made the motion to open the floor for nominations for Chair and Vice-Chair Flowers made the second. Town Attorney Quattlebaum took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers nominated Joyce McCune for the position of Chair and Member Huckabee made the second.

Member Huckabee made the motion to close the floor for nominations for Chair and Member Cummins made the second. Town Attorney Quattlebaum took a vote that was unanimously approved. Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Town Attorney Quattlebaum took a vote for Joyce McCune for the position of Chair that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers made the motion to open the floor for nominations for Vice-Chair and Member Huckabee made the second. Town Attorney Quattlebaum took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Member Huckabee nominated John Flowers for the position of Vice-Chair, and Member Hunsucker made the second.

Member Hedrick made the motion to close the floor for nominations for Vice-Chair and Member Cummins made the second. Town Attorney Quattlebaum took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Town Attorney Quattlebaum took a vote for John Flowers for the position of Vice-Chair that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

## **Administration of Oaths**

Secretary Anderson administered the Oath to Kyle Garner.

#### **Items of Consent**

Member Cummins made the motion to approve the Orders for Case # 22-34 201 Front Street, Case #22-22 211 Broad Street, Case #22-35 211 Orange Street, Case #23-02 300 Front Street Unit 3, and Case #23-01 521 Front Street, and Member Hedrick made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

#### **New Business**

1. Case #22-16; 121 Turner Street – Signage

Mr. Garner explained that the applicant will revise his application.

Member Hedrick made a motion to table the application. Vice-Chair Flowers made the second and took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers then read the quasi-judicial statement.

2. Case #23-03; 205 Moore Street – Fencing, Brick Pavers & Landscaping

Mr. Garner gave an overview of the application to install a 3-foot-high picket fence in the front yard and increase the height to 5 feet down the side with brick pavers and landscaping, and asked the staff report and guidelines be entered into evidence.

Secretary Anderson administered the Oath to the applicant, Eric Lindstrom, who explained that he would be installing a "Beaufort-style" fence, in the straight picket style. There was a short discussion regarding the "Beaufort-style" fence and transition from the 32" to the 5' fence height.

Hearing no further questions Vice-Chair Flowers asked for a motion for a Finding of Fact for Case #23-03 and Member Cummins made the following motion: Having reviewed the record and having considered all evidence submitted and oral testimony for case #23-03, move that the Commission conclude that the pending application meets the following design standards under the Design Guidelines for the Beaufort Historic District and Landmarks: Fences and Wall 8.2.2, 8.2.3; Landscaping 8.1.5, 8.1.7.

Member Hunsucker made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers then asked for a motion for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #23-03.

Member Huckabee made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness based on the following: Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, I move that the proposed project is not incongruous with the special character of the historic district as a whole and that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #23-03 be issued for the proposed work, to include a condition that the fence be graduated from 32" up to a height of five feet.

Member Morris made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers then declared Case #23-03 closed, noting that the official Orders would be signed at the next meeting and notifying the applicant to proceed with work at his own risk.

3. Case #23-04; 208 Cedar Street & 319 Orange Street – Landscaping, Parking & Lighting

Vice-Chair Flowers introduced Case #23-04 and recused himself as he stated he has a personal opinion about the application.

Member Hunsucker made the motion to recuse Vice-Chair Flowers and Member Huckabee made the second. Town Attorney Quattlebaum took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Member Cummins made the motion to nominate Member Huckabee to sit as temporary Chair and Member Morris made the second. Town Attorney Quattlebaum took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Acting Chair Huckabee, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Acting Chair Huckabee asked if any other Members needed to recuse themselves and hearing none, asked Mr. Garner to give an overview of the application. Mr. Garner explained that in May 2022, the Beaufort Board of Commissioners re-approved the site plan for the Compass Hotel project. At the meeting the Commissioners placed two conditions on that approval; the applicant had to go back before the Historic Commission for a new COA as well as install the fence to the parking lot at 208 Cedar Street prior to construction on the main structure.

To date the contractor (Hudson Brothers) is in the process of installing the required fence and has submitted a new COA application. The application is the same as was approved by the HPC in February of 2020 including the landscaping, fencing and lighting plan, with no changes.

Secretary Anderson administered the Oath to the applicant, Joe Thomas; the applicant's attorney, Eric Remington of Ward and Smith; and Preston Godwin of Hudson Brothers Construction.

Mr. Remington stated that due to Covid the approved COA had expired, and requested the Board approve a new COA or an extension of the current COA.

Mr. Godwin explained the parking lot lighting would project downward and some lights would project a little more outward, and the lights would be on a photo timer from sunset to sunrise. Acting Chair Huckabee explained the guidelines require all lighting be directed downward.

Acting Chair Huckabee asked if anyone with standing would like to speak. Anna deButts, 320 Orange Street, claimed to have standing as a contiguous neighbor and Secretary Anderson administered the Oath to her. As Town Attorney Quattlebaum explained that a person with standing would have to prove special damages, the Board discussed opening Public Comments.

Member Cummins made a motion to open Public Comments and Member Hunsucker made the second. Acting Chair Huckabee took a vote that was unanimously approved.

# Voting yea: Acting Chair Huckabee, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Mrs. deButts stated that her concern was that the applicant would occupy the parking lot prior to having met all COA and LDO requirements, and requested her testimony be admitted as evidence. As she could not demonstrate that she was a person with standing, the Board determined that Mrs. deButts' testimony could not be officially entered into the record.

Mr. Flowers, 321 Orange Street, then requested that the Board require the contractor to put at least one layer of asphalt on the parking lot to reduce dust from construction vehicles. Mr. Godwin stated that they would grade the parking lot as soon as possible, and the pole lights could take a while to receive. He further explained that in six to eight weeks the parking lot should be paved and fencing, painting and vegetation should be installed.

Member Hedrick made the motion to close Public Comments and Member Morris made the second. Acting Chair Huckabee took a vote that was unanimous.

Voting yea: Acting Chair Huckabee, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Hearing no further questions Acting Chair Huckabee asked for a motion for a Finding of Fact for Case #23-04 and Member Hedrick made the following motion: Having reviewed the record and having considered all evidence submitted and oral testimony for case #23-04, move that the Commission conclude that the pending application meets the following design standards under the Design Guidelines for the Beaufort Historic District and Landmarks: Landscaping 8.1.4, 8.1.5, 8.1.9, 8.1.14; Fences and Wall Guidelines 8.2.2, 8.2.3, 8.2.6, 8.2.7; Exterior Lighting 8.4.1, 8.4.2, 8.4.5; Off-Street Parking 8.5.1, 8.5.2, 8.5.3, 8.5.4, 8.5.5, 8.5.6, 8.5.7.

Member Cummins made the second. Acting Chair Huckabee took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Acting Chair Huckabee, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Acting Chair Huckabee then asked for a motion for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #23-04.

Member Cummins made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness based on the following: Based

upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, I move that the proposed project is not incongruous with the special character of the historic district as a whole and that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #23-04 be issued for the proposed work.

Member Morris made the second. Acting Chair Huckabee took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Acting Chair Huckabee, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Acting Chair Huckabee then declared Case #23-04 closed, noting that the official Orders would be signed at the next meeting and notifying the applicant to proceed with work at his own risk.

Member Hedrick made a motion to restore Member Flowers as Vice-Chair, and Member Cummins made the second. Acting Chair Huckabee took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Acting Chair Huckabee, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

4. Case #23-05; 131 Craven Street - Remove Front Chimney, Remove Two Front Doors and Install Single Door

Vice-Chair Flowers introduced Case #23-05 and Mr. Garner explained that the applicant wanted to remove an existing chimney and remove two front doors and replace with a single door, stating that years ago the second door was added when the house was subdivided into a duplex. In June 2014 a COA was issued for an 8' rear addition and in 2018 a COA was issued for a new driveway and parking area. Mr. Garner requested the staff report and applicant's information be entered into evidence.

Secretary Anderson administered the Oath to the applicant's general contractor, Bruce Maness. Mr. Maness explained that the chimney was cracked on the interior and they had obtained an engineer's report stating that the chimney was structurally unsafe and should be removed. He further stated that the new front door would be centered and stained mahogany. There was general discussion about the door and sidelights being painted or stained and possibly stabilizing the exterior of the chimney in order to retain the home's structural elements.

Hearing no further questions Vice-Chair Flowers asked for a motion for a Finding of Fact for Case #23-05 and Member Huckabee made the following motion: Having reviewed the record and having considered all evidence submitted and oral testimony for case #23-05, move that the Commission conclude that the pending application meets the following design standards under the Design Guidelines for the Beaufort Historic District and Landmarks: Brickwork and Masonry Guidelines 6.3.1, 6.3.2; Window and Door Guidelines 6.4.1, 6.4.2, 6.4.3, 6.4.10 with the conditions that the sidelights and frame of the new door will be painted white to match the house, leaving the door natural, and leaving the exterior portion of the chimney.

Member Hedrick made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness based on the following: Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, I move that the proposed project is not incongruous with the special character of the historic district as a whole and that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #23-05 be issued for the proposed work, with the following conditions: The sidelights and frame of the new door will be painted white to match the house, leaving the door natural, and leaving the exterior portion of the chimney.

Member Huckabee made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers then declared Case #23-05 closed, noting that the official Orders would be signed at the next meeting and notifying the applicant to proceed with work at his own risk.

5. Case #23-06; 302 Cedar Street – Rear Addition, Windows, Porch

Mr. Garner stated that the applicant wished to renovate the existing house and construct a rear addition above the existing rear of the structure, noting that there are no COA records on file for 302 Cedar Street. In September of 2021 the property was rezoned from B-1 to R-8 and in February of 2022 a variance was given for the side and rear setback. He requested the Staff Report and additional information be included in the official record.

Secretary Anderson administered the Oath to the applicants Porter and Timpla Casey, 302 Cedar St, who then gave an overview of their project and application. Mr. Casey stated that the intent of their design was to keep the symmetry of the existing structure. The Board discussed the windows, external window mullions, roof, using the smooth side of fiber cement siding on the addition while keeping the original cedar siding on the existing house, and the Caseys stated their intent to return the vinyl ceiling over the porch to wood beadboard. They were reminded by the Board that a historic plaque could not be issued if the original house was altered such as the request to patch the center window.

Hearing no further questions Vice-Chair Flowers asked for a motion for a Finding of Fact for Case #23-06 and Member Huckabee made the following motion: Having reviewed the record and having considered all evidence submitted and oral testimony for case #23-06, move that the Commission conclude that the pending application meets the following design standards under the Design Guidelines for the Beaufort Historic District and Landmarks: Roof Guidelines 6.1.3, 6.1.7; Window and Door Guidelines 6.4.7, 6.4.1, 6.4.10; Paint and Exterior Colors Guidelines 6.7.2; Additions to Historic Building Guidelines 7.8.1, 7.8.2, 7.8.3, 7.8.4, 7.8.6, 7.8.7, 7.8.8, 7.8.9; Landscaping Guidelines 8.1.5, 8.1.7, 8.1.8.

Member Morris made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness based on the following: Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, I move that the proposed project is not incongruous with the special character of the historic district as a whole and that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #23-06 be issued for the proposed work. Member Hunsucker made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers then declared Case #23-06 closed, noting that the official Orders would be signed at the next meeting and notifying the applicants to proceed with work at their own risk.

6. Case #23-07; 308 Moore Street - New Single-Family Home

Vice-Chair Flowers introduced Case #23-07 and Mr. Garner explained the applicant wishes to construct a new home on a vacant parcel at 308 Moore Street. In July of 2020 the Historic Commission approved a COA for the demolition of the structure at 308 Moore Street due to the exterior and interior condition. A letter of support for demolition was also supplied from the State Historic Preservation office. The property has remained vacant since 2020. A portion of this property is within the Special Flood hazard Area (AE-6) which will require an additional one foot of freeboard as well as an elevation certificate. Mr. Garner then displayed the samples the applicant had submitted and noted that they would be inserting a date brick in the foundation.

Secretary Anderson then administered the Oath to the applicant and property owner, Ben Lapsley, and the design builder Craven Gardner, who answered the Board's questions regarding the exterior trim, the fence transition sloping from three to five feet, setbacks, the metal roofing, the windows displaying 1 1/8 mullions with clear glass, and the garage door being metal with trim details.

Hearing no further questions Vice-Chair Flowers asked for a motion for a Finding of Fact for Case #23-07 and Member Huckabee made the following motion: Having reviewed the record and having considered all evidence submitted and oral testimony for case #23-07, move that the Commission conclude that the pending application meets the following design standards under the Design Guidelines for the Beaufort Historic District and Landmarks: Building Placement 7.1.1, 7.1.2, 7.1.3, 7.1.4; Building Height and Scale 7.2.1, 7.2.2, 7.2.3, 7.2.4, 7.2.5; Materials 7.3.1, 7.3.2, 7.3.3; Details 7.4.1, 7.4.2; Texture and Color 7.5.1; Form and Rhythm 7.6.1, 7.6.2, 7.6.3; Landscaping 7.7.1; Off-Street Parking 8.5.1, 8.5.2, 8.5.3, 8.5.4, 8.5.6, 8.5.7; Outside Utilities 8.3.1, 8.3.6; Exterior Lighting 8.4.1, 8.4.2, 8.4.3; Landscaping 8.1.2, 8.1.5, 8.1.7, 8.1.8, 8.1.12, 8.1.13; Fences and Walls 8.2.2, 8.2.3 with the conditions that the metal roof approval is tabled.

Member Huckabee made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Member Huckabee made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness based on the following: Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, I move that the proposed project is not incongruous with the special character of the historic district as a whole and that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #23-07 be issued for the proposed work, with the following condition: the metal roof be tabled and brought back before the Commission at a later date.

Member Cummins made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers then declared Case #23-07 closed, noting that the official Orders would be signed at the next meeting and notifying the applicant to proceed with work at his own risk.

#### **Commission / Board Comments**

- a. Member Cummins expressed his desire for a solution for the metal roof issue in the historic district.
- b. Member Morris thanked the other Members for an insightful first meeting.
- c. Member Huckabee noted Member Cummins' passion and concerns regarding metal roofs in the historic district and noted the Guidelines which delineates the differences between historic and new structures.
- d. Member Hedrick welcomed Member Morris and suggested Members taking responsibility for noting COA violations and submitting them to Staff for possible enforcement.
- e. Member Hunsucker expressed concerns regarding enforcing violations in the historic district.
- f. Vice-Chair Flowers welcomed Member Morris and reminded the Members they could submit possible violations to Mr. Garner and thanked Mr. Garner and Town Attorney Quattlebaum for their help and support.

## **Staff Comments**

a. Mr. Garner welcomed Member Morris to the Commission.

- b. He reminded Members about avoiding ex parte communication including emails and other communication.
- c. Mr. Garner informed the Commission that a home on Orange Street had been allegedly re-painted a different color with no COA or Minor Works approval and the homeowners had been sent a letter of violation. He also noted another home on Ann Street which would be re-painted a Dutch blue color found under paint scrapings of the siding.
- d. He stated that John Wood of the State Historic Preservation Office would be meeting with the Board to work on the new Standards in the near future.
- e. Mr. Garner reminded the Board about the cemetery workshop May 11<sup>th</sup>, during which there will be a morning information session and afternoon session working in the Old Burying Ground.

## Adjourn

Member Huckabee made the motion to adjourn and Member Hedrick made the second. Vice-Chair Flowers took a vote that was unanimously approved.

Voting yea: Vice-Chair John Flowers, Bradley Cummins, Bradley Hedrick, Ian Huckabee, Tammy Hunsucker, and Marissa Morris

Vice-Chair Flowers declared the March 7, 2023 meeting adjourned.

Vice-Chair, John Flowers

Board Secretary, Laurel Anderson